

Seeds of Extinction: Jeffersonian Philanthropy and the American Indian. By Bernard W. Sheehan. (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, for the Institute of Early American History and Culture at Williamsburg, Virginia, 1973. Pp. xii, 301. Notes, note on sources, index. \$11.95.)

Professor Sheehan maintains that other scholars writing about Indian-white relations have neglected to investigate "how the white American's conception of himself and his position on the continent formed his perception of the Indian and directed his selection of policy toward the native tribes" (p. ix). The author also argues that by bringing "together the worlds of thought and actions" of the Jeffersonians he illustrates more clearly how ideas and attitudes contribute to the making of an historical policy—in this case a policy toward the Indians. Because "the Jeffersonian generation believed privately what it said publicly" (p. 281), Sheehan uses for his study a wide range of historical sources which include the writings and correspondence of Thomas Jefferson, John Adams, George Washington, Benjamin Rush, Albert Gallatin, William Henry Harrison, Thomas L. McKenney, and a host of others. He also surveys natural histories, travel accounts, and captivity narratives from which the Jeffersonians derived their information about Indian society. Unlike many intellectual historians who prefer to rely heavily upon published sources, Sheehan utilizes the voluminous Records of the Bureau of Indian Affairs to evaluate Jeffersonian Indian policy.

In common with most men of the Enlightenment, Jefferson believed that the manners and mores of humans were acquired environmentally. Since the unity of man was indisputable and the Indian was innately the equal of white men, the environment contained the possibility of producing cultural change among Indians. Jefferson believed that by altering how the Indians lived, worked, and thought, white society could transform them into men who could benefit from civilized life and who could be incorporated into the white community. Painstakingly, the Jeffersonians demonstrated that the American Indian shared a common origin with other races of man. They denounced the Comte de Buffon and his school who condemned the western hemisphere and its inhabitants to an inferior ranking in the scale of civilization. But by viewing the Indian as a noble savage living in the

pastoral paradise of the New World, the Jeffersonians created a myth which could never become reality. In judgment Sheehan writes: "Paradise never materialized, and rather than becoming civilized, the Indian seemed to disintegrate. The white man not only killed the Indian, he killed the noble savage—in a sense nature itself—and this was a crime for which there could be no expiation" (p. 116).

Until the 1820s the Jeffersonians desired to incorporate Indians into white society east of the Mississippi River. Indian culture, however, did not progress; rather it crumbled and decayed. Incorporation was, therefore, replaced by the removal policy in the hope that by isolating the Indian far beyond the degrading and destructive influences of the frontier he could be civilized through the efforts of missionaries, teachers, and vocational instructors. Frontiersmen and Indians clashed with such ferocious violence that reconciliation seemed impossible and removal westward, at least, would delay the utter annihilation of the Indian people. Sheehan, however, acutely concludes: "If the frontiersmen adopted the direct method of murdering Indians, humanitarians were only more circumspect in demanding cultural suicide of the tribes" (p. 277).

Present day philanthropists and humanitarians are as puzzled and disturbed as were the Jeffersonians by the Indians' reluctance to incorporate or assimilate into the world of the white man. Neither now nor in the days of Jefferson has western man readily accepted the premise that cultures different from his own contain much virtue or validity. The reviewer commends *Seeds of Extinction* to every serious student of Indian-white relations because it is a profound and satisfying book.

Purdue University, West Lafayette Donald J. Berthrong

The Price of Loyalty: Tory Writings from the Revolutionary Era. Narrative and editing by Catherine S. Crary. Bicentennial of the American Revolution. (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1973. Pp. 481. Notes, illustrations, bibliography, index. \$12.50.)

Until recently, prejudiced accounts by patriot writers and historians who emulate them have perpetuated a distorted view of those Americans who supported Britain during