

cussing how Crummell saw the world; what Crummell claimed to be the truth was the truth.

Historians are taught to resist efforts of autobiographers to lead them where they will. They are obligated to determine, for instance, if Ida B. Wells-Barnett's recollection of what occurred during her visit to England was accurate. Granted all memory is selective, but what one chooses to remember matters. Nowhere, for instance, in his account of his years in consular service does James Weldon Johnson broach the question, uncomfortable though it may be, of how one could act as a representative of an imperial power that at home denied one's race basic human rights. And if experience matters, as Franklin rightly insists, Johnson's service to his country, in spite of all that was going on at home, may help explain his abiding faith in the principles of equality for which the United States stood. And again, if W. E. B. DuBois used personal experience "to illuminate and clarify important matters of principle" (p. 230), I wonder why Franklin does not discuss the "truth" of James Baldwin's homosexuality.

Pressed for space and fearful of rambling reviewers, editors are loathe to assign more than five hundred words to a review. Generally, that is a blessing, but in this case this book raises so many issues of significance to African-American history that the freedom to roam wider would have been appreciated. Franklin takes his readers on an exciting intellectual excursion during which we are prodded to engage a wide range of issues. Although divided into largely discrete chapters, the whole is greater than the sum of its parts, and that is to Franklin's credit.

R. J. M. BLACKETT, a former editor of the *Indiana Magazine of History*, holds the Moores Chair of History and African-American Studies at the University of Houston.

*Free to All: Carnegie Libraries & American Culture, 1890–1920.* By Abigail A. Van Slyck. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995. Pp. xxvii, 276. Illustrations, figures, graphs, table, appendices, notes, bibliography, index. \$47.50.)

Abigail Van Slyck takes as her subject those American cultural icons, the Carnegie libraries. Millions of Americans hold cherished memories of time spent within their walls, and many, in all likelihood, harbor the conviction that if you have seen one, you have seen them all. Van Slyck quickly disabuses one of this assumption. Using material culture "as important primary evidence" (p. xxii), Van Slyck advocates replacing taste as the basis of architectural history with "scholarly analytical skills that can be taught and that can be learned" (p. xxiii).

This study embraces the period from 1890 to 1920 when Carnegie grants, based on the fortune of steel baron Andrew Carnegie, underwrote the construction of 1,679 buildings in 1,412 communities across

America. Van Slyck ranges widely for illustrations, but her research concentrates on thirteen cities and towns representative of the diverse environments in which Carnegie funds were used. One such town, Union City, Indiana, received its \$10,000 grant before 1908, when Carnegie policies began to require a design review.

These early grants were made in the paternal spirit common to late nineteenth-century philanthropy. But as Carnegie's "tainted money" came under attack from critics of big business, he shifted from outright charity to an emphasis on shared responsibility. He required communities to provide building sites and to tax themselves to pay operating expenses. In 1911 Carnegie fully embraced the corporate model of charitable giving by creating the Carnegie Corporation to oversee his library enterprises.

The key figure in this work was Carnegie's personal secretary, James Bertram, who became the channel through which requests were received and evaluated, architects assigned, community responsibilities mediated, and construction work evaluated. Bertram's experiences led him to favor the position taken by newly assertive library professionals over those taken by architects in matters of access, control, shelving, and the like. To this extent, therefore, Bertram and the Carnegie grants played an important role in the development of the professional librarian.

Van Slyck describes how Carnegie practices contributed to the shift from the monumental architectural styles of the late nineteenth century to the more utilitarian styles characteristic of most Carnegie libraries. She sees the ornate, monumental, treasure house aspects of earlier library buildings as a metaphor for the social assumptions of the donors. Market forces and professional librarians, on the other hand, would lead the twentieth century move toward utilitarianism, a move that created buildings better suited to the needs of library staff and users. This discussion is greatly enhanced by excellent illustrations of building exteriors, interiors, and floor plans.

Much attention is given to library location in big cities where, says Van Slyck, the male-dominated power elite opted for large central library buildings located adjacent to the business district where they would reinforce the centrality of that district in the city's business life. Branch library buildings were most often located in or adjacent to middle-class residential districts close-by those who, it was assumed, would be their principal users. In smaller towns, however, Van Slyck finds that middle-class women, having assumed cultural leadership, campaigned for libraries so located as to reinforce the distinction between commerce and culture.

The late chapters focus on the special needs and concerns of women and children. It is difficult to document this discussion because firsthand accounts of library use by these groups are relatively rare.

Throughout this imaginative study, Van Slyck's analytical framework leaves little room for those who would claim that developments

to which she attaches class or gender values rest to a large degree on common sense. Would big city libraries be better had they been located in marginal economic districts? Why should branch libraries not be concentrated in locations convenient to their primary users? Was it inappropriate for library designers and professionals to expect immigrants to conform to the expectations of the middle-class society that made libraries possible? Van Slyck suggests answers, but a more complete discussion would probably result in a second book.

The evolution in our understanding of what a library is and should be continues today. Like schools, libraries are now expected to provide a breadth of services not realized in Carnegie's era, but their evolution into broadly based service organizations accessible to all owes much to the pioneering efforts of the Carnegie initiatives.

GEORGE W. KNEPPER is Distinguished Professor of History Emeritus at the University of Akron. He is currently revising his most recent book, *Ohio and Its People* (1989).

*National Parks and the Woman's Voice: A History.* By Polly Welts Kaufman. (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1996. Pp. xvi, 305. Illustrations, notes, bibliographical essay, index. \$42.50.)

Readers today may not be surprised to learn that women have played a more substantial role in the development and management of the National Park Service than many historians, agency managers, and others have recognized. Likewise, few readers will find it surprising that women were more often than not resisted or opposed (or at the very least not supported) in the drive to establish more equal places for themselves within the Park Service. Still, some historians may welcome Polly Welts Kaufman's well researched, written, and illustrated book documenting the achievements of the many talented, conscientious, and determined women who have contributed to what the author regards as the agency's success in meeting its mission of preserving and enhancing public appreciation of the country's natural and cultural resources.

The author documents the experiences of a diverse group of women, beginning with those who explored the Yosemite Valley and other future park sites during the nineteenth century. She then describes the roles women played in advocating the creation of various parks, and she shows how early women professionals fared in what she describes as a male-oriented military culture. Kaufman contends that the agency "lost its will to hire women professionals" after 1933 (p. 83) and that until the 1960s women most often contributed to the agency as wives of staff, sometimes individually and sometimes in groups. Women then began to assert themselves as knowing advocates outside the agency (including Indiana women