

narily discerning is the discussion (pp. 162-63) of the 1890 congressional election. Delightful humor, with which several appraisals are sprinkled, is exemplified in James H. Madison's story (p. 185) of how Fairbanks was fancifully transformed from "Buttermilk Charlie" into "Cocktail Charlie." Partial or total revisionism fairly often is a feature—on pp. 22-23 respecting "Old Tippecanoe," for instance; on pp. 114-15 in connection with the 1880 campaign, and on pp. 258, 261, and 265-68 with reference to Hanly.

There is no reason to direct attention to rotten apples in the Gray barrel, for fortunately there are none. If the index is thin, the bibliographical essays are most helpful. In sum, the book is a first-rate contribution not only intrinsically but because it suggests so much scholarship which may henceforth be undertaken in Indiana and elsewhere. Happily, *Gentlemen from Indiana* has been distributed to 550 secondary school and college libraries by the Indiana Historical Bureau and the Indiana University American Revolution Bicentennial Committee.

University of Kentucky, Lexington

Holman Hamilton

The Indiana Experience: An Anthology. Compiled and edited by A. L. Lazarus. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1977. Pp. xvi, 426. Index of authors and titles. Clothbound, \$15.00; paperbound, \$4.95.)

Indiana has always been a writing state. From the days of Edward Eggleston and Lew Wallace to those of Theodore Dreiser and Ernie Pyle the Hoosier commonwealth has produced a flood of fiction, essays, autobiography, and verse, much of which has left an impact on the American reading public. Books like *Alice of Old Vincennes*, *A Hoosier Holiday*, and *Alice Adams* have had multitudes of readers, while the dialect and domestic verse of James Whitcomb Riley live in the memory of a large audience whose tastes are not conspicuously literary. Obviously the anthologist who wishes to represent the Indiana achievement has a major problem in selection.

A. L. Lazarus has arranged his material by literary types rather than chronologically or thematically. Thus sections are devoted to essays, fiction, biography and autobiography, plays, and poetry. This plan is convenient but not always satisfactory. The two major divisions, life sketches and fiction, occupy about 225 pages, appropriately more than half the book; but eighty pages are devoted to a naïve farce by George Ade which focuses on mistaken identity and a dated drama by David Graham

Phillips dealing with the sexual double standard. The five "Folk Songs and Ballads of Indiana" are trivial in themselves and have nothing to do with the state save that the texts were recorded there.

Every anthologist must be allowed his own prejudices and his own criteria of excellence, so perhaps it is idle to quarrel with individual items. And surely there is much here worth reading and rereading. It is pleasing to see Dreiser's celebrated short story "The Lost Phoebe," a chapter from Jessamyn West's *The Friendly Persuasion*, Albert Beveridge's portrait of the youthful Lincoln in Indiana, an Ade satirical tale, a truncated section of Brendan Gill's life of Cole Porter, and Emily Kimbrough's memory of her family's encounter with an early electric car, the Waverly. There are also superior short stories by Kurt Vonnegut, Rex Stout, George P. Elliott, and Jean Shepherd.

Most of the big names in Indiana literary history also appear here; in addition to Dreiser, Ade, and Riley there are selections from Booth Tarkington, Lew Wallace, and Meredith Nicholson. But where are Eggleston, certainly not forgotten today, Maurice Thompson, Frank McKinney Hubbard (the widely admired creator of Abe Martin)? Where are such distinguished historians as Logan Esarey, author of the admirable *The Indiana Home*? Why not essays from the two best known American folklorists in the twentieth century, Stith Thompson and Richard Dorson? Why not a few pages about early Bloomington from Baynard Rush Hall's *The New Purchase* or about Muncie from the seminal book *Middletown* by Robert S. Lynd and Helen M. Lynd? Hardest of all to condone, perhaps, is the omission of anything from the best poet that Indiana has produced, William Vaughn Moody.

State and regional anthologies are often weakest in the poetry section, probably because they limit inclusions to short lyrics and attempt to crowd as many authors as possible into a small number of pages. Twenty poets are represented here in some thirty-five pages, nine of them by single entries. Although several of the writers, like Philip Appleman and David Wagoner, have collected their verse in individual volumes, most are relatively obscure, and the poems published here will not command wide attention. It is peculiarly unfortunate to include six songs by Cole Porter under the rubric of poetry. On stage "Night and Day" sung by a flood-lighted performer with a musical accompaniment can be a memorable experience. Reduced to the printed page it is flat and banal. Americans are indebted to Porter for his great services to public entertainment

as they are to Woody Guthrie for his haunting ballads of social protest. But it is a mistake to link them with writers working in a different idiom and a greater tradition.

University of Illinois, Urbana

John T. Flanagan

The Old Northwest in the American Revolution: An Anthology.

Edited with introductions by David Curtis Skaggs. (Madison: The State Historical Society of Wisconsin, 1977. Pp. vii, 497. Maps, bibliography. \$21.50.)

This volume of twenty-one reprinted essays, scholarly apparatus removed, includes many of the important contributions to the history of the area "north and west of the River Ohio." The collection is edited by David Curtis Skaggs, whose previous writings dealt mostly with the history of colonial Maryland. Skaggs' laudable interest in the region, stimulated by service on Ohio's Bicentennial Commission, led him to conclude that few interested citizens knew much about the Revolutionary West. He wished to inform them and also to show scholars gaps in the secondary literature.

Having attended and taught at schools much devoted to teacher training, Skaggs probably has heard the dictum: "take the students from where they are." In this case, it may be feared that most citizens are far from able to understand the articles in Skaggs' anthology. In effect, he has assigned a "readings" book without a text. To compensate one might first read Beverly W. Bond's *The Foundations of Ohio* (garbled in Skaggs' extensive bibliography with another Bond book). Even with some background much of the writing in *The Old Northwest in the American Revolution* is hard to follow, in some cases because of the complex themes, in other instances because the essays contain minutia or irrelevancies. Neophytes looking for clear exposition will find much strained argument instead. Staughton Lynd's essay, which tends to the "I think, therefore it is" position, may disillusion the beginner regarding one's ability to recover the essential past, especially when compared with Jack Eblen's largely opposing views on the same topic. Longer, more carefully structured introductions and more closely pruned texts could mitigate problems in this publically supported work: but is that possible when the editor refers to "accurate" dialogue that is "not historically verifiable," or declares that Pontiac's war ended in 1765 instead of 1766, or implies the land to be "woodlands," ignoring extensive prairies and swamps? An index would have been helpful too.