

meaning and purpose, perhaps finding an author drawing power away from a title and meeting an audience in their social context.

Christopher Kane
Kent State University

ALLEN, Heather J., and Andrew R. REYNOLDS, eds. 2018. *Latin American Textualities: History, Materiality, and Digital Media*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press. Pp. 263. ISBN 9780816537716, Hardback \$65.00. ISBN 9780816539024, eBook \$65.00.

This book examines textual objects of very different sorts from Latin America, from costume books and publishers' catalogues to a book of photographs of ephemeral graffiti. An introduction, ten central essays, and an afterword describe the question of how to apply the latest approaches in textual studies to works in different media, from different times and places. These include digital approaches to bibliography and sound archives, a careful consideration of the origin of some of the clothing in Guaman Poma's famous manuscript, the use of postcards in Nicanor Parra's anti-poetry, and a smart new approach to the question of the bodies of Jorge Luis Borges's librarians of Babel. It is a book that engages the reader in the questions of textual studies, opens up a wide range of lesser known texts (as well as new approaches to famous ones), and relates the particular objects of study to larger debates in the field.

The introduction by Heather Allen and Andrew Reynolds sets out parameters for the book, interrogating the current state of textual studies on Latin American literature and culture. The editors state at the outset: "we argue that Latin American textual studies should not attempt to reconcile differences between referent and mode of production but rather account for and contextualize these systems of difference and set them apart as rich and essential sites of analysis for understanding historical and literary tensions in the region" (3). They explain that there has been something of a disconnect between textual studies in the English-speaking world and Latin America, and that the volume aims to bring to the attention of English-speaking readers the wealth of textual objects from Latin America in all their cultural complexity. They mention the legacies of colonialism and uneven development, the language barriers between Latin America and the Anglophone north (and in Latin America between speakers of indigenous languages and speakers of Spanish and Portuguese), and certain key concepts in Latin American cultural studies (such as Antonio

Cornejo Polar's work on cultural heterogeneity and — for all its limitations — Ángel Rama's ideas on the lettered city). They then discuss at length a famous document that is housed at the University of Texas, Sor Juana Inés de la Cruz's renewal of her vows, signed "with the blood of my own veins": they look at the rather arbitrary tags by the librarians who catalogued this document, while also noting the title of the folio, which includes the words "ink and blood on paper" (10). They then ask questions that will frame the following essays (none of them on Sor Juana): "How does the digital reference transform the text? How does it add to our understanding of the text? How does the folio's promotion help us read and understand the text's content differently from other versions" (10). Their central interest in the book is "to make clear how digital representation complicates textuality and brings about new ways of reading, differing points of textual accessibility, new approaches to the study of the materiality of the text, and conflicting institutional and editorial control of how the text is defined and consumed" (10–11).

The book is organized in three sections: "Reading History through Textuality", "Textual Artifacts and Materialities", and "Digital Textualities, Media and Editing". Each section ranges from colonial times to the present, with objects from different regions of Latin America; the idea of heterogeneity is a structuring principle of the book.

The first section, on reading history, starts with a fascinating essay by Catalina Andrango-Walker on the use of Quechua as a language of religious conversion, with particular attention to the *doctrinas* and dictionaries that were used by sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Spanish priests in the Andes, and how these show a variety of approaches to cultural, linguistic and religious difference. This is followed by an essay by Walther Naradiégue, "The Witch in the City", about a series of newspaper accounts of the burning alive of a woman accused of witchcraft in Bambamarca, Ecuador, in March 1888; the some twenty sources give quite different accounts of the event and reveal an anxiety about how to represent it. After this, an essay by José Enrique Navarro analyzes the catalogues of the Argentine publishing house Editorial Sudamericana, founded in Buenos Aires by Spanish exiles in 1939; the catalogues reveal the range of translated works, how they were marketed, how they responded to the demands of the reading public, and the gradual increase of the proportion of Argentine authors from the 1940s to the 1960s.

The section on textual artifacts and materialities opens with an illuminating essay by George Thomas on Guaman Poma de Ayala's use of European costume books in the hundreds of illustrations he included in his

famous *El primer nueva coronica y buen gobierno* from around 1615; Thomas speculates on what access Guaman Poma must have had to the library of a bishop in Cuzco, and the fact that it included costume books in French, German and Italian, as well as one in Latin from the Low Countries. This inquiry into an indigenous intellectual's engagement with early modern print culture, including a careful attention to questions of design in the baroque period, opens up a new line of inquiry to a much-studied text. This is followed by Sam Carter's examination of illustrated advertisements and articles from 1904 in the Buenos Aires magazine *Caras y Caretas* on the phonograph, as well as some poems by Eduardo González Lanuza that deal with the reproducibility of sound. After that comes Rebecca Kosick's study of the "postcard poetics" of Nicanor Parra's *Artefactos*, a 1972 work that consists of a box of loose postcards with poems, including visual poems, on the image side of the postcards. As in other works by Parra in the period, the texts involve satire and puns (both verbal and visual), setting out a new kind of "antipoetry" in his work. The final essay, by Silvia Kurlat Ares, interrogates Argentine science fiction, specifically graphic novels, and their engagement with the visual arts — Raquel Forner, Gyula Kosice, and Antonio Berni, but also book covers and magazine illustrations — with particular attention to two graphic novels that chart the travels of characters in real and imaginary cities.

The third section, on digital textualities, media, and editing, opens with Clayton McCarl's examination of the challenges facing an electronic edition of Antonio de León Pinelo's 1629 *Epítome de la biblioteca oriental i occidental, nautica y geografica*, an important but fraught early bibliography that includes inconsistencies and errors; McCarl is particularly interested in the problem of "how to manage its dual existence as discourse and as data" (179). He argues that an electronic edition of this work needs to account for its "linear" and its "relational" dimensions, noting both the works surveyed in it and those that are strikingly absent (Richard Hakluyt and Samuel Purchas), and usefully comparing this with the problems facing archivists of George Washington's papers; he suggests that an edition of the *Epítome* might contain both a linear representation of the text itself, with a relational representation of the same data — regularized and made complete — in the background (190). This is followed by Zac Zimmer's "Do Borges's Librarians Have Bodies?", which goes beyond mathematical and architectural analyses of Borges's library of Babel to show how Borges imagines the inhabitants of that library; Zimmer's analysis engages questions of hypertextuality and the posthuman, while also paying attention to the fact that "Bodies matter" (207). The section concludes with Edward

King's analysis of the graffiti art of Alberto Serrano, also known as Tito do Rio, and the how these ephemeral productions were captured in the 2015 graphic novel *Zé Ninguém*. King pays attention to how Serrano "tags" urban spaces in Rio de Janeiro (in a way quite unlike the librarians' tags to the book that contains Sor Juana's renewal of vows), arguing for the complex textuality of Serrano's images as they engage inhabitants of Rio neighborhoods but also people who buy the book (including me: highly recommended).

The book concludes with an afterword, "Texts, Coding and Translation", by Sara Castro-Klarén, that comments on the challenges represented by Latin American textuality, from Mayan glyphs and colonial manuscripts to the recent visual texts examined here. Castro-Klarén celebrates the excellent and varied scholarship in the volume, asking finally (with Zimmer) that we not forget the humans in the text, "the human consolation of finding meaning" (250). I join Castro-Klarén in commending this book to a readership not only of Latin Americanists but also of textual scholars who are studying other times and places; there is plenty here to stimulate new research and wonderful new writing.

Daniel Balderston
University of Pittsburgh

MURRAY, Joshua M., and ROSS K. TANGEDAL, eds. 2021. *Editing the Harlem Renaissance*. Clemson: Clemson University Press. Pp. 312. ISBN 9781949979558, Hardback \$120.00. ISBN 9781949979565, eBook \$120.00.

It seems impossible to talk about the period of unprecedented growth in Black American creative output, taking place a century ago and now commonly known as the Harlem Renaissance, without first mentioning how much it is talked about. The Harlem Renaissance, now also frequently called the New Negro Renaissance or New Negro Movement, was referred to by participants as both a "movement" and a "renaissance," and frequently as the "Negro renaissance," and many critics since have seen all of these words as misnomers in one way or another (MITCHELL 2010, 641). Considered broadly as a phenomenon of Black creativity concurrent with transatlantic cultural modernism, the period is without question the most discussed in Black literary, artistic, or cultural history. It has been the subject of histories and commentaries, analysis wide and narrow in scope, studies and "new studies", revisitations and recoveries. As Rachel Farebrother and Miriam Thaggett note in *The History of the Harlem Renaissance* (2021),