

pastoral paradise of the New World, the Jeffersonians created a myth which could never become reality. In judgment Sheehan writes: "Paradise never materialized, and rather than becoming civilized, the Indian seemed to disintegrate. The white man not only killed the Indian, he killed the noble savage—in a sense nature itself—and this was a crime for which there could be no expiation" (p. 116).

Until the 1820s the Jeffersonians desired to incorporate Indians into white society east of the Mississippi River. Indian culture, however, did not progress; rather it crumbled and decayed. Incorporation was, therefore, replaced by the removal policy in the hope that by isolating the Indian far beyond the degrading and destructive influences of the frontier he could be civilized through the efforts of missionaries, teachers, and vocational instructors. Frontiersmen and Indians clashed with such ferocious violence that reconciliation seemed impossible and removal westward, at least, would delay the utter annihilation of the Indian people. Sheehan, however, acutely concludes: "If the frontiersmen adopted the direct method of murdering Indians, humanitarians were only more circumspect in demanding cultural suicide of the tribes" (p. 277).

Present day philanthropists and humanitarians are as puzzled and disturbed as were the Jeffersonians by the Indians' reluctance to incorporate or assimilate into the world of the white man. Neither now nor in the days of Jefferson has western man readily accepted the premise that cultures different from his own contain much virtue or validity. The reviewer commends *Seeds of Extinction* to every serious student of Indian-white relations because it is a profound and satisfying book.

Purdue University, West Lafayette Donald J. Berthrong

The Price of Loyalty: Tory Writings from the Revolutionary Era. Narrative and editing by Catherine S. Crary. Bicentennial of the American Revolution. (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1973. Pp. 481. Notes, illustrations, bibliography, index. \$12.50.)

Until recently, prejudiced accounts by patriot writers and historians who emulate them have perpetuated a distorted view of those Americans who supported Britain during

the War of the Revolution: the unethical, affluent tory; the unscrupulous, unprincipled traitor to his country. And even more recently, scholars, by examining those loyalists who migrated to England, have concentrated on the wealthy, the large merchants, the great landholders, the royal officials, and the Anglican clergymen. By implication such treatment has led to a view of the tories as an unrepresentative, foreign element thrown off from the main body of American society. By presenting a wide range of documents, Crary makes clear that the loyalists were much more representative of American society than has hitherto been thought. Generalizations about the social and economic status of the loyalists are dangerous in view of the documentation she presents. They came from all walks of life and from all economic and social levels. Although concentrated in some regions, they were to be found everywhere.

Different degrees of loyalism also make identification difficult and numerical assessment impossible. Highly personal factors, some psychological and emotional, often determined men's behavior. Some were overtly committed; they may have represented twenty per cent of the white families. Others were covert in their loyalty while many were uncertain, vacillating, or neutral. Looking at the American population as a whole, one would agree with Crary that generalizations are impossible, but it might be revealing to relate the decisions of loyalists to the peculiar matrix or social, economic, and political configuration in each colony at the outbreak of hostilities. For example, to say that one cannot generalize about the Scotch Irish Presbyterian is true, but nonetheless one can note that those in the South Carolina backcountry behaved in a markedly different way than those in the interior Pennsylvania counties.

It is a tribute to Crary that these documents, notes, and narrative constitute the best work on the loyalists presented to date. She has found documents which depict the tory experience mainly through the lives of little known people who in some instances paid a greater price for their commitment than the eighty thousand or more who were able to leave the country. And it was the experience of obscure men, women, and children vividly depicted in these documents which leads one to conclude that the patriots were hardly as scrupulous for individual rights as has been claimed.