

This book marks a daring departure for the author outside the field of technical historical writing. Nevertheless, these essays—of which the first three were delivered as lectures at the University of Wisconsin and the fourth as a presidential address to the Canadian Historical Association—are as comprehensive in scope as they are perceptive in conclusions. The dimension of the narrative should not frighten the general American reader; for an “insider” in Canadian history, Professor Morton presents his material judiciously.

University of California, Santa Barbara

Felice A. Bonadio

Saints and Sectaries: Anne Hutchinson and the Antinomian Controversy in the Massachusetts Bay Colony. By Emery Battis. (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, for the Institute of Early American History and Culture at Williamsburg, Va., 1962. Pp. xv, 379. End maps, illustrations, notes, appendixes, bibliography, index. \$7.50.)

Professor Battis introduces Anne Hutchinson to the reader at the time of her arrival at Boston from England. Then, using the flashback technique, he discusses her formative years, her marriage, and her early religious views. What follows is a detailed account of the role she played in Massachusetts, an account which covers the years 1634 to 1638 and which builds to a climax when she was excommunicated and banished. A brief reference is made to her removal to Rhode Island and from thence to Long Island where in 1643 she was tomahawked by the Indians. The last portion of the book contains a sociological study of the background and conduct of the Hutchinsonians. In the concluding chapter the author comments about the impact of the Antinomian controversy upon the Bay Colony.

Since much has been written already, why did the author attempt to replot the same historical ground? He was striving for a new and imaginative approach to this topic and, by applying the methods used by scholars in the behavioral sciences, he was probing for deeper insights into the complexities of the Antinomian controversy. By a study of the sociological implications and by a quantitative analysis of the population, he proves that the followers of Anne were not riff-raff but persons of good political and socio-economic standing. He believes that her religious views and actions were not the result of normal impulses but were an outgrowth of complex emotional pressures and psychological factors. He does not believe that she was consciously promoting religious freedom but was merely upholding her own independent views. Individualism and nonconformity, however, could not be tolerated by the oligarchical leaders; and, to them, divergent opinions were dangerously heretical and seditious. Controversy might destroy their church and state, their way of life. This was not an age of tolerance; there could be no compromising. Nonconformists must either conform or leave. The orthodox Puritans held fast, and their “Zion in the Wilderness” was preserved momentarily. Nevertheless, the Antinomians, according to the author’s conclusion, “had struck a heavy blow—if not for freedom

of thought, certainly for that heterogeneity which leads to freedom of thought" (p. 289); and, in the end, the *status quo* could not be maintained in the Puritans' "City of God."

The book's central theme is one of conflict: heterodoxy *versus* orthodoxy; liberalism *versus* conservatism; individual action *versus* hierarchical control. Here is the search for the meaning of life and salvation. Here are the fine points of the Covenant of Works and the Covenant of Grace argued with an intensity that is almost incomprehensible to the modern reader. Here, too, are the saints, sectaries, and sinners—Winthrop, Cotton, Wheelright, Coddington, Underhill, Vane, Symmes, Wilson, and many others—all of whom are described objectively by the author.

This reviewer is not convinced that a person who has been dead for three hundred twenty years can be psychoanalyzed. Anne's emotional problems probably started at an early age. She was tired from child-bearing—fifteen in all, worn out from long hours of inquisitional interrogation, and troubled with menopausal symptoms. These and other psychological determinants permit speculation about the nature and character of Mrs. Hutchinson, but they do not explain completely how she acquired her convictions and why she so adamantly defended them. The author's sociological findings, especially those concerning social status, are more convincing than his psychological conclusions. Yet, within the framework of his approach, the author has succeeded in shedding new light upon the subject. The book is well written, well documented, well indexed; the maps are helpful; the bibliography and fifty-five pages of appendixes illustrate exhaustive research; and the craftsmanship displayed in the printing and binding should more than satisfy the discerning eye of the critic.

Indiana University

Gerald O. Haffner

Schoolcraft's The Literary Voyager or Muzzeniegun. Edited by Philip P. Mason. ([East Lansing]: Michigan State University Press, 1962. Pp. xxvi, 193. Illustration, notes, index. \$5.00.)

The republication, with editorial notes, of *Schoolcraft's Travels . . . to the Sources of the Mississippi*, *Schoolcraft's Indian Legends*, and *Schoolcraft's Expedition to Lake Itasca*—all now quite rare items in their original editions—is to be followed by a series based on Schoolcraft's manuscript official and personal papers. The burden of sorting, arranging, and editing the "bales of notes from talks with fur traders, army officers, Indian agents, surveyors" falls upon Philip P. Mason, editor of the third of the above-mentioned printed works and of the one under review. Mr. Mason assures us that there is still a veritable mine of material to be explored.

The Literary Voyager, a short-lived but significant little periodical of its time, is an auspicious choice for the first volume. It was one of the minor products of Schoolcraft's occupational hazards in accepting the office of Indian agent at the Sault. He knew little about the Indians. He suffered severely from an addiction to taking notes. He