Elizabeth A. Babister. "Old French without Tears: The *Chanson de geste* in the Late Eighteenth Century." *Forum for Modern Language Studies,* 15, No. 1 (1978), pp. 26-34.

THE *BIBLIOTHEQUE UNIVERSELLE DES ROMANS,* published from 1775 to the Revolution, specialized in making known to its readers works of earlier centuries. The Marquis de Paulmy's personal library (eventually the nucleus of the Bibliothèque de l'Arsenal) provided the texts; the Comte de Tressan was one of the chief adapters of the old tales for contemporary readers. Tressan had become interested himself in the earlier texts in 1732 while working with Old French manuscripts at the Vatican Library.

That Tressan and other adapters had access to editions of the earlier works other than the popular versions put out by the *Bibliothèque bleue* is clear from their prefatorial remarks. The *Bibliothèque bleue* texts, on the other hand, remained widely read well into the nineteenth century. Prose versions had been frequently made of those *chansons de geste* in which Charlemagne appeared in unfavorable light; the *Quatre Fils Aymon* and *Huon de Bordeaux,* featuring the exploits of rebellious nobles, are examples. It was upon the prose versions of those works that Tressan and Paulmy drew for their updated texts, published in the *Bibliothèque universelle* in 1778.

In general, the "modernized" versions of the *Bibliothèque universelle are* an improvement upon the repetitiveness and lack of psychological motivation of the earlier texts. The language is that of the eighteenth century with some archaic expressions introduced for effect. Tressan, a correspondent of Voltaire, often pokes fun at religious orders, but his anticlericalism is not spiteful. *Galanterie* plays an important part in the adaptations of *Ogier le Danois* and *Huon de Bordeaux:* love is personified as Cupid, the language is artificial. Occasional references, such as the "lever de l'empereur," evoke the court of Louis XIV or XV, rather than that of Charlemagne. While the *Bibliothèque bleue* versions reflect the general medieval Christian ignorance of Islam, Tressan's version of *Ogier,* for example, shows the increased knowledge and tolerance of the eighteenth century in this matter.

Paulmy's adaptation of the *Quatre Fils Aymon* abridges the earlier text; he attenuates the religious element by omitting the miracles of Renaud, but he introduces neither detail nor comment of an anticlerical or licentious nature. Such detail does occur in another version of the same text in 1783. The author introduces digressions on economics, social welfare, the art of government; Renaud's visit to Rome reflects more the eighteenth-century tastes for ruins based on Winckelmann's excavations than a truly medieval attitude.

It is clear that, while Tressan's and similar adaptations of the content of the *chansons de geste* may have contributed to pre-Romantic interest in the Middle Ages, their authors took advantage of a fairly widespread curiosity in the past, updating their material with embroidery that would go down well with readers of the day, rather than attempting to foster scholarly study. The humble readers of the cheap *Bibliothèque bleue* editions were in fact in contact with versions of the tales that were very much closer to the original *chansons de geste.*

Babister's article attempts to provide the eighteenth-century background to

the interest of the nineteenth-century Romantics in the Middle Ages. To this end, comments on the introduction of anticlerical remarks and the use of *galanterie* in dealing with the theme of love provide a foundation for understanding the Romantic's vision of rebellion against authority and freedom in love as they thought these attitudes to be exemplified in medieval literature. After this article was written, a more detailed study of the series of editions that provided the Romantics with versions of medieval texts has been published[1] Because the article is somewhat limited in scope, the serious student of the "modern" version of the Middle Ages will be obliged to go much further in seeking answers to questions about pre-Romantic and Romantic understanding of medieval texts.

KATHLEEN REISH
Kalamazoo College

-o-oOo-o-

[1] *La Bibliothèque universelle des romans (Rédacteurs, textes, public).* Histoire des idées et critique littéraire, Vol. 158 (Genève: Droz, 1977).

Marcel Baïche. "Roncesvalles. Rencesvals." *Les Langues néo-latines* [Paris] (3e trimestre, 1978), pp. 71-81.

MARCEL BAÏCHE, by maintaining that the location of *Roncevaux* did not exist prior to the epic but rather was "invented" after the fact, makes a case for the reconsideration of the possible location of the events depicted in the *Chanson de Roland.* He points out that there is no archaeological proof of the existence of such a place. In fact, the name "Rencesvals" mentioned in Wace is not necessarily the same place but rather refers to a Catalan expression found in a passage of the Codex 39 of San Millán de la Cogolla, in Latin, referring to *Rozas Valles* — the wet valleys. He maintains that this would seem to indicate that the location of the action of the *Chanson de Roland* is not in the western part of the Pyrenees but rather in the east on a line from Aragon to Catalonia to Languedoc. Furthermore, there is the possibility that the actual date of the event was not August 15, 778, but perhaps September 8, 778 and that it took place during the expedition of Charlemagne to combat the Moors who were the attackers and not Basques as has been generally accepted. Moreover, Baïche suggests that it was hunger that sent the army of Charlemagne back, and that no traitor is involved to explain the attack.

Baïche does not attempt to draw any definite conclusions but rather prefers to suggest that further work concerning the location of the epic is needed, particularly in view of the information supplied in the Codex. He believes in the existence of an original version of the *Roland* in *langue d'oc,* a version which, if it were ever discovered, would obviate many of the traditional theories on the origin of the epic. In any case he would prefer to lay to rest the search for *Roncevaux* which has thus far proven to be fruitless.

JACQUELINE CROSS
Eastern Kentucky University

-o-oOo-o-

Rina Benmayor. "New Directions in the Study of Oral Literature." *La Corónica, 7,* No. 1 (Fall 1978), pp. 39-42.

THIS SHORT PIECE presents a loose outline of the major studies on epic and ballad literature which have appeared since Menéndez Pidal focused his attention on "rescuing oral literary traditions from the mystification that nineteenth-century Romantics gave to 'folk art'" (p. 39). Benmayor also singles out various approaches to the study of both the medieval and modern oral traditions and the questions raised by the particular analytical methods employed.

Brief mention is made of the Parry-Lord investigations into the Yugoslav epic and the theory of oral composition, frequency studies (particularly with regard to formulaic material), current trends in *romancero* scholarship (with semiotic analysis as a prime force), and cross-cultural comparative studies, such as Ruth Finnegan's *Oral Poetry,* which take up aspects of oral poetic composition such as the rôle of performance, style, transmission, distribution, audience, context, and the like.

Benmayor notes the particular debt of current research to the inquiries of Finnegan, who has vitiated the traditional restrictions placed upon the term "oral poetry," questioned the assumptions of the Parry-Lord school with respect to the differences between oral and written literature, and called for a less rigid definition of oral poetry to include considerations of social context.

For those unfamiliar with the key issues of contemporary research on Hispanic epic and balladry, this sketch provides a limited number of bibliographic references. Selected in a somewhat arbitrary manner, they serve to update, in a few cases, the recent and more comprehensive panorama afforded by Charles B. Faulhaber.[1]

JOHN S. GEARY
University of Colorado, Boulder

[1]Charles B. Faulhaber, "Neo-traditionalism., Formulism, Individualism, and Recent Studies on the Spanish Epic," *Romance Philology,* 30 (1976), 83-101.

-o-oOo-o-

Micheline de Combarieu. "La Violence dans le *Couronnement de Louis." Mélanges . . . Jeanne Lods.* Paris: École Normale Supérieure de Jeunes Filles, 1978, pp. 126-252.

IN THIS COMPREHENSIVE and carefully argued article, Mlle de Combarieu considers the extent to which violence informs the plot of the *Couronnement de Louis,* the types of violent conduct attributed to the various characters of the poem, and the way in which the poet attempts to reconcile the brutality of the plot with a Christian view of the world.

Violence pervades the *Couronnement:* indeed no other effective means seem to exist for the resolution of political conflict. The constant renewal of violent confrontation creates an overall impression of insecurity, as though violence and the disruption of daily life were the norm, interrupted only temporarily by brief periods of peace. The violence which Guillaume offers as a reply to the attacks of Louis's various enemies is incapable of establishing a lasting stability.

Although heroes and villains alike use violent means, they can be distinguished by both their motives and their tactics. The villains of the poem act out selfish motives in order to win power for themselves. They take the initiative in attacking Louis's authority and show themselves to be at times rash and arrogant in confronting Guillaume directly, at other times cunning and even treacherous in their attempts to avoid a fight.

Guillaume, on the other hand, turns to violence only when the Empire is in danger. He takes up his sword only under constraint, recognizing that the fighting life is a poor substitute for the peace and tranquillity to which he aspires: there is no question here of that glorying in physical violence which characterizes other epic poems.

By distinguishing between the ways in which violence is used by Guillaume on the one hand and his opponents on the other, the poet of the *Couronnement,* claims Mlle de Combarieu, reveals his own attitude to the problem of the admissibility of violence. While he condemns violent initiatives which disturb the life of the community, he condones the use of violent means for defensive purposes, to uphold the power of the beleaguered Empire. Violence is, for the poet, a *mal nécessaire.*

One might argue, though, that the reading of the *Couronnement* proposed here does not take into account the demands of the literary tradition. Although the poet presumably wrote from a Christian perspective, there is little evidence in the text that the question of violence constituted a pressing ethical problem either for him or his characters. Guillaume pays lip-service to the precepts of Christianity on this matter (v. 127), but overall the poet has been guided by the imperatives of the epic genre rather than by any concern for reconciling the violent conduct of his hero with Christian doctrine.

LYN PEMBERTON
University of Toronto

-o-oOo-o-

Raymond Eichmann. "Oral Composition: A Recapitulatory View of its Nature and Impact." *Neuphilologische Mitteilungen,* 8, No. 2 (1979), pp. 97-109.

THIS ARTICLE stresses the importance of the Parry-Lord concept of oral composition for the appreciation of the artistry of medieval narrative poetry. The author examines a number of studies which, following Jean Rychner's *La Chanson de geste: Essai sur l'art épique des jongleurs,*[1] provide the modern scholar with new directions based on an effort to establish norms which may enable him to deal more accurately with the specificity of the texts under consideration.

The fluidity and adaptability of form characteristic of the "formula" and "theme," the two essential components of oral style, are repeatedly emphasized since they reflect "an expression that is closer . . . to the actual reality of the Middle Ages than the book-oriented traditional approach" (p. 99). These qualities also enable criticism to distinguish between formulaic style and mere clichés as well as between the oral and the written. Eichmann, however, is careful to stress the problem of the coexistence, in the same work, of features pertaining to both modes of composition.

After briefly discussing Rychner's and Stephen G. Nichols's application of the theory to the *chanson de geste,*[2] the author, in his conclusion, advocates distinguishing between composition and transcription in order not to ignore the fact that the poems have come down to us in written form. At the same time, the oral features must be scientifically isolated and studied and the "oral presence" must be elucidated "beyond the mere affirmation of its existence" (p. 109).

This article displays a commendable concern for caution and "scientific" methodology but suffers from a lack of reference to studies published after 1970. Much has been done on the *chanson de geste,* for example, since the publication of Nichols's *Formulaic Diction* in 1961. It is indeed regrettable that no mention is made of the works of C. W. Aspland, Edward A. Heinemann, and Joseph J. Duggan, to name only three Old French scholars who have devoted their efforts to the question and significantly contributed to our understanding of the problems presented by the author.[3]

JEAN-PAUL CARTON
California Lutheran College

[1]Jean Rychner, *La Chanson de geste: Essai sur l'art épique des jongleurs* (Genève: Droz, 1955).

[2]Stephen G. Nichols, Jr., *Formulaic Diction and Thematic Composition in the "Chanson de Roland,"* University of North Carolina Studies in the Romance Languages and Literatures, No. 36 (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1961).

[3]See, for example, C. W. Aspland, *A Syntactical Study of Epic Formulas and Formulaic Expressions Containing the -ant Forms in Twelfth Century French Verse* (St. Lucia: University of Queensland Press, 1970; Edward A. Heinemann, "Composition stylisée et technique littéraire dans la *Chanson de Roland," Romania,* 94 (1973), pp. 1-28; Joseph J. Duggan, *The Song of Roland: Formulaic Style and Poetic Craft* (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1973).

-o-oOo-o-

Mary Hackett. "Le Manuscrit P de *Girart de Roussillon." Marche romane* [*Mélanges de philologie et de littératures romanes offerts à Jeanne Wathelet-Willem*] 28 (1978), pp. 207-218.

THE AUTHOR, responding to a recent criticism of her *La Langue de Girart de Roussillon* (Genève, 1970), proposes here to look more closely at MS P (Paris, B.N. f.fr. 2180), a translation of the original into Provençal, in order to assess its text as a version of the poem, to isolate characteristics of the scribe (or redactor), and to shed light on the qualities and defects of its text. For the sake of convenience, she choose as a *sondage* the episode relating the embassy of Pierre de Mont Rabei to Girart (vv. 3540-4525 of her *S.A.T.F*, edition), extant in both P and *L* (London, British Library, Harley 4334) as well as in the base MS *O* (Oxford, Canonici Misc. 63). After a brief summary of the manuscript filiation, which reveals the superiority of *O* over the other manuscripts, the author turns to an examination of the P variants from the perspectives of vocabulary, syntax, and style. Predictably the result confirms the editor's original conclusion that O, despite certain deficiencies, stands closer to the archetype in the tradition and that when P offers a clearer reading it is almost invariably a more banal one originating in a scribal effort to improve his text and make it more comprehensible to a Provençal audience, by eliminating obscurities in his model.[1]

RICHARD O'GORMAN
University of Iowa

[1]At the top of p. 213 of the article delete the third line in the textual quote and add the line numbers 4202-3 at the end of the second.

Leena Löfstedt. "À propos des formules de salutation au moyen âge." *Neuphilologische Mitteilungen, 18* (1978), pp. 193-215.

THIS SURVEY OF MEDIEVAL FORMULAS for greetings draws its evidence primarily from Old French narrative poetry and Middle French conversation manuals. The author identifies the chief formulas used in French greetings, traces their types to Latin antecedents, and compares them to pertinent analogues from Spain to Rumania and from Sicily to Sweden and Finland.

There are two major classes of greetings; liturgical and nonliturgical. The first class consists of formulas modeled upon Latin blessings: *Dieus vous saut* (from *Deus salvet),* a respectful salutation which wanes after the thirteenth century; *Dieus vous gard* (from *Deus custodiat),* generally less respectful and still current in the sixteenth century; *Dieus vous benie* (from *Deus vos benedicat); Dieus vous aït,* etc. Nonliturgical greetings fall into three categories: (1) the type introduced by *Dieu doint* or tacitly implying this phrase: e.g., God grant you health, honor, joy, a good day; (2) the "welcome" type: e.g., *bien soies venu, bien puissiez vos venir;* (3) the "how do you do" type: e.g., *que faites vous? comment a vos est?*

Although one of the sections of this article is entitled "Le Code médiéval de bien saluer et son développement, " Löfstedt's findings bring to light not so much a code as general principles or rules of thumb. One such principle makes the respect conveyed by a formula roughly proportionate to its length. Thus in order to increase the deferential connotation of a greeting, medieval speakers stretch the formula out by means of pleonasms and parallel phrases (isocola). Another principle is that it is best to answer a greeting by modifying the salutation, not by parroting it. To create elegant variation in answering a greeting one may repeat the salutation with inverted word order, or repeat it with elaborations *(renchérissement),* or yet substitute a different formula.

Löfstedt offers precise observations about the usage of certain formulas. For instance, the greeting *Dieus vos aït* is normally addressed to persons who are working or ailing. One prefers to use *Dieus vous benie* as a rejoinder rather than as an initial salutation, and this custom originates in monastic protocol. Other generalizations about usage remain, understandably, more tentative: one often says *à Dieu* upon leaving, but in some dialects it is also suitable on arriving, and the formula

bien veigniez, which is customarily a welcome for visitors, sometimes becomes a form of thanks. The greetings examined by Löfstedt are so spread out, both diachronically and geographically, that she wisely refrains from attempting a systematic classification of their semantic functions and interrelationships. Her deft wide-ranging investigation may well inspire several further inquiries with a more limited, synchronic orientation.

M.-A. BOSSY
Brown University

R. Pellen. «Codage des textes espagnols médiévaux en vue de leur analyse informatique: Une expérience (Le *Poème du Cid).* Quelques propositions.» *Revue des langues romanes,* 83 (1978), pp. 15-40.

DANS CET ARTICLE, M. R. Pellen se propose de jeter les bases d'une nouvelle méthodololologie permettant le dépouillement exhaustif par ordinateur de textes médiévaux espagnols tant littéraire qu'historiques ou linguistiques, en vue de créer un *Trésor de l'ancien espagnol.* Cet ambitieux programme a pour point de départ l'étude lexicographique du *Cantar de mio Cid,* que l'auteur a abordée de différentes manières rapidement évoquées (consitution d'un vocabulaire complet et d'un vocabulaire réduit du *Cantar).* Mais le désir de constituer un «Dictionnaire des Formes» retient tout particulièrement M. R. Pellen qui nous fait part de quelques-unes des difficultés qu'il rencontre dans sa tâche. La plus grave est celle que créent les homographes. Pour tenter de l'aplanir, il propose un système simple de marques diacritiques faciles à interpréter par le lecteur et commodes pour la perforation, qui lui permettent de classer en groupes et sous-groupes les différents types d'homographes. Les formes marquées se révélant grâce à ce système peu nombreuses, elles ne devraient pas entraver la constitution d'un dictionnaire complet des formes qui pourrait être étendu à d'autres documents. Pour résumer les intentions et les espoirs de l'auteur, citons cette phrase:

> Ainsi, à partir du *Poème du Cid* normalisé, du Vocabulaire et du «Dictionnaire des Formes», il devient possible d'analyser aussi bien la graphie du texte (caractère par caractère si l'on veut) que le style épique, pour accéder peut-être un jour à une typologie du discours, voir même à un embryon de connaissance sur le fonctionnement de la pensée à une époque donnée, dans un genre et dans les limites d'un système linguistique donné (p. 36).

Pour être apprécié à sa juste valeur, l'article de M. R. Pellen devrait être replacé dans l'ensemble des études qu'il a faites sur le *Cid.* Présenté tel qu'il est, il peut paraître à un lecteur non-averti trop allusif et insuffisamment illustré. Les deux exemples que nous donne l'auteur des catégories d'homographes qui doivent figurer dans son «Dictionnaire des Formes» ne font pas toute la lumière sur la manière dont celui-ci sera présenté et, surtout, l'absence de références aux vers nécessite le recours systématique au vocabulaire de R. Menéndez Pidal — nom que, contrairement à l'usage espagnol, M. R. Pellen réduit à Pidal — pour pouvoir prendre connaissance du contexte.

JACQUES HORRENT
Liège

-o-oOo-o-

Benedikt Reinert. "Die Anfänge des spanisch-arabischen Epos." *Saeculum,* 29 (1978), pp. 231-268.

THE EARLIEST ARABIC POETRY could provide no models for epic. The narrative form which Reinert elects to study is probably of Persian origin. This is the u*rjuza,* which has a varied rhyming pattern, a psalmodic type of verse structure of between sixteen and twenty-eight syllables, and a norm of five points of stress within the verse. The first appearance of the *urjuza* was in renderings into Arabic of *Kalila-wa-Dimna,* but what interests Reinert is the narrative poem concerning Ardashir, the founder of the Sasanian monarchy. It is curious that a pre-Islamic foreign culture should form the background of the first Arabic historical epic. In this connection Reinert states his definition of epic: material which (a) concerns one central person or group; *(b)* touches upon politics, nationality, society, ethics, or religion; (c) is narrative; *(d)* has discernible linkages; *(e)* has poetic heightening in meter, similes, epithets, etc. The Ardashir poem has few episodes, though one is a combat with a dragon; on the other hand there are in it many hagiographical details, anecdotes of the hero's personal life and knightly virtues, and astrological correlations.

Three poems of this *urjuza* type are known to have been written in Spain, and they are found in no other area of Muslim conquest. That of Gazal (ca. 850) survives only in synopsis. It dealt with the origins of Muslim lordship in Spain, with battles against the inhabitants, and with subsequent rulers *(umara').* Reinert explores yet again the possibility of Gazal's having an indigenous Spanish model for his epic, but can find only Isidore's well-known phrase of 557. Another speculation is afforded more space, in view of the statement by a chronicler that Gazal wrote his poem during a two-month stay in Santiago, allegedly on his return from abroad. From the thirteenth-century historian Ibn Dihya we learn that, at the time of Viking raids on Spain, Gazal traveled to see their king "on a great island" (844-5) which Reinert theorizes must have been Ireland. He had romantic adventures at court with a "queen" named N-w-d or T-w-d, who Reinert claims may be identified with an Irish-Scandinavian dowager princess Aud of the Penetrating Glance (attested as living in 845). The further hypothesis (conceding that the whole is not a fiction) is that Gazal (or his informant in Santiago) learned of Irish epics or sagas such as the *Táin* which were enjoying a new vogue in the Viking period (though there is evidence to suggest that scribes thought such material was not historical). Notions of sexual freedom among the pre-Christian chieftainesses of Irish saga may then have contaminated the story of Gazal's alleged mission, the basis of the latter story being his interest in Irish heroic literature as a model.

Tammam ibn Alqama (after 852) seems to have known Gazal's work and imitated it in his own *urjuza.* This had three parts and covered similar historical ground from Tariq's invasion to the end of 'Abdarrahman II's reign. Rulers *(wulat)* and the line of khalifas are celebrated; Reinert calls it a royal epic, written as it may have been from a didactic standpoint by a hereditary client of the Umayyads. We read that it may have had biographical anecdotes of participants in civil wars and of the Gothic princess Sara, daughter of Alamundo.

The third *urjuza* survives as a work of about 460 lines (ca. 934-40) by Ibn 'Ab-

drabbih. h is novel in that it concerns one ruler only, 'Abdarrahman III. The poem is a mosaic of hyperbolic imagery and idealized statements about the ruler's activities. The poet even praises 'Abdarrahman when he exhumes an enemy's remains in scorn; enemies are "dogs" and "swine"; Christian princes are "barbarians" *('ilj).* Only submissive subjects of the king are dignified with their names. The religious *imam* status of the king is stressed; his opponents are satanic or hypocritical. Ibn 'Abdrabbih has no penchant for the inclusion of heroic scenes: the heroic death of Ibn abi 'Abda (917) is merely recorded as decorous. Reinert considers Ibn 'Abdrabbih to be less in the Hispanic tradition of heroic poetry than in that of Iraq (he knew the work of Ibn al-Mu'tazz).

This article treats, of course, of the origins of Hispano-Arabic epic, not of possible links with Hispano-Romance epic, though these have been interestingly put forward recently by Marcus Marín (1971), by Monroe (1971) and by Galmés de Fuentes (1978). Since only one text survives of the three it is difficult to make any further advances, it would seem. Reinert is above all interested in traditions traceable through Arabic metrics, with a nod towards the comparability of Gazal's basically quatrain form and the *cuaderna vía* (hitherto usually thought to have originated beyond the Pyrenees) of the *Poema de Fernán González.* The old surmise of Staiger *(Festschrift Gauchat,* 1926) that the *Cantar de los Siete Infantes de Salas* owes much to Arabic heroic poetry does not seem consequential; the attitudes towards Rodrigo in the Valencia episodes of the *Poema de mio Cid* and towards Fernán González in the Anonymous of Arlanza's poem do, however, remind the reader of the Arabic epic "ruler as *imam. "*

ALAN SOONS
St. Catherine's College, Oxford

-o-oOo-o-

David J. A. Ross. "Not Worth A Penny." *Reading Mediaeval Studies,* 4 (1978), pp. 69-90.

THIS STIMULATING ARTICLE presents a survey of formulas containing monetary units found in certain medieval French epics, particularly *Raoul de Cambrai* and the *Couronnement de Louis.* Professor Ross states that he proposes to examine only formulas conveying "derisory or minimal value" as they occur at the rhyme. However, he places more emphasis on an enumeration of random examples than on a thorough examination of the formulas as they function in the works he cites. Further, he includes considerable numismatic and socio-historical data which, while important, is not always germane to his study of epic formulas. As he points out, this aspect of the question has been treated by Urban T. Holmes, Jr.[1] The article concludes with three pages of illustrations of the coins discussed.

Basically this study does little more than alert epic scholars to the presence of references to coins in the *chansons de geste,* a task begun by Professor Holmes in

[1]Urban T. Holmes, Jr. "Coins of Old French Literature," *Speculum,* 31 (1956), pp. 316-20, and "Coins of Little Value in Old French Literature," *Mediaeval Studies,* 19 (1957), pp. 123-128.

the articles cited. There is insufficent statistical information of a normative nature. By way of illustration, if one takes the single largest category mentioned, formulas containing a reference to the *denier,* one finds that Professor Ross mentions there are ninety-eight examples in fourteen works, without defining the formulas in question or identifying the works or verse numbers concerned for more than ninety of the cases. The tantalized reader would "give a pretty penny" to be able to locate his examples without rereading the corpus. The same is true for most of the other coins discussed, the *obole, maille, pite, parisis,* etc. Interested scholars will have to dig out most of this treasure themselves.

STEVEN M. TAYLOR
Marquette University

the articles cited. There is insufficent statistical information of a normative nature. By way of illustration, if one takes the single largest category mentioned, formulas containing a reference to the *denier,* one finds that Professor Ross mentions there are ninety-eight examples in fourteen works, without defining the formulas in question or identifying the works or verse numbers concerned for more than ninety of the cases. The tantalized reader would "give a pretty penny" to be able to locate his examples without rereading the corpus. The same is true for most of the other coins discussed, the *obole, maille, pite, parisis,* etc. Interested scholars will have to dig out most of this treasure themselves.

STEVEN M. TAYLOR
Marquette University

Colin Smith and Roger M. Walker. "Did the Infantes de Carrión Intend to Kill the Cid's Daughters?" *Bulletin of Hispanic Studies,* 56, No. 1 (1979), pp. 1-10.

PROFESSORS SMITH AND WALKER use the medieval dialectic of *sic et non* in an attempt to resolve the question stated in the title. The latter author, arguing primarily from the episode of Corpes itself, holds that the Infantes did intend to kill Doña Elvira and Doña Sol the girls expected to die ("cortandos las cabeças," v. 2727); the fatidic phrase "por muertes las dexaron" is thrice repeated (vv. 2748, 2752, 2755); and Félez Muñoz, who "falló sus primas amorteçidas" (v. 2777), stresses several times his fear that the Infantes will return to complete their task. Professor Smith counters that neither before the episode, when the Infantes are planning their vengeance, nor afterwards, when the Cid seeks justice from the king, is there any talk of murder. Both the Infantes and the Cid think solely in terms of avenging their wounded honor.

This dichotomy is in itself significant, but neither Professor Smith nor Professor Walker has noticed it. It suggests that they have started a false hare. Neither of them can show any compelling literary reason — in terms of the structure or meaning of the poem — in favor of his argument. Professor Smith is right in thinking that the episode should be viewed in relation to the theme of honor but wrong in denying the importance of the multiple references to death in it. I would suggest that the audience is meant to perceive the connections between death and dishonor, in fact to formulate a series of linked oppositions between, e.g., death, dishonor, lawless revenge, the Infantes and their brutal instruments of torture, the wilderness ("fieras bestias") on the one hand; and on the other life, honor, justice, the delicacy of the Cid's daughters' garments, and civilization. There is a finely crafted counterpoint ranging from the minutest details of language and imagery to the broadest thematic and structural patterns, a counterpoint which culminates in the opposition between the *afrenta de Corpes* and the *cortes de Toledo.* To interpret either the one or the other in terms of psychological realism or contemporary legal practice is to miss much of the force of the poem.

CHARLES B. FAULHABER
University of California, Berkeley

-o-oOo-o-

Colin Smith. "Further French Analogues and Sources for the *Poema de mio Cid." La Corónica,* 6 (1977), pp. 14-21.

PROFESSOR SMITH ADDS TO THE NUMBER of borrowings and reminiscences that he has detected in OFr epic for important passages of the PMC. His earlier findings appeared in chapter six of his *Estudios cidianos.*[1]

Smith concentrates now on Jimena's prayer, whose debt to French influence has long been acknowledged in general terms.[2] He cites specific sources for the Longinus passage *(Fierabras* and *Parise la duchesse)* and for the reference to Christ's stay on earth *(Fierabras).* The mention of the Magi was prompted by a similar mention in either *Parise* or a lost twelfth-century epic version of B*erte aus grans piés,* although the particular form of the names, together with details of the gifts, was probably derived from an interpolation in Petrus Comestor's *Historia scholastica* (ca. 1178). The analysis of the Longinus passage also reveals details of the compositional technique of the Castilian poet. Rather than borrowing slavishly, he was able to combine two or more sources, adding reminiscences and material of his own invention, in order to produce an original text.

Further evidence — identity of narrative motifs, of formulas of address to the audience, etc. — is adduced for the poet's acquaintance with *Parise.* Parallels of a similar nature are drawn between lines in the PMC and in *Raoul de Cambrai,* of which the most striking is Gueri's farewell to his baby nephew, suggesting the Cid's leave-taking of his daughters.

Several of Smith's parallels are convincing, although others, in isolation, would be considered rather dubious (e.g., *PMC.* v. 1049 and *Raoul,* v. 385). None is so startling as the possible relation between the opening of the PMC and passages of the *Chevalerie Ogier,*[3] but they generally lend weight to the arguments of the earlier study. Taking them in conjunction with M. Herslund's important article of 1974,[4] criticism of PMC must take full account of the influence of the language of OFr epic and romance, hitherto regarded as merely superficial. What will be a subject of debate is how the poet acquired his knowledge of French epic, whether by reading manuscripts or by listening to the composition and performance of oral poems. Smith has no doubt that the former was the case.

One further conclusion is implicit in the two articles. At once a masterpiece and a pioneering work, the PMC was consciously composed as a national epic under the stimulus of the OFr tradition. This hypothesis discounts almost com-

[1] Colin Smith, *Estudios cidianos* (Madrid: Cupsa Editorial, 1977), pp. 107-59.

[2]Criticism must now, however, take account of Peter E. Russell's important "La Oración de Doña Jimena (PMC, vv. 325-367)," in his *Temas de "La Celestina" y otros estudios" (*Barcelona: Ariel, 1978), pp. 113-58.

[3]Smith, *Estudios cidianos,* pp. 146-49.

[4]M. Herslund, "Le *Cantar de Mio Cid et* la chanson de geste," *Revue romane, 9 (1*974), pp. 69-121.

pletely a preexisting Castilian epic, although Smith admits its possible existence.[1] Even if one agrees with him concerning the learned composition of the poem, it is hard to believe that the fully developed language of Castilian epic came into being with the PMC, as a result of contact with, and imitation of, a variety of French heroic poems. Even if its nature is impossibly difficult to determine, the contribution of a native tradition cannot simply be ignored.

GEOFFREY WEST
University of Essex

[1] Smith, *Estudios cidianos,* p. 128.

Gaston Tuaillon. "L'Emploi de la déclinaison dans la *Prise d'Orange," Travaux de linguistique et de littérature* [Strasbourg], 16, No. 1 (1979), pp. 501-518.

PUISQUE LA *PRISE D'ORANGE* CONTIENT un grand nombre d'erreurs de déclinaison, M. Tuaillon l'a choisie pour en examiner un large échantillon (390 vers dans les laisses 3, 6, 9, 14, 26, 27 et 30) afin de découvrir si ces négligences grammaticales ont des conséquences pour la transmission du sens.

Les fautes sont classées selon leur contexte syntaxique (apposition ou qualification du sujet, attribut du sujet, sujet) et ensuite analysées. Après examen, l'auteur conclut que de toutes ces fautes aucune n'est vraiment grave, car la construction de la phrase impose toujours le bon substantif comme sujet.

Deux lieux privilégiés, la fin du vers et le nom propre de quatre personnages masculins, sont ensuite examinés dans la totalité de la geste. Le résultat de cet examen est sensiblement le même que celui de l'analyse des 390 vers cités dans le premier paragraphe. Ici aussi les erreurs ne sont, pour la plupart, que des fautes «d'accord» c'est-à-dire des négligences causées par la redondance des marques flexionnelles. Dans les autres cas, ces erreurs, neutralisées soit par des traits grammaticaux, soit par le contexte, imposent toujours la fonction de sujet au substantif correct. On ne trouve que cinq amphibologies (des verbes transitifs entourés de deux substantifs) dans toutes ces fautes. On peut aussi remarquer que l'*s* flexionnel est plus fragile au singulier qu'au pluriel et que la perte de la déclinaison ne peut pas s'expliquer par la phonétique.

Si l'on enlevait, dit M. Tuaillon, les marques flexionnelles de la geste, il en résulterait tout au plus des vers «faux», car cela ne gênerait pas beaucoup la transmission du sens. On ne peut, ajoute-t-il, généraliser après l'analyse d'un texte unique et dire que l'ancien français abandonne la déclinaison parce qu'elle ne sert plus à rien. Toutefois, on peut remarquer que la flexion ne devait pas garder une grande vitalité à l'époque puisque l'auteur ne risque jamais une phrase dont le sens aurait reposé uniquement sur les marques flexionnelles. On ne peut non plus imputer les erreurs à la désinvolture pure et simple du scribe, car les fautes sont plus nombreuses dans les contextes marqués par d'autres traits grammaticaux que

la flexion, et elles sont plus fréquentes au singulier qu'au pluriel. Il faut aussi noter que le cas sujet supporte 95% des fautes et que dans les quelques erreurs du cas-régime il se trouve des mots comme «filz» qui ont retenu leur forme unique dans la langue actuelle. Enfin, les fautes graves, celles de la grammaire amphibologique, apparaissent toujours dans des propositions qui suivent l'ordre «sujet + verbe + complément.» Ces différences s'inscrivent donc dans l'évolution générale de la langue.

Cet article clair et concis s'inscrit dans la lignée des études sur l'emploi de la déclinaison à deux cas, qu'il faudrait peut-être rappeler ici: MM. Laubscher, *The Syntactical Causes of Case Reduction in Old French,* Eliott Monograph 7 (1921); Guiraud, «L'Expression du virtuel dans le *Roland* d'Oxford,» *Romania,* 83 (1962); Spence, «Existait-il en ancien français une opposition actuel / virtuel?» *Revue de Linguistique romane,* 30 (1966); et B. Woledge, «La Déclinaison des substantifs dans la *Chanson de Roland,* recherches mécanographiques,» *Romania,* 88 (1967) et 90 (1969). M. Tuaillon continue l'analyse de textes littéraires et apporte des informations additionnelles aux conclusions du dernier article de M. Woledge. La technique d'analyse employée par l'auteur est intéressante et mérite d'être étudiée. Il serait utile de voir ce genre de travail répété sur des textes entiers plutôt que sur des échantillons.

JOSETTE BRITTE-ASHFORD
Brigham Young University

Ray Whelan. "Charlemagne et l'élément gallican dans la *Chanson de Roland." Chimères, 11* (1977), pp. 28-39.

EVEN AMONG THE ARDENT ADVOCATES of the "pure" artistry of the *Chanson de Roland,* there is general agreement about the didactic nature of the poem. However, given the poem's emphasis on conveying a message, there remains major disagreement about how that message is to be interpreted. Ray Whelan evaluates the argument that the *Chanson de Roland* emphasizes "l'esprit gallican" and asserts the values of secular, nationalistic culture over the Church.

Whelan bases his arguments on the assumption that the poem "servait . . . de catéchisme à un peuple illettré dans les deux domaines de la religion et de la culture" (p. 28). He first reviews the historical confrontations between king and pope, secular power and ecclesiastical authority, and then he notes the potential influence of the conflict between Henri IV and Gregory VII, which resulted in the king's submission at Canossa in 1077. He contends that even among clerics there was a spirit of nationalism that would have favored the case of secular authority during the conflict between Church and state in the eleventh and twelfth centuries.

Whelan then turns to the text of the *Chanson de Roland* and attempts to determine the poet's stance on the problems of temporal authority. He suggests that "la *Chanson de Roland* est effectivement un hymne à la gloire de Dieu, de Charlemagne et de Roland" (p. 31). He shows that the characterization of Charlemagne merges the functions of Church and state in the emperor's four rôles: mis-

sionary, messenger of God, intermediary between God and man, and father of his people. He notes that in the first rôle Charlemagne acquires sovereignty in other kingdoms only in the service of God, not for his own glory. As a messenger, Charlemagne, and not the pope, is entrusted to convey God's intentions to men. Charlemagne's rôle as intermediary is filled with Biblical parallels; like the Virgin and Daniel, the emperor is granted visions which help to establish for him a prophetic rôle. In other Biblical parallels, most specifically, with Abraham, Moses, and Joshua, Charlemagne is portrayed as a good "father" to his people, assuming some of the paternal duties often associated with the papacy.

Whelan's conclusion is that "le poète prend le parti des rois" (p. 37) but that he is nonetheless committed to a strong religious spirit. Whelan points out that religious themes are pervasive, even though the poet has grave reservations about the temporal powers of the pope.

Whelan's analysis is relatively thorough, and he takes due note of the well-recognized elements of the "Christian King" in the characterization of Charlemagne. His conclusions are a healthy antidote to some of the arguments that the poem is entirely secular in its theme and intent. Given the ethical and religious *milieu* from which the poem derives, it would be hard for it to employ a concept of kingship other than that based on Christian notions. Yet, in Whelan's attempt to reassert the value of Christianity in the political *ethos* of the *Chanson de Roland*, it is possible to lose sight of the remarkable departures from traditional lines of religious authority that the poem advocates. While some of Whelan's arguments have been staples of *Roland* criticism for some time, he combines them into a balanced and reasonable view of the poet's attitude toward the relationships between Church and state.

ROBERT L. KINDRICK
Western Illinois University