

Beyond NGO-ization: The Development of Social Movements in Central and Eastern Europe. Eds. Kerstin Jacobsson and Steven Saxonburg. Burlington: Ashgate Publishing, 2013. 268 pp. \$119.95, hardbound.

Emily Channell-Justice, City University of New York, PhD Candidate in Anthropology, The Graduate Center

Beyond NGO-ization is a timely edition chronicling social movements in Central and Eastern Europe (CEE) in the second decade after the end of state socialism. The editors, who define social movements as “groups of people engaging in a variety of different types of collective action to accomplish their goals, which could be either influencing policies or influencing identities and the views of their supporters, or both,” see three major threads uniting the essays in the book. (2013:2) First, despite a general lack of mass mobilization, these authors recognize that social movements remain dynamic aspects of post-communist societies. Second, in order to comprehend the role of these social movements, the authors include a range of movements, including conservative and unsuccessful mobilizations. Finally, the authors consider that the political actions of activists are not limited to organizing mass protests but can include service provisions, engagement with state institutions, and use of new technologies to influence public opinion. All of these help make up these social movements' “repertoires of action.” (2013:14) These narratives challenge the dominance of the NGO-ization thesis, which describes most social movements in CEE countries as focused on accessing funding and developing a professionalized civil sector, rather than mobilizing large groups or politicizing society. The present volume shows that understanding social movements exclusively through NGO-ization glosses over the daily practices that keep these movements alive. Further, the contributing authors highlight the political, historical, and social contexts that give rise to various types of movements in CEE which continue to develop under the influence of post-communist independence.

While the volume is organized geographically, confirming that context has a significant influence on how each case study has developed, each author recognizes that legacies of state socialism have left many citizens of CEE countries skeptical of social movements and political participation. Three essays challenge assumptions about how social movements can develop, particularly concerning how networks are used, political orientations, and the motivation to continue following success. Kerstin Jacobsson's research shows the effectiveness of informal networks among animal rights activists in Poland, who have a strong policy orientation and do extensive charity work. Their organizations do not engage in direct action or animal liberation but focus on service projects and occasional mass mobilizations. (2013: 27-47) In contrast, Steven Saxonburg promotes research among conservative women's organizations because their successful alliances with political representatives may provide lessons for other activists by blurring ideological lines between feminism and conservatism. While they often support traditional family structures, they also demand more active fathering as well as better social policies. (2013:97-115) Finally, Conor O'Dwyer describes the success of gaining legal rights for

gay people in the Czech Republic more rapidly than anywhere else in CEE, without anti-discrimination requirements of Europeanization policies, because Czech attitudes were more open to gay rights. However, after the recognition of registered partnerships in 2006, the movement dissolved without a legal cause to target. (2013:117-138)

The four essays in this volume that most productively use ethnography to advance theoretical conclusions about social movements reflect the centrality of the role of framing in anthropological research. Renata E. Hryciuk and Elżbieta Korolczuk, for instance, apply an intersectional approach to mothers' rights movements in Poland. The authors show that groups expressing women's rights as civil rights have successfully framed their movements to appeal to larger society. However, class-based protests—focused on the living conditions of poor mothers and their access to social support—were not successful because opponents were able to negatively frame the protesters as “leftovers' from the socialist period” (2013:65) dependent on state support. Also focusing on women's activism, Katalin Fábián contextualizes the home-birth movement in Hungary in discourses around home birth and medicalized birth practices. The framing of this movement is directly related to transnational home-birth activism mediated via the Internet as well as the unjust persecution of Dr. Ágnes Geréb, an obstetrician-midwife who has been actively promoting home births in Hungary for two decades. (2013:71-95) In Russia, Nikolay Zakharov uses the example of anti-immigration mobilizations to show how the development of racialized identities has influenced non-activists' attitudes toward ethnic minorities and has helped anti-immigration activists frame their movement as legitimate. Zakharov traces the process of “othering” (2013:174) of migrants and the identification of ethnic Russians with whiteness that can be mobilized for social action. (2013:169-189) Focusing on Moscow, Aleh Ivanou's research with Taganka 3 anti-urban development activists suggests that the group's focus on quality of life issues alongside environmental concerns has helped them frame their movement in an accessible way to cohabitants in the Taganka neighborhood and the city more broadly. Further, their mobilization of legal expertise and rejection of radical tactics have helped the group gain the support of other activist groups. (2013:191-211)

The final three chapters attempt to investigate social movements as grounded in external contexts. Ondřej Cisař creates a typology based on defining activism—for example, participatory or transactional—or by separating participation from activism. He generates five activist “modes” (2013:143), which qualify various movements he examines. He concludes that mobilizations in the Czech Republic focus on economic problems and the misbehavior of the political elite following the communist period. (2013:139-166) In the Western Balkans, Adam Fagan and Indraneel Sircar explain the lack of mobilization around environmental issues and preservation through a broader concern for ethno-national influence on political discourse. However, the authors find locally-supported conservation programs that challenge the dominance of ethno-national narratives in contemporary Balkan politics. (2013:213-236) Finally, comparing two “competitive authoritarian” contexts (2013:238), Phillipp Kuntz suggests that the apathy found in Serbia and Ukraine before their respective Color Revolutions in 2000 and 2004 can be traced to the competition possible in these political spheres. Because there were present (but ineffective) opposition forces, regular mass mobilizations, and general trust in the electoral systems, both societies remained passive until an identifiable event—electoral fraud—pushed them to mobilize on mass scales. (2013:237-264)

Kuntz suggests that before the Color Revolutions, citizens in these countries did not see a clear line between good and evil, therefore denying them a figure around which to mobilize. As protests across Europe, and CEE especially, continue to grow in frequency and size, researchers must ask whether such a clear line is necessary for successful mobilizations. As these contributors show, social movements reproduce themselves on a daily basis, and this dynamism is not contingent on easily defined representations of good and evil. Where state socialism was once to blame for social problems, these authors show that now, activists must create new relationships with politicians and policies in order for their movements to make gains. Anthropologists concerned with social movements may find useful examples within these chapters, but anyone researching in CEE will find that this volume provides new insight on the changing nature of the relationship between states and political subjects following the collapse of state socialism in the region.