

to which she attaches class or gender values rest to a large degree on common sense. Would big city libraries be better had they been located in marginal economic districts? Why should branch libraries not be concentrated in locations convenient to their primary users? Was it inappropriate for library designers and professionals to expect immigrants to conform to the expectations of the middle-class society that made libraries possible? Van Slyck suggests answers, but a more complete discussion would probably result in a second book.

The evolution in our understanding of what a library is and should be continues today. Like schools, libraries are now expected to provide a breadth of services not realized in Carnegie's era, but their evolution into broadly based service organizations accessible to all owes much to the pioneering efforts of the Carnegie initiatives.

GEORGE W. KNEPPER is Distinguished Professor of History Emeritus at the University of Akron. He is currently revising his most recent book, *Ohio and Its People* (1989).

National Parks and the Woman's Voice: A History. By Polly Welts Kaufman. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1996. Pp. xvi, 305. Illustrations, notes, bibliographical essay, index. \$42.50.)

Readers today may not be surprised to learn that women have played a more substantial role in the development and management of the National Park Service than many historians, agency managers, and others have recognized. Likewise, few readers will find it surprising that women were more often than not resisted or opposed (or at the very least not supported) in the drive to establish more equal places for themselves within the Park Service. Still, some historians may welcome Polly Welts Kaufman's well researched, written, and illustrated book documenting the achievements of the many talented, conscientious, and determined women who have contributed to what the author regards as the agency's success in meeting its mission of preserving and enhancing public appreciation of the country's natural and cultural resources.

The author documents the experiences of a diverse group of women, beginning with those who explored the Yosemite Valley and other future park sites during the nineteenth century. She then describes the roles women played in advocating the creation of various parks, and she shows how early women professionals fared in what she describes as a male-oriented military culture. Kaufman contends that the agency "lost its will to hire women professionals" after 1933 (p. 83) and that until the 1960s women most often contributed to the agency as wives of staff, sometimes individually and sometimes in groups. Women then began to assert themselves as knowing advocates outside the agency (including Indiana women

who helped create Indiana Dunes National Lakeshore) and as capable professionals, managers, and workers within it—all for the betterment of the National Park Service and the public it serves.

Unfortunately, the author does a much better job of celebrating her subject than analyzing the many complex issues that surround it. Kaufman's fundamental contention that Park Service culture has been confused from the start by its two conflicting subcultures—"the military ethos" (in other words, male culture) and "the public communications approach" (female culture)—seems a bit thin and is never firmly established. She idealizes women's culture with a seemingly endless stream of vague and platitudinous statements ("The women who worked independently of the Park Service valued the continuation of life most of all." p. xiv), while she dismisses male culture as rigid, undemocratic, and somehow at odds with the agency's mission. One ultimately wonders what good the male culture will contribute to Kaufman's proposed synthesis of the two cultures, something she suggests as a worthy goal.

The author certainly deserves recognition for her extensive research efforts, especially the hundreds of interviews she conducted with Park Service women (and her incorporation of the work done by Dorothy Huyck before her), but again, Kaufman's failure to analyze the material critically often leads to the confusion of women's aspirations and achievements. Not surprisingly, no woman in the book fails or performs poorly in her work, just as no woman participates in development projects or inholders groups opposed to Park Service interests. Not surprisingly, too, there are few if any interviews with men—certainly none that would provide a personal or real voice to the unreasonable opposition to women's culture that Kaufman routinely assigns to the male power structure. Obstructionist men tend to be stereotyped as insecure, threatened, and afraid (there is even an index listing for "feminization, fear of" on page 296), while the motivations of supporters like Horace Albright are equally impersonal and unclear.

Ultimately, Kaufman seems so determined to celebrate women's achievements that she misses the opportunity to analyze political or class differences among the subjects (members of the Daughters of the American Revolution who supported early right-wing preservation efforts are essentially undifferentiated from late twentieth-century feminists, for example), and she ends up demonstrating relatively little appreciation for the possibility that National Park Service culture might be affected by anything more than gender relations. Certainly, gender is a critical issue to consider when studying the Park Service or organizations like it, but we learn as little by exaggerating its importance as we do by undervaluing it.

ROBERT WEIBLE is chief of the division of history for the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission in Harrisburg, Pennsylvania. He was previously historian at Lowell National Historical Park in Massachusetts.