farmers, fostered grain production where livestock might have had a better chance, tried to limit overgrazing on Navajo ranges in ways that nearly starved some herders, and allowed much of the Indian land base to pass into white ownership or use. Indians have been unable to respond to white initiatives successfully. Few of them farm now, although most Indians still live in rural areas.

This is not an inspiring or entertaining book, but it deserves a wide audience among students of agriculture, Indians, and American history in general. It should be especially helpful to teachers who try to take some account of Indians in United States history courses. Specialists in Indiana history will find few direct references to this part of the country but nevertheless may learn something about the western experiences of peoples, such as the Potawatomi, who were forcibly removed from this area.

DONALD B. MARTI is associate professor of history at Indiana University at South Bend. His works include the *Historical Directory of American Agricultural Fairs* (1986) and articles on religion and agriculture in the nineteenth century.

Mother Earth: An American Story. By Sam D. Gill. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987. Pp. x, 196. Notes, bibliography, index. $24.95.)

In 1810 Tecumseh allegedly told William Henry Harrison, "The Earth is my mother and on her bosom I will repose" (p. 6). Other Indians later expanded on the Mother Earth theme, describing her as an ancient and universal goddess/creator who provides a primordial and spiritual base to the Indian identity.

Scholars and observers familiar with Native American beliefs have documented and acknowledged the Mother Earth story for more than a century. Now Sam D. Gill, professor of religious studies at the University of Colorado, has come along to contend that not only does this emperor have no clothes but that there may be no emperor at all.

Gill argues that there was no Mother Earth goddess common to all Native American tribal cultures. At best, he suggests, one can find numerous female religious figures, whose great diversity makes it "unproductive to collapse [them] into a single goddess . . ." (p. 151). According to Gill, most of the arguments for Mother Earth rely on a few questionable sources (statements by Tecumseh and Smohalla and specific evidence from Zuni, Luiseño, and other tribal religions), which often reflect white attitudes more than Indian and suggest Mother Earth was the result of Indian-white contact in the New World. Yet scholars basing their studies on those materials or simply citing each other developed and continue to perpetuate Mother Earth's story. By the twentieth century, Native Americans had embraced Mother Earth as their own as the basis for their identity and relationship to the land.

Gill's argument is fascinating. Whether or not Mother Earth has ancient or recent origins is problematic, and Gill's book is more the opening shot rather than the concluding volley in the battle to decide her fate. Some scholars will argue that Gill, who stresses the great diversity in Native American religions rather than any similarities, cannot see the forest for the trees. Others will attack his limited research base, suggesting the need for more detailed analysis of additional Indian religions. Still others will applaud his exposure of the slipshod work done on the subject by established scholars and praise his meticulous unraveling of the Mother Earth story.

This brief but provocative volume should spark a lively debate. While it may not disprove Mother Earth's existence as an ancient and universal goddess, it nevertheless shows that she has not yet been proven to exist.

RICHARD AQUILA is professor of history at Ball State University. His article, "Sights and Sounds: A Total Approach to American Indian Studies," is forthcoming in *The History Teacher.*

America's Northern Heartland. By John R. Borchert. (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987. Pp. viii, 250. Illustrations, maps, figures, graphs, tables, notes, index. Clothbound, $39.50; paperbound, $19.50.)

"My hope is to capture the reality, the spirit, and the dynamics of the region," writes University of Minnesota Regents Professor John R. Borchert about his study of the history of development on "One-tenth of America's Land" (p. viii). The region extends from the Upper Peninsula of Michigan to the Rocky Mountains, between the Canadian border and a line drawn roughly from Rapid City, South Dakota, through Storm Lake and Oelwein, Iowa, to La-crosse, Wisconsin. Economic geography is featured in the numerous maps scattered through the text. The book contains many photographs, most of which present historical or contemporary scenes in Minnesota. The major themes of *America's Northern Heartland* are "dissolving the wilderness" (p. 31) through a period of burgeoning population from 1870 to 1920 and cultural maturation through urbanization, industrialization, and economic diversity since 1920. Borchert fashions the products of some thirty-five years of research into a demonstration of how the heartland of the United States has taken shape, with Minnesota as its lynchpin, over the past one hundred twenty years.

As a study of economic geography, Borchert's book is fairly successful. Most important trends are portrayed well enough. Some, however, are missing. Tourism, for example, is not featured as it might be in the histories of the states west of Minnesota. From