

The Trial of Ganelon in the Rhymed *Chanson de Roland*

Joseph J. Duggan

University of California, Berkeley

In five aspects the episode of Ganelon's trial differs radically from the assonanced version of the *Chanson de Roland* to the rhymed versions: the location of the trial, the judgment of men, the judicial combat, the choice of Ganelon's punishment, and the identity of characters. The rhymed text taken as the basis of the comparison is the critical text of Châteauroux-Venice 7. This is a recomposition rather than a retouching of the text in assonance and represents a new reception of the legend, probably in the last quarter of the twelfth century.

This analysis focuses on five aspects in which the episode of Ganelon's trial differs between the rhymed versions and the assonanced version of the *Chanson de Roland*: the geographical location of the trial; the judgment of men; the judicial combat; the choice of Ganelon's punishment; and the identity of the characters who play important roles in the episode. I conclude with some remarks on the significance of these differences in the literary tradition of the *Chanson de Roland*.

In my contribution at the sixteenth international congress of the Société Rencesvals held at Granada in 2003 ("La France des Plantagenêts"), I stressed the displacement in the rhymed versions of the return itinerary of Charlemagne's army toward localities situated in the west of France. I further suggested the probability that the geographical change of emphasis in those versions, whose source was composed in the last quarter of the twelfth century, was associated with the interests of the Plantagenet dynasty and, in particular, of Richard I "Lion-Heart" of England, duke of Aquitaine from 1177 until his death in 1199.¹ As in that article, my primary reference here will be to the complete rhymed version found in the critical text of CV7 (*La Chanson de Roland; The Song of Roland*, part 3), which contains almost 8,400 lines, more than twice the length of the Oxford version.

Among the principal differences between the rhymed versions and the Oxford version are the configuration and details of the scenes that follow the episode of Baligant (see the appendix).² In C, V7, P, T,

¹ Jules Horrent noted the prevalence of elements from the west of France and concluded: "Tout se passe comme si le jeune prestige anglo-angevin avait attiré la vieille chanson royale" (*La Chanson de Roland dans les littératures française et espagnole*, p. 362).

² The most accessible guide to the differences among the versions is Karen Akiyama's "Concordance of Laisses" in vol. 1, pp. 39-124, of *La Chanson de Roland; The Song of Roland*, which presents the various texts synoptically, *laisse* by *laisse*. All references to texts of the *Chanson de Roland* (*CdR*) are to this edition.

and L, after Charlemagne has defeated the emir and found Roland's body, two brief episodes, absent from O and V4, facilitate the recovery of the Christians' bodies. These are the miracle in which St. Martin makes hawthorn bushes grow from the corpses of the Saracens³ and the further miracle in which God has hazel trees⁴ grow near the battlefield, from which the French construct biers for their dead. After this point V4 joins the five rhymed texts to recount the army's stop at Sorde, then Ganelon's escape and the long episode of Aude, which in the rhymed versions takes place not at Aix-la-Chapelle but at Blaye (Duggan, "L'épisode d'Aude").

In the rhymed versions, the trial of Ganelon does not take place at Aix either, but rather at Laon, one of the principal cities of the Carolingian monarchs. The reason for this displacement is not explained. If one admits the influence of Richard "Lion-Heart" or his vassals, however, the desire to move the trial out of the Empire would be understandable, as the Holy Roman Emperor Henry VI was one of Richard's greatest enemies. On his return journey from the Third Crusade, Richard was captured while traveling through Austria on December 11, 1192. Duke Leopold of Austria gave him over into Henry's custody, and he was only released in March of 1194 in return for payment of a large ransom and an oath to hold England as a fief of the Empire, later repudiated. Recent opinions on the dating of the source of the rhymed *Roland* versions vary from between 1180 and 1195 (Palumbo, "Per la datazione") to between 1180 and the early thirteenth century (*CdR*, vol. 2, p. 54). If indeed the displacement of the trial scene from Aix to Laon was motivated by Richard's hostility toward the Hohenstaufen emperor, the source of the rhymed *Roland* versions was likely composed after 1192.

Turning now to the second aspect, the trial of Ganelon in the rhymed texts is much longer than in Oxford, where it occupies 240 lines in 20 *laissez* (*laissez* 270-89). In the critical text of CV7, the episode has grown to almost three times that length, 760 lines in 50 *laissez* (*laissez* 394-443).

In V4, C, and V7, the trial scene opens when Otoier of Boulogne calls upon Ganelon to explain his conduct or to defend it in combat,⁵ which immediately motivates Gondelboef, king of Frisia, to challenge Ganelon to battle if he denies having damaged his lord by his actions (*laisse* 396). The procedure differs from what is found in Oxford, where Ganelon's defense is offered in response to Charlemagne's formal accusation (O, ll. 3750-56). In Oxford the charge is that Ganelon betrayed the Twelve Peers in exchange for wealth (O, l. 3756). There Ganelon admits having caused Roland's death, but denies that his action was treasonous, alleging instead that Roland caused him economic harm (O, l. 3758) and endangered his life by nominating him as ambassador to Marsile out of hatred (O, ll. 3771-72). In CV7, Ganelon denies having acquired any wealth from his actions, a defense that Gondelboef refutes by revealing that a Persian, captured from

³ In T, St. Fermin is the miracle-worker; in L, God performs the miracle without the intervention of a saint.

⁴ C has *tonbes* instead of *coudres*, probably a scribal misunderstanding.

⁵ This role is assigned to *Archöer* (?) in P and to *Naimes* in L; a material lacuna results in the scene lacking in T. That Otoier appeared here in the source of the rhymed texts is clear from his presence in both V4 and CV7.

Marsile's army, has told the French that Ganelon sold them out to the Saracens.⁶ Neither Otoier of Boulogne nor Gondelboef of Frisia is mentioned in Oxford or, before this scene, in the rhymed versions, and there is no reference elsewhere in the text to the Persian captive.

Ganelon is armed for his judicial combat, but, pretending to test his horse, gallops off through the city gate, to the delight of Gondelboef: "ce fu la joie Gondebof le Frison" (CV7, l. 7710, reading of V7). This line is absent from P, which only has Gondelboef express his anger (P, l. 6247). It is present, however, in V7, V4 and T, and is thus quite likely to have been in the source of the rhymed texts.⁷ The line is only appropriate if Ganelon's abrupt departure signals Gondelboef's victory, which is technically correct since Ganelon has fled the locus of battle. Gondelboef pursues the fugitive and begins to engage him in combat when the arrival of other French barons facilitates Ganelon's capture.

The struggle between Ganelon and Gondelboef increases suspense, but it may also have been motivated by dissatisfaction with the framework of the judicial combat that is recounted in the assonanced tradition, in which Ganelon entirely avoids putting himself in physical jeopardy by having Pinabel fight on his behalf. In the rhymed texts, Ganelon's trial contains not one duel, as in the Oxford version, but three, two of which involve Ganelon himself. The first occurs after Ganelon's escape at Sorde (CV7, l. 6367), when Otes, after initially abandoning the chase, succeeds in finding Ganelon sleeping in a tree and subsequently does battle with him, with the result that both knights are unhorsed and strike each other with their swords (CV7, *laissez* 340-42). This struggle ends when Otes's two companions, Sanson and Ysoré, arrive and take Ganelon prisoner.⁸ The second duel is aborted when Ganelon flees from Gondelboef. The third is, of course, the duel between Pinabel and Thierry, an element so well known in the tradition that to eliminate it would likely not have been accepted by medieval audiences.

After Gondelboef leads the fugitive back to the emperor, Charles commands that Ganelon be judged (CV7, l. 7794). The emperor appoints a jury of high nobles to decide the traitor's fate. In CV7 (*laisse* 408), the judges named are ten in number: Girart, Ogier, Naimes, Odon, Basin, Garnier, Gaiffier of Lombardy, Richard of Normandy, Geoffrey of Anjou, and Salemon, a group to which the Cambridge text adds Bos l'Alemant and Otes le Baivier.⁹ A squire then announces that Pinabel and four hundred of Ganelon's kin are about to arrive, including his nephew Hervé de Lion. Ganelon's defense before the jury is that he did not intend to flee from Gondelboef but was merely testing his horse. Pinabel repeats Ganelon's claim and

⁶ The Persian is not mentioned in V4 or L.

⁷ The form only varies slightly: V4, l. 5550 reads "ce fu la joie Gondelboes le Frixon" and T, l. 5082 "ce fut la joie Godebeuf, au Frison." C has Gondelboef declare victory outright: "'J'ai conquis lo felon'" (C, l. 7524).

⁸ In the Paris and Cambridge versions, the combat between Otes and Ganelon is expanded, by eight *laissez* in P, by seven in T. The texts of V4, C, V7, and L accord here in their *laisse* structure, retaining the shorter version of the battle.

⁹ Jurors twelve in number are generally found in twelfth-century legal proceedings in England and Normandy. See Joüon des Longrais ("La preuve en Angleterre," pp. 207-11).

declares that he will defend his kinsman against the charge of having betrayed Charles (CV7, ll. 7866-69, 7892-96). Ogier, Richier d'Aspremont, and Girart de Vienne all offer to take up this challenge, but the young Thierry, son of Geoffrey of Anjou, is given precedence as a vassal of Roland. In Oxford Thierry is Roland's kinsman (O, l. 3826: "par anceisurs dei jo tel plait tenir") and a knight rather than Roland's vassal and squire (CV7, ll. 7913, 7920),¹⁰ and he dissents from the barons' decision that Charlemagne and Ganelon should be reconciled without the traitor undergoing punishment. The rhymed texts, in which the judgment of the high barons is vitiated by Thierry's challenge, thus differ radically from Oxford in legal procedure and process.

Furthermore Thierry is not, as in Oxford, the brother of Geoffrey of Anjou (O, l. 3806), but Geoffrey's son (CV7, l. 7948). In the rhymed texts (CV7, l. 126), as in Oxford (O, ll. 106, 3093), Geoffrey of Anjou is Charlemagne's standard-bearer. He is also one of the four leaders whom Charles dispatches to Vienne to fetch Aude to Blaye, an episode lacking in Oxford. On this embassy, he is accompanied by Girart de Blois, Gui de Saint Omer, and the obscure Nevelon, so two of Geoffrey's three companions also come from the west of France. When the cortege nears Blaye, Geoffrey sends messengers ahead to alert Charles to its approach (CV7, ll. 6955-60). Finally, Geoffrey serves in the group of men appointed to judge Ganelon's case (CV7, l. 7833). Once he is called "Jofroi l'amoros" (CV7, l. 6000), probably with the meaning "Geoffrey the beloved." Richard "Lion-Heart" was the grandson of Geoffrey of Anjou's namesake, Geoffrey V, called Plantagenet, count of Anjou and husband of Matilda, the daughter of Henry I of England. On Geoffrey V, reviled in England but admired in Anjou long after his death, see Bradbury, "Geoffrey V."

This is by no means the only change in the characters who, in the rhymed *Chanson de Roland*, play leading roles in the trial scene.

The historical Geoffrey V Plantagenet was the great-grandson of Richard I of Normandy (died 996), the prototype of the Richard of Normandy who plays a prominent role in the chansons de geste (Bédier, "Richard"). Richard makes brief appearances in the assonanced version, where he figures among Charlemagne's chief counselors, leads the Normans in the Episode of Baligant where they are the fifth contingent in the Christian army, and is killed by the Saracen emir himself (O, l. 3470; V4, l. 3639). In the rhymed texts, Richard leads the second contingent. As in Oxford, he is killed off in CV7 (l. 5704), but he is spared in P and T,¹¹ and L lacks the entire Episode of Baligant. These differences among the rhymed versions make it difficult to determine what happened to Richard in their source. In C, V7, P, T, and L, however, Richard reappears later, called upon to guard Ganelon after Roland's body is found on the battlefield (CV7, ll. 6142-44). Charlemagne offers to marry Aude to Richard of Normandy rather than, as in Oxford, to his own son Louis. Richard relays to the army Charles's desire to return to France (CV7, l. 7525)

¹⁰ In CV7, l. 7907, Thierry contrasts his status with that of Pinabel: "Je sui vaslez, vos estes chivalier."

¹¹ See P, l. 4242: "Richars le vit, li sires des Normans," and T, ll. 3119-20, where Richard metamorphoses into "Richier de Mez," "un chevalier puissant, / que li Normant ravoient a garant."

and in the trial of Ganelon transmits Charles's indictment to the accused (CV7, l. 7659¹²). He figures among the magnates assigned to judge Ganelon (CV7, l. 7832) and is one of the seven men who regulate the field of battle for the duel between Thierry and Pinabel (CV7, l. 8031), whereas in Oxford Ogier of Denmark alone supervises the duel (O, l. 3856).

Thus while both Geoffrey of Anjou and Richard of Normandy figure in the Oxford version, the trial scene in the rhymed texts presents both of these characters in greatly enhanced roles. The historical prototypes of both of these men were ancestors of Richard "Lion-Heart," who himself may have been named after the first Richard of Normandy.

Among the preliminaries to the judicial combat between Thierry and Pinabel in the rhymed texts is the scene in which, after the combatants have made monetary offerings and are armed, Salomon de Bretagne has them swear on relics to the truth of their respective positions. Pinabel then attempts to kiss the relics, but it does not please God to allow his lips to touch them (CV7, ll. 8061-62; V4 lacks this detail). This element of foreboding is absent from Oxford, in which, before the combatants are armed, they confess their sins, hear mass, and make offerings, but in which no oaths are mentioned (O, ll. 3858-61). During the combat, Pinabel tries to dissuade Thierry by offering him his fiefs of Sorence and Besançon as well as the hand of his daughter in marriage (CV7, ll. 8083-86). After Pinabel's defeat his body is hung on a gibbet in the rhymed texts (CV7, l. 8193), but although Pinabel gives hostages before the battle, these are not executed and in fact disappear from the narrative.¹³ This eliminates the scene of the hanging of Pinabel's thirty hostages in Oxford (ll. 3947-59) that has attracted much attention from critics and that late twelfth-century audiences might have found puzzling.¹⁴ The fate of Bramimonde (O, laisse 290) is mentioned earlier in the rhymed texts (CV7, ll. 5990-94; V4, ll. 3835-37; T, l. 3387; PL omit). With the exception of C and V7, no version of the *Chanson de Roland* shares its final laisse with another.

A further procedural addition to the rhymed texts is the deliberation over how to punish Ganelon. The barons offer suggestions in turn (CV7, laisses 436-441): Girart de Vienne that Ganelon have a limb cut off each night, Bove that he be burned alive, Salemon that he be devoured by beasts, Ogier that he be forced to die of thirst, Naimes that he be skinned alive and licked to death by goats. Finally Otoier, lord of Boulogne and Amiens, proposes that Ganelon's limbs be tied to the tails of four horses that would then tear him apart, which Charlemagne accepts.¹⁵ The sentence is executed, to the shame of Ganelon's kin (CV7, laisse 443), outside the walls of Laon. Otoier is yet another figure from the west of France who is given prominence.

¹² The character who does this in V4 is named *Giraldo*, an error for *Riçardo*, to whom the epithet *li Normant* is nonetheless assigned.

¹³ Note, however, that CV7, l. 2363, P, l. 885, and L, l. 279 (cp. T, l. 648) state that some of Ganelon's relatives ("de ses apartenanz") died for his treachery, echoing O, l. 1410 and V4, l. 1322. The rhymed texts do not present this outcome of in the trial scene.

¹⁴ See Duggan, "El juicio de Ganelón," for the hypothesis that the hostages are executed because Ganelon has caused the death of the emperor's son, Roland.

¹⁵ In L, this suggestion comes from Naimes.

Although not mentioned previously, Otoier plays in the trial scene a capital role. In addition to proposing the method by which Ganelon dies, he is the one who asks that Ganelon be made to defend himself in speech or combat and is appointed as one of the seven barons to supervise the field of battle.

That the trial scene in the rhymed versions is not just a superficial conversion of the assonanced text into *laissez* that are held together by a unity of line-final vowel and consonant sounds is obvious. Rather, the episode is entirely rewritten into a narrative that differs substantially from what is found in Oxford. Except for the outcome that Ganelon is found guilty through a judicial combat between Thierry and Pinabel and is executed by being torn apart by horses, all other aspects of the trial depart from Oxford: the location, the secondary characters, the legal procedure, and the deliberation on how to execute the traitor.

In the rhymed versions, the trial scene and the recital of possible ways in which Ganelon might be executed share a characteristic with the lengthy episode of Aude and its extensive dream sequence, in that they draw out the tale and enhance its dramatic effects and poignancy in comparison with the more austere narrative of the Oxford version. In the rhymed texts, as in Oxford, the corpses of the French who died at Roncevaux are brought back into France, but this is accomplished through the miracles of the hawthorn bushes and the hazel trees. Ganelon escapes and is captured at Sorde, but escapes again at Laon and is recaptured. His fate is subject to combat not just in the battle between Pinabel and Thierry, but also in his own duels with Otes and Gondelboef. He is not only executed hideously, but the barons compete to surpass each other in the cruelty of their proposals. This repetition of elements served to meet the need of audiences avid for further details of a story that they loved. The multiplication of entities in the late twelfth-century version does not appear to be a new phenomenon. There are, after all, two sets of peers in the assonanced versions, the Christian peers and the Saracen peers. The Battle of Roncevaux develops in two waves. There are two battles of Roncevaux, the one in which Roland dies, distantly based on a historical occurrence, and the one in which Charlemagne kills Baligant, with no historical counterpart.

In the end, the major developments of the plot have identical results. The details of the Battle of Roncevaux and the Episode of Baligant vary from what is found in Oxford; nonetheless, Roland and the Twelve Peers do die and, except in the Lyon version, Charlemagne does defeat Baligant. A poem in which Ganelon was not put to death would be unacceptable to medieval audiences, and presumably most readers and auditors would know this outcome in advance, but the manner in which it is achieved differs to a greater or lesser extent in all the versions. It is, then, a question of suspense, not of the type that leads the audience to ask what the outcome will be, but of the kind that makes it wonder how that outcome will be achieved.

Let us imagine for a moment that in 1832 a disastrous fire had swept through the Bodleian Library in Oxford, destroying the Digby 23 manuscript before Francisque Michel famously took note of its existence. We would be deprived of the oldest form of the *Chanson de Roland* in what is a beautiful version of 3,995 lines copied in England by a careless and ignorant scribe. Ian Short, admittedly an interventionist editor, has seen fit to correct this scribe almost 950 times, or in nearly a quarter of the lines, and to catalog the scribe's blunders in a fourteen-page *Erratorium transcribendi* (*CdR*, vol. 1, pp. 68-81). What would be left of the

French corpus of the *Chanson de Roland*,¹⁶ in the wake of such a disaster, would still be, presumably, the other six substantial French manuscript copies ranging in length from 2,933 to 8,333 lines, plus the three fragments. Scholars working on medieval French literature would have been without the Oxford text to consecrate, venerate, and convert into a monument with all the reverence passed on to them by the early nineteenth-century founders of the field, for whom texts took on increased value in proportion to their antiquity. Or perhaps rather than simply lacking Oxford, they would have chosen another of the French *Roland* texts upon which to impose monumental qualities. The Oxford version is spare, laconic, and highly paratactic, not qualities found admirable in all ages. It is a product of two early periods in the history of French literature, that of its composition shortly after the First Crusade, and that of its copying, twenty-five to fifty years later. It is consequently isolated, since we have no chansons de geste contemporary with it to which it can be compared. But literary taste varies from age to age, region to region, redactor to redactor, and we can perceive characteristics of this variation through the *Roland* versions, from the careful copying of the scribe of the Paris version in the mid-thirteenth century and the redactors or scribes of Châteauroux and Venice 7 in a lightly Italianized French later in that century, through the abbreviated Lyon version of the early fourteenth century, through the composite assonanced lines very heavily influenced by the fourteenth-century Venice 4 redactor's Italian, to the confusions of the Cambridge redactor in the early fifteenth century. Each version has its idiosyncrasies, and to see most of the changes as defects would be to blind ourselves to the creative character of the textual tradition. Most of the differences in plot and technique have a reason behind them. Each version of the *Chanson de Roland* is in its own right a reception of the legend of Charlemagne, Roland, the Battle of Roncevaux, and its aftermaths, and each is worthy of careful study.

¹⁶ This is not to neglect the versions still extant integrally or fragmentarily in other medieval languages—Norse, Swedish, Danish, Welsh, Latin (two), German, Dutch, English, Spanish—about which the argument outlined in this paragraph also applies.

<i>Event in Oxford</i>	<i>Laisse: ll.</i>	<i>Event in Châteauroux-Venice 7</i>	<i>Laisse: ll.</i>
PRELUDE TO THE TRIAL		PRELUDE TO THE TRIAL	
Charles leaves 1000 men in Saragossa	267:3676-8	Charles leaves 1000 men in Saragossa	320:5997
Bramimonde is a prisoner	267:3680	Bramimonde honored on the journey [Prise de Narbonne in <i>V4</i>]	320:6001-3
		Search for the dead at Roncevaux	321-2
		Charles gives Ganelon to his men's care	322:6059-71
		Charles finds Roland's body, speaks to it	322:6111-25
		Charles gives Ganelon to Richard & Naymeré	323
		Miracle of the Hawthorn Bushes	324-5
		Miracle of the Hazel Trees	327
		Peers' bodies taken to Saint-Jean-Pied-de-Port	328
		EPISODE OF AUDE	
		Charles establishes Saint-Jean-le-Vieux	329:6275-7
		Charles sends messengers to Vienne	329
		Charles sends messengers to Mâcon	330-2
		At Sorde, Ganelon escapes; Otes recaptures him	333-43
The Olifant left at Saint-Sevrin in Bordeaux	267:3685		
Roland, Oliver, Turpin buries at Saint-Romain in Blaye	267:3688-94		
Journey of army to Aix	267:3695-7	Journey of army to Blaye	344
Judges are summoned	267:3698-3703		
First announcement of the Trial	267:3704		
EPISODE OF AUDE			
Aude learns Roland is dead; she dies	268	Aude learns of defeat, recounts her dreams, dies	345-83
Aude is buried in a convent in Aix	269	Roland, Oliver, Aude are buried in Blaye	384
		Girart advises return to Laon	385
		Army journeys to Bonneval	386-7
		Ganelon will be tried at Laon	388-91
		Charles makes offering at Saint-Denis	392
		Charles will have grief from Ganelon's kin	393
		Charles meets Frankish kin	394
		Charles states Ganelon has committed treason	395
TRIAL OF GANELON AT AIX		TRIAL OF GANELON AT LAON	
		FIRST PHASE: GANELON AGAINST GONDELBOEF	
		Otoier: hear Ganelon; Gondelboef's challenge	396
		Richard accuses Ganelon, who denies treason	397:7657-64
		Gondelboef tells story of Persian prisoner	397:7665-75
		Ganelon challenges Gondelboef, gives hostages	398
		Ganelon arms, flees on his horse	399
		Gondelboef vows to capture Ganelon	400
		Ganelon is pursued, captures by Gondelboef	401-4
Ganelon is tortured	270		
FIRST PHASE: THE JUDGES		SECOND PHASE: THE JUDGES	
The Trial is at Aix on the feast of St. Silvester	271:3745-6	Charles asks the magnates to judge Ganelon	405
Second announcement of the Trial; treason	271:3747-8		

Accusation: killing for wealth	272:3752-6		
Ganelon says his actions were justified	272:3760		
The Franks will take counsel	272:3761		
Ganelon tells the judges he defied Roland	273:3775-8		
The Franks will take counsel	273:3779		
		The arrival of Ganelon's kin is announced	406
		Ganelon claims he was merely testing his horse	407
		Charles appoints a jury of magnates	408
		Pinabel and other kinsmen arrive	409
Ganelon asks Pinabel to save him	274:3787		
Judges decide to recommend reconciliation	275:3798-3804		
Thierry does not agree	275:3806		
Judges tell Charles the decision	276:3808-13		
Charles calls the judges his felons	276:3814		
SECOND PHASE: THIERRY AGAINST PINABEL			
Thierry is Roland's kinsman	277:3826		
Thierry judges Ganelon should die for treason	277:3831		
		THIRD PHASE: THIERRY AGAINST PINABEL	
		Pinabel will defend Ganelon against the charge	410
		Thierry, Roland's squire, will fight Pinabel	411
		Thierry gives his glove; Pinabel gives hostages	412
Pinabel contradicts Thierry, offers his glove	278:3841-5		
Thirty kinsmen swear oath for Pinabel	278:3847		
Charles receives Thierry's glove	279:3852		
Charles has four benches brought	279:3853		
The procedure is just	279:3855		
Ogier presides	279:3856		
The champions confess their sins	280:3859		
They go to mass, receive the Eucharist	280:3860		
Arming of the champions	280:3863-8		
The champions mount	280:3869		
This is a judgment of God	280:3872		
		Charles refuses to free Ganelon	413
		Thierry is armed	414
		Thierry mounts	415
		Pinabel is armed	416
		Pinabel mounts	417:7994-
8007		Charles has relics brought	417:8008-13
		Knights guard field of combat	418:8014-27
		Charles puts magnates in charge of the combat	418:8028-32
		The combatants take oaths	419
		Pinabel swears that Ganelon is innocent	420
		The combat begins	421
		Pinabel offers Sorence and daughter to Thierry	422:8080-92
		Thierry kills Pinabel's horse	422:8093-98
		Pinabel strikes Thierry's horse	423
The champions unhorse each other	281		
They attack each other on foot, with swords	282	They attack each other on foot, with swords	424
Charles asks that God judge	282:3891		
Thierry rejects Pinabel's offer of wealth	283		
Thierry appeals to God's judgment	283:3898		
Pinabel rejects the offer of reconciliation	284		
Pinabel wounds Thierry	285	Pinabel wounds Thierry	425

		Thierry wounds Pinabel	426
		Pinabel strikes Thierry, almost makes him fall	427
		Thierry splits Pinabel's nose and chin	428
Thierry kills Pinabel	286:3929	Thierry pierces Pinabel's breast, killing him	429
God has worked a miracle	286:3931		
		Pinabel's body is hung on a gibbet	430
		Charles swears to punish Ganelon	431
The Franks decree death for Ganelon & his kin	286:3932-3		
Thierry celebrated, taken into Aix on a mule	287		
		Charles honors Thierry	432
		Thierry sleeps in Charles' bedroom	433
		Ganelon confesses to treason	434
PUNISHMENT OF KIN AND GANELON		PUNISHMENT OF GANELON	
		Charles asks for proposals of punishment	435
The Franks confirm death sentence of the kin	288:3951		
Ganelon's thirty kinsmen are executed	288:3952-9		
		Charles rejects five types of execution	436-40
		Otoier proposes quartering by horses	441
		Charles orders all in Laon to witness	442
Assembly decrees Ganelon's death	289:3960-3		
Ganelon is torn apart at the tails of four horses	289:3964-74	Ganelon is torn apart by four horses	443
Bramimonde baptized as Juliane	290		
		Charles has all he wished for	444
		Charles returns to the palace despondent	445
The angel Gabriel visits Charles	291		

Works Cited

Primary Texts

La Chanson de Roland; The Song of Roland: The French Corpus. Gen. ed. Joseph J. Duggan. Preliminaries: General Introduction, Editing the *Song of Roland* by Joseph J. Duggan; Concordance of Laisses by Karen Akiyama; Works Cited. Part 1: *The Oxford Version*, ed. Ian Short. Part 2: *The Venice 4 Version*, ed. Robert F. Cook. Part 3: *The Châteauroux-Venice 7 Version*, ed. Joseph J. Duggan. Part 4: *The Paris Version*, ed. Annalee C. Rejhon. Part 5: *The Cambridge Version*, ed. Wolfgang G. van Emden. Part 6: *The Lyon Version*, ed. William W. Kibler. Part 7: *The Fragments*, ed. William W. Kibler. 3 vols. Turnhout: Brepols, 2005.

Secondary Texts

Bédier, Joseph. "Richard de Normandie dans les chansons de geste." *Les légendes épiques: recherches sur la formation des chansons de geste*. 3rd ed. Vol. 4. Paris: Champion, 1926-29. 3-18.

Bradbury, Jim. "Geoffrey V of Anjou, Count and Knight." *The Ideals and Practice of Medieval Knighthood III*. Ed. C. Harper-Bill and R. Harvey. Woodbridge: Boydell, 1990. 21-38.

Duggan, Joseph J. "L'épisode d'Aude dans la tradition en rime de la *Chanson de Roland*." *Charlemagne in the North: Proceedings of the Twelfth International Conference of the Société Rencesvals, Edinburgh, 4th-11th August 1991*. Eds. P. E. Bennett, A. E. Colby, and G. A. Runnals. Edinburgh: Société Rencesvals, British Branch, 1993. 273-79.

———. "La France des Plantagenêts dans les versions rimées de la *Chanson de Roland*." *Les Chansons de geste: Actes du XVI^e congrès international de la Société Rencesvals pour l'étude des épopées romanes, Granada, 21-25 juillet 2003*. Ed. C. Alvar and J. Paredes. Granada: Editorial Universidad de Granada, 2005. 205-14.

———. "El juicio de Ganelón y el mito del pecado de Carlomagno en la versión de Oxford de la *Chanson de Roland*." *Mythopoesis: literatura, totalidad, ideología*. Ed. J. Ramon Resuna. Ambitos Literarios/Ensayo 42. Barcelona: Anthropos, 1992. 53-64.

Horrent, Jules. *La Chanson de Roland dans les littératures française et espagnole au Moyen Age*. Bibliothèque de la Faculté de Philosophie et Lettres de l'Université de Liège 120. Paris: Belles-Lettres, 1951.

Jouön des Longrais, Frédéric. "La preuve en Angleterre." *La Preuve; Deuxième partie: Moyen Age et temps modernes*. Recueils de la Société Jean Bodin pour l'Histoire Comparative des Institutions 17. Bruxelles: Librairie Encyclopédique, 1965. 207-11.

Palumbo, Giovanni. "Per la datazione del *Roland* rimato." *Medioevo Romano* 27 (2003): 353-412.