

TO LOVE OR NOT TO LOVE (WESTERN CLASSICAL MUSIC): THAT IS THE QUESTION (FOR MUSIC EDUCATORS)

ESTELLE R. JORGENSEN

Indiana University and Walden University, United States

jorgense@indiana.edu

Abstract

In this article, I transpose the word “love” for “be” in Hamlet’s existential question in his soliloquy concerning life and death penned by William Shakespeare, “To be or not to be: That is the question.” Thinking through the ethical imperatives of love and its ancillary values of friendship, desire, and devotion in Western classical music and music education, I sketch critically the role of love in this musical tradition and its transmission and transformation. I then trace some of the implications of this analysis for musical education.

Keywords: Values, Music Education, Music Teaching, Music Learning, Western Classical Music, Love

To love or not to love Western classical music is a profound and existential question for musicians and educators.¹ Although Shakespeare raises the question of being in the opening to Hamlet’s soliloquy on life and death, he might well have reflected on love since this reality is also central to human experience.² I want to go further to reflect on the value of love and to suggest that at its best,

Western classical music is predicated on love and decisions about whether to love it are likewise crucial for music education. While love is also related to the values of friendship, desire, and devotion, time and space permit me to refer briefly to these in passing.³ My earlier writing on “Western Classical Music and General Education” arose out of my sense of the marginalization of this tradition in the public sphere. Too many people do not know or value it despite almost two centuries of publicly funded general education in music and it is worth teaching in general education and music education.⁴ I did not mean to infer that the tradition is dying as my friendly critic and self-professed “gadfly” James Daugherty reads me to say.⁵ On the contrary, I see many instances in which it flourishes. Still, in the landscape of contemporary media beyond school music, there are many places in which it is rarely to be seen and heard and it is too often invisible or at the margins of contemporary Western culture. I long for people everywhere to know it just as I also advocate for its transformation. In the way of philosophy, where everything one writes is in some sense wrong or incomplete, I return to the matter of Western classical music and music education in the hope of better saying what I mean. Here, I think again about Western classical music and music education through the prism of love and reflect on its importance for general education.

Two fallacies need to be acknowledged in the critique and defense of Western classical music in music education. The first is the notion of false equivalence, namely, that all musics are of equivalent value and the selfsame values of Western classical music apply equally to every other music. On the contrary, every music is predicated on values and these differ from music to music, from group to group, and from person to person.⁶ For those deciding which musics to espouse and promulgate, musics do not present equally in value. Some traditions or genres are regarded as more worthwhile than others. Within a tradition such as Western classical music, all pieces are not of equal value and the values that apply to one do not necessarily apply to another. Moreover, the instructional situations in which music is learned and taught differ widely in purpose and character. Practically speaking, if musicians and teachers are to avoid the error of false equivalence and recognize that musics differ in value, it is necessary to justify the musical values expressed in one’s musicking, teaching, and learning. Such an approach exemplifies the crucial application of reason in music and education.⁷

A second related fallacy is reductionism or the oversimplification of complex ideas and practices. This occurs, for example, when the entire Western classical music tradition is homogenized and characterized as hegemonic, elitist, heterosexist, racist, and classist. Social critiques of music and musical practices are presumed to hold the principal key to musical understanding and value and the enterprise of forwarding the merits of one of the world’s principal classical

traditions is interpreted as deprecating all others. Here, it is important for musicians and teachers to recognize that while all musical traditions have values of differing sorts, they (and the values on which they are built) all have detractions. Thinking of music principally in terms of its practices and through the lens of socially-driven theory, while important, is too narrow a view. It fails to sufficiently acknowledge alternative philosophical positions within a rich aesthetic and musical literature. Musics are understood not only in terms of social and critical theory and practice but also regarding their physical, psychological, historical, philosophical, anthropological, musical, educational, theological, and spiritual properties, perspectives, and values.⁸ This broad multi-disciplinary view of music and music education reflects the breadth and depth of musical and educational experience and the many ways in which musical experience is both shared in some respects and disparate in others.

In examining the value of love in the Western classical tradition for its own sake, I recognize that my present analysis is limited. Western classical music is something of a misnomer. This remarkable and rich musical tradition encompasses a polyglot of distinctive beliefs and practices that are often at odds with each other in what might be thought of Platonically as “The One and the Many,” united in some respects and diverse in others.⁹ My examples are selective. While I speak of my love of this music, I am drawn to some parts of this tradition more than others. My focus is upon some of the commonly experienced qualities that I notice in classical music rather than on the myriad distinctions that should properly be made across it. I cannot hope to do justice to this complexity but must rather sketch some of the high points in which love plays out in my experience of Western classical music and music education.

LOVE

Love is among the most enduring musical and educational values. It is espoused by musicians who speak of themselves as “amateurs” who do music for the love of it and by teachers who posit love as a grounding educational principle and who seek for their students to appreciate and love music.¹⁰ Despite its wide usage, its meaning is ambiguous. It is construed as noun and verb, experienced objectively and subjectively as dynamic process in the sense of becoming, done and undergone, thought and felt. Cultivated particularly in those spaces where intimate interpersonal bonds are forged in private life, it is also evident to differing degrees and in various forms in public life. It is present in schools, religious communities, businesses, and musical organizations, among the myriad ways and different institutions in which human beings relate socially. Moving, first from pedagogical notions of love in which I tease out the senses in which one may

speak of love educationally, I then think of love musically construed in terms of the experience of Western classical music. Doing this helps to clarify the value of love and grasp its contributions and detractions in the broad musical and educational enterprise.

Thought about in terms of its ordinary usage as “affection and attachment,” love can be defined as a “feeling or disposition of deep affection or fondness for someone.” It typically arises “from a recognition of attractive qualities, from natural affinity, or from sympathy and manifesting itself in concern for the other’s welfare and pleasure in his or her presence.” This attraction and attachment can also be directed towards “a group or category of people” or “one’s country or another impersonal object of affection.”¹¹ In each case, the notion of love differs somewhat.

Conceiving of love as directed beyond people towards a wide array of subjects opens possibilities that are both sacred and secular. Love can be construed in religious terms. In the Jerusalem faiths, believers see it “as the benevolence and affection of God towards an individual or towards creation,” “the affectionate devotion due to God from an individual,” and “the regard and consideration of one human being towards another prompted by a sense of a common relationship to God.”¹² In polytheistic and animistic traditions, adherents may be attracted to some gods whom they regard as beneficent even as they seek to appease others whom they fear. Those who deny the existence of god(s), may sense mystery, awe, and wonder in the face of life and the natural world or may acknowledge an impersonal providence or natural principle to which they may be attracted and attached.¹³ Within secular life, love may also be construed as a “strong predilection, liking, or fondness” for objects such as money and social status, both from the possession of these objects for their own sake or because of the benefits that accrue from their possession. Musicians along with other artists and their publics often speak of their love of music or the other art(s) they practice or appreciate.¹⁴ This deep affection and attachment often leads them to go to sometimes extraordinary lengths to cultivate the requisite skills, live a life in pursuit of their art, and make sacrifices to attain and maintain it.

Love is also conceived sexually and physically as enactment and holistic fulfillment. To make love can connote physical and sexual acts driven by lust, physical desire, or instinct to the exclusion of other emotional and intellectual attachments or commitments. It can also refer to “an intense feeling of romantic attachment based on an attraction felt by one person for another; intense liking and concern for another person, typically combined with sexual passion.” When one speaks of being “in love,” one means a state of being that while enacted sexually may also fuse physical, emotional, and intellectual attraction as a consuming passion. This holistic expression of love has a moral dimension that moves

beyond the merely physical to embrace one's attraction to and regard for one's beloved and one's responsibility for, commitment to, and duty towards them. It is natural, then, to speak of them as one's "love," and as in times past, to imagine gods such as Cupid, Amor, Eros, and Venus as the personification of that love.¹⁵

Love is also conceived of intellectually as "an abstract principle." As Shakespeare has Helena say, "Love looks not with the eyes, but with the mind; And therefore is wing'd Cupid painted blind..."¹⁶ Samuel Taylor Coleridge writes that "Love is a desire of the whole being to be united to something, or some being, felt necessary to its completeness."¹⁷ As Virginia Woolf posits: "Love. Hate. Peace. Three emotions made the ply of human life."¹⁸ Coleridge roots love in desire and feeling, in a longing for completeness to be found only when one unites with something that or someone who one feels necessary to complement and fulfill what one lacks. For Coleridge, love is grounded in one's feeling of incompleteness and desire for completeness that can only be found outside oneself. In different vein, Woolf construes love figuratively as one of three constituent emotions of human life. Her metaphor of ply suggests that love is part of the very fabric of human life, its material or its warp and weave, and necessary to the human condition. Love is not only central to life but it also evidences distinctive features of resilience and manifestation demonstrated differently from time to time and place to place.

Thought of as a verb, love is something enacted. It means to hold someone or something precious or "dear," and to "entertain a great affection, fondness, or regard for" "a person, a thing personified," or "a quality or attribute."¹⁹ Such is this attraction that one cannot relinquish this person or thing or allow it to disappear and one may be willing to give one's life or sacrifice all to possess it. Love is expressed spiritually and physically, performed practically rather than only thought about or spoken. This enactment may be far more powerful than ideas about or words of love. Words fail as means of expressing this powerful emotion, and loving acts of kindness, tenderness, devotion, and commitment count far more than the words that are said. Importantly, one takes "pleasure in the existence of (a virtue, a practice, a state of things) in oneself, in others, or more generally."²⁰ Love is not only a gift to others but reciprocal in the pleasure it brings to the giver by having been given and received. This reality makes unrequited love, or love that is spurned or unreturned, especially bitter for the lover.

PEDAGOGICAL LOVE

Where is pedagogical love to be situated within this richly ambiguous construction? By pedagogical love, I mean the love expressed between teachers and their students and for the instructional content, materials, and approaches.

Among its qualities, thinking of love in terms of depth of affection and attraction towards persons and things differs from construing it in terms of purely physical desire or romantic or sexual love in that its objective is spiritual rather than sensual and its expression is physically reserved rather than seeking sexual consummation. On the teacher's part, interested love, or the natural affection of people who are attracted to each other, is tempered and accompanied by what some would see as disinterested love; that is, the love that looks beyond those who are naturally attractive or deserving of one's love to those who are dependent on one and for whom one is in a position of trust. In her notion of caring, Nel Noddings is at pains to take account of this affection, moral obligation, and commitment even towards those who are unlovely or undeserving.²¹ Seen in these ways, the sexual expression of love between teacher and student constitutes a betrayal of the teacher's position of trust in relation to the student. Pedagogical love is principled as well as practical in ways that seek to see the student in terms of future possibility rather than merely present reality. It is feelingful and expressed in affection and touch while also conscious of decorum to preserve the teacher's position of trust and recognize the student's vulnerability. Such love is deeply spiritual in a holistic sense of personhood while also enacted in the phenomenal world.

Coleridge's principle of need as a basis of love is intriguing for its possible pedagogical implications. It rings true in anecdotal evidence of those teachers who have spoken to me of their need to teach and of a grief experienced when they no longer can, and students who have expressed to me their need for assistance and direction as they seek the learning they deem necessary and that they feel they lack. Moreover, the passionate attachments that pedagogical love suggests are manifested, for example, in the love that music students often express for their instrumental and vocal teachers and the love that they have for the music(s) they practice. In this ancient and widespread approach to musical education, the love that binds teachers and their students sometimes persists for a lifetime. For students, this deep affection and attachment often merges into a form of reverence for their teachers. Akin to religious expressions of love, teachers and students believe they are in a sacred space, standing on holy ground, and they see each other as infinitely precious. Construed as noun and verb, pedagogical love is a dynamic process and a state of being. It is experienced in the moment and over time. As both unidirectional and reciprocal, requited and sometimes unrequited, pedagogical love profoundly affects all aspects of teaching, learning, instruction, curriculum, and administration, both facilitating and hindering these educational processes.²²

LOVE AS A MUSICAL VALUE

What of the value of love in Western classical music? I begin with an example.²³ In a pair of articles, one published and the other, “Incarnating the Shiver-Shimmer Factor: Toward a Dialogical Sublime,” in this issue, Deanne Bogdan investigates the performative experience of Western classical music as a spiritual and emotional one. In the first, drawing on the metaphor of “shiver-shimmer,” she unpacks something of the dialogical and magical experience of a performer engaging with this music. The music is subjectified and the performer creates what Susanne Langer would call “a virtual image” that is sonic and visual and transports the performer and listener into a spiritual place. In the second article (and the second of her three moments embodying aspects of the “falling in love” process as performers and audiences co-create the “dialogical sublime”), she gives us its incarnation in a performance by Daniil Trifonov, one of the foremost pianists of his generation.²⁴ He appears for us as prophet, priest, or magician, conjuring up the richness implicit in the possibilities of the score that he has studied and made his own. Critics of this romantic ideal may be tempted to disparage the reverence and love for this musician and the music he plays. Still, the practical fact of the matter is that I continue to be in audiences that react exactly this way when they hear a wondrous and evocative classical music performance. A musician’s virtuosity, grace, speed, tenderness, vitality, conviction, and absorption seem almost effortless and superhuman. I along with the audience seem to be in the thrall of, or even dazzled by, what the musician has created and moved physically as well as emotionally, intellectually, and spiritually by our shiver and shimmer response to music. No wonder when an audience projects the beauty of the sonic images they hear and that move them deeply back to those who evoke this performance. There is love here: love of this music, of this instrument, and of this performer. One might speak of the performer’s love as devotion and even desire expressed in their dedication to a way of life of practice and performance and the sense that they might die if they do not perform. One might speak of the friendship musicians manifest as they seek to share this intimately known piece of music with an audience that may not be known to them or who may be unfamiliar with this music. One might speak of their longing that their audience share with them their love of and devotion to this music. One might speak of an ethical imperative to love this precious music as the composer or performer loves it and thereby to requite the musician’s love of this music.

My sense is that this has been the way throughout the entire history of Western classical music whether performed formally or informally. Music lovers were enchanted with Vivaldi’s orchestra of women and girls at La Pieta, Bach’s organ and chamber performances, Liszt’s piano recitals, and Leonard Bernstein’s

electrifying performances and compositions. Musicians celebrate after a deeply moving performance that leaves them with a sense of joy, exhilaration, and sometimes ecstasy. They treasure those moments when an audience really listens to and attends to their music while they are performing. Even if listeners are present purely for social reasons, it can be exciting to take part and be there. One loves the experience and treasures those who make this music and this occasion possible. Love propels musicians and their audiences to desire more such experiences and serves as a powerful motivating force for keeping this music alive and thriving.

As one of the world's great musical traditions, Western classical music exemplifies a host of powerful ideas and values worth preserving and loving. Among its resilient values are love, friendship, desire, and devotion. Built on oral traditions, its adherents have developed sophisticated scale systems, formal properties, theoretical analyses, and expansive melodic, rhythmic and, more lately, timbral ideas and acoustic and electronic instruments. It is a literate tradition with a rich historical, anthropological, sociological, psychological, philosophical, and musical research history and community. It is also hospitable to other musical traditions. Witness the rising fusion of Eastern and Western influences, the mixture of styles and musics under its umbrella, and its involvement in a host of contemporary multiple arts such as film, theater, and opera.

Graham MacPhail invites music educators to base their music curricula on powerful ideas that are progressively articulated.²⁵ If he is right, musicians and music educators need to consider the Western classical tradition as a crucial element within the music curriculum precisely because it is grounded in and promotes powerful ideas. There is much to love and admire as well as to critique. Indeed, this music is about and for ideas. The more intimately one knows this tradition, the better position one is in to admire and love (and to critique and hate) it. Knowledge of this music is the ground that permits people to decide intelligently whether they will love this music.

I return to Immanuel Kant's *Critique of Judgement* to draw on one of his compelling arguments concerning the role of judgment in shaping one's musical commitments.²⁶ Kant assigns a principal role to reason and intelligence in determining aesthetic and artistic taste. There is a rational basis for love of the fine arts. Love is predicated on having come to a reasoned belief and commitment to specific artistic traditions and the works and practices that exemplify them. Kant was untroubled by notions of multiple artistic traditions but saw the arts within the European tradition of which he was a part. For him, this tradition, that we might refer to as Western classical music, art, drama, and the like, necessitates and evokes critical appraisal and judgment. One arrives at a musical taste of one's own in the belief that others ought to agree with one based on a knowledge and familiarity with this music and a wide awakesness to its possibilities and pitfalls.²⁷

Rather than a form of indoctrination in which the learner passively accepts a teacher's musical taste, cultivating musical appreciation is an invitation to exercise one's own judgment grounded in knowledge of this music. If appreciation is viewed as a form of love, it too needs to be grounded in knowledge and judgment. Following Kant, an education in Western classical music is necessarily an intellectual endeavor if one is to come to love it. John Shepherd arrives at a similar conclusion that music is one of the humanities and its study is a necessarily intellectual enterprise.²⁸ In the present anti-intellectual climate in general education, in which material ends are regarded as of prime importance, such an education in musical judgment is especially important.

Love arises out of other values that are expressed in Western classical music. Among these are formality, dignity, restraint, elegance, discipline, and intimacy. Formality concerns the emphasis on this music's structural properties and a focus on the musical ideas that comprise this music and outwards to reflect on the world around. Dignity has to do with the way in which musical events are often preplanned with a view to expressing that which reflects a sense of occasion and presents in ways that reflect the value of human beings. Restraint holds back on a natural penchant for self-exposure to express musical ideas and human feeling in captivating ways. Elegance reflects the grace of movement and carriage that projects a connoisseur's grasp of refinement and good taste—what Claude Lévi-Strauss might characterize figuratively as the culturally “cooked” rather than “raw.”²⁹ Discipline refers to rule-bound action that seeks to sustain this musical tradition. And intimacy captures the ways in which this music reaches deep into what Plato might think of as the “inmost soul” as one makes it one's own.³⁰

It is also crucial to highlight the roots from which Western classical music grows and the present context in which it is made. The reality of today's globalized music is that Western classical music has become an international tradition that has absorbed musics from Africa, Asia, Europe, North and South America, and Australasia. Musical traditions that in the past might have been separate are now often fused and changed by contact with other traditions. Popular musics, jazz, and other classical musics have also taken on elements from Western classical music. Film scores regularly employ a pastiche of musics side by side or woven together within the film score. Classical musicians such as Itzhak Perlman collaborate with popular musicians such as Billy Joel to perform klezmer music. Yo Yo Ma's *Silk Road Ensemble* brings together classical music and traditional and classical musicians of the East.³¹ As Rose Subotnik clarifies, Western classical music is rooted in vernacular music, in the music of ordinary people.³² The links between these vernacular traditions and the classical traditions that grow out of them need to provide mutual sustenance one to the other. It remains important to sustain the powerful connections between Western classical music

and the vernacular musics from which it springs and to which it contributes. In all this music and musicking one may see the expression of love on the part of musicians and audiences alike as musicians cultivate and meld their respective musical traditions.

In our time, the creation of musical identities is a crucial objective, component, and expression of musical and pedagogical love. Musical identity reflects the dialectical relationship between the claims of international music traditions such as Western classical music and local and vernacular music traditions that represent the specific places in which people live. Alexandra Kertz-Welzel posits that these tensions between nativist and local identities and an international consciousness of the world of musics need to be resolved within each society and culture.³³ Love is crucial to a sense of musical identity. We love that by which we are identified, with which we are intimately connected, and that represents who we are. Thinking of the intersection of Western classical and vernacular musics suggests that a love of the local musical customs and traditions that are markers of distinction and difference impels musicians and teachers to sustain and conserve local musical customs and traditions. Still, Western classical music also has a rich heritage in this country and is part of its cultural identity. It, too, needs to be cherished among the West's gifts to humanity if it is to continue to thrive. It, too, is worth knowing and loving as an element of one's musical identity.

LOVE OF WESTERN CLASSICAL MUSIC AS A MUSIC EDUCATIONAL VALUE

What does love of Western classical music suggest for music education? Teaching the young to love classical music hopes for their growing attachment and continuing support of it—a value consistent with a long tradition of music teachers who hoped to democratize classical musics and extend opportunities to the public to come to love them. Without a concerted focus on this tradition in general education in the West, classical music is likely to remain a peripheral and elite aspect of culture with a relatively small group of devotees and institutions as it has for much of its history. This was certainly the concern of advocates of music education who promoted its introduction into elementary school curricula in the early nineteenth century. Their hope was to enlarge access to classical music that had heretofore been primarily restricted to a privileged elite. For them, music appreciation represented a goal of introducing students to this music and through greater understanding, providing a basis for cultivating a love of it.

The ubiquity of popular mediated culture and the claims of teaching world music and other musical traditions have meant that the task of evoking a sense of attachment to classical music is challenging and Western classical music

sometimes receives short shrift in school music curricula. Still, the claims of democratic education suggest that it is important to cultivate a wide knowledge and love of Western classical music along with these other musics. Since teachers may often be faced with teaching Western classical music as a second or third musical language, it may be tempting to capitulate to popular taste rather than foster Western classical music. Doing this would shortchange students by failing to develop a knowledge of this music, enrich their musical imaginations, and stretch their minds and hearts. There will always be popular culture because it is, by definition, accessible and attractive to ordinary people. In the absence of education, however, the Western classical tradition would be known by a relative few. Democratic music educators who hope to widen access to this music for everyone regardless of the barriers that separate people are challenged to cultivate a knowledge and love for this music in general education through the institutions of family, religion, commerce, government, and the music profession and across the entire life span.³⁴

Love of Western classical music in music education is self-reflexive, clear-eyed about its shortcomings and failures, and desirous of remedying its faults and enlivening this music for its own sake and that of its exponents, devotees, and the wider public who may come to know it.³⁵ It hopes for a better world. It begets constructive criticism as it hopes to transform this music towards humane ends. It unmask evils of racism, sexism, classism, and xenophobia wherever they are manifest. In seeking the good, it gives voice to those who have been excluded from or marginalized in this music, and fosters the humanity for which, at its best, it stands. It welcomes everyone, regardless of age, gender, race, social class, ethnicity, or musical affiliation as participants. It hopes to forge bonds of affection between people within and without this musical tradition and humane ways in which this music is taught, learned, and practiced. It takes a catholic view of music *qua* music that encourages new ways of music making and taking. Its openheartedness and hospitality prompts connections with music of other traditions and different times and places.³⁶ It opens possibilities and transformative times and spaces for musical conversations between students and teachers as they come to know this and other musics.

THE ADVANTAGES AND DETRACTIONS OF LOVE

Among its advantages as a musical and educational value, love takes a humane and holistic view of the people involved in the instructional process and the subject matter, and it constitutes a source of pleasure for them. Although the subject matter is crucially important, finding opportunities to build on affection and attachment between teacher and student offers the prospect of personal

transformation and growth. One might also expect to encounter joy, happiness, and pleasure in love— aspects that can enhance motivation to teach and learn and the entire musical and education process. Love resonates with musicking and educating, an absorbing dynamic that brings delight in the moment and sustains teaching and learning over the long term. For those, such as Shinichi Suzuki, who believe wholeheartedly in its pedagogical efficacy, love is a means of inspiring teachers and students alike.³⁷ For Suzuki, there is the joy of Mozart coupled with the child's mastery of a violin piece. This is a pervasively positive view of music education that hopes not only to enrich music, but to enhance the hearts, minds, and lives of those who participate in it. As principled action, pedagogical love also constitutes a powerful means of moral development in the young and in society at large.

Fostering a love of Western classical music stretches minds and hearts beyond the ordinary to the extraordinary, towards musical grace, style, and virtuosity as manifest in this tradition, thereby fostering imagination and augmenting human experience. By extension, classical musicians need to stretch their musical imaginations beyond the confines of the classical tradition they practice and that are rooted in vernacular traditions to other musical traditions with which they are less familiar. These display their own values of grace, style, and virtuosity. This openheartedness enables musicians and teachers to find ways to bridge these traditions, create new forms of music, and open connections to those whose identity is bound up with these musics. There is something profoundly democratic and humane about bringing Western classical music to the attention of everyone, especially in a cultural milieu that is awash with the sights and sounds of popular musics. Opening learners' eyes and ears to this music that they may not otherwise experience in their ordinary lives outside concert halls, opera houses, and churches, or as they listen to digital music files and watch music videos, is an exercise in diminishing its otherness and welcoming it as part of the treasury of musics that are both their own and those of their fellow human beings. It is to create a musical sensibility that is human and humane.

Love's appeal as an educational value also needs to be tempered with a recognition of its dark side. It may be false, mask deceit and opportunism, and appear to be something that it is not. Given the power of attachment between teachers and their students, it may be easy to slip into confusing pedagogical and romantic love. At a time in which sensuality is admired and cultivated in expressions of contemporary culture, it may be especially difficult to maintain this distinction. Some teachers may abuse the trust of their students and prey upon them in the name of pedagogical love just as some students may set out to seduce their teachers. There is also the possibility that disinterested love may go against personal inclination. It is more difficult for teachers to work with students who are

unlovable, hostile, ungrateful, arrogant, and offensive than with those who are lovable, affectionate, grateful, teachable, and courteous. The same goes for students who may find that it goes against the grain to work with teachers who they find unattractive and whose approach is unappealing. Disinterested love may be more difficult to accomplish than interested love. Teachers may also pit musical traditions against one another and fail to grasp the currents that flow through them all. By their one-eyed approach to their own preferred musical tradition, or by taking an either/or mentality that divides rather than unites musical traditions, they may exclude others from participating in it and thereby coming to love it.

Although, on the surface, love may be an attractive music educational value, it may be insufficiently powerful a force in general education when taken alone, especially where disinterested love is also required. Its compelling advantages for enhancing motivation and helping to create a pleasurable educational environment may be offset by the dangers of false love that abuses trust and confuses pedagogical and romantic interest. Given the strength of desire, the hope in pedagogical love for spiritual, holistic, and principled thought and action may be overwhelmed. So, anticipated joy and pleasure may not eventuate, and instead, manipulation and discontinuity between professed values and actions may emerge. It may be impossible for teachers who are unfamiliar with Western classical music or who do not love it to teach it effectively. Even for those teachers who love it, as I have already noted, it may be difficult to bring students to a love of this musical tradition with which they may be unfamiliar. Students may not be sufficiently open-minded to the sights and sounds of Western classical music different from the musics with which they are acquainted; they may be unwilling to relinquish their prejudices that predispose them to resist difference. In their love for Western classical music, teachers may also fail to interrogate it critically and fall into a trap of manipulating or indoctrinating their students rather than opening their eyes and ears to musical possibilities. This approach may stunt their own and their students' musical development. Unless school music is integrated with other institutions through which musical taste is acquired, it may remain an outlier to pervasively mediated means of music education that may go in a different direction.

In sum, I have suggested that love is a complicated and ambiguous educational and musical value. It has contributions and detractions as a music educational value. Western classical music, as with every musical tradition, is imperfect and even inhumane in certain respects. Still, while its critics rightly point to its evils, there are also aspects worthy of our love, friendship, desire, and devotion. It remains, then, for musicians, music teachers and students, and the public generally to determine whether to love this music and how to take advantage of the best it offers while avoiding the worst. I love and treasure this music and long for

my students to love and treasure it too because I am persuaded of its value. For me, Western classical music constitutes a mansion in which I desire my students to dwell.³⁸ Still, as musicians, music teachers and students, and cultural policy makers, each of us is differently inclined and responsible for determining what to do in our specific situations. My discussion of the role of love in Western classical music is an invitation for others to explore how love is related to the host of other musical traditions in music education. Whatever our individual responses, love and reason combine to assist us in responding to the predicament: To love or not to love Western classical music: That is the question for music educators.

NOTES

¹Parts of this article are based on an earlier version of my discussion of love in Estelle R. Jorgensen, *Values and Music Education* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, in press), chapter 5.

²William Shakespeare, *Hamlet*, Act 3, scene 1. Shakespeare's soliloquy is given fresh meaning when uttered by black actors in the wake of recent racial protests in the United States. See #ToBeBlack, The Public Theater, NY, uploaded June 19, 2020, at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LbEvpe9suGg>. I am indebted to Deborah Bradley for bringing this video to my attention.

³For a fuller treatment of friendship, desire, and devotion, see Jorgensen, *Values and Music Education*, chap. 5.

⁴Estelle R. Jorgensen, "Western Classical Music and General Education," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 11, no. 2 (Fall 2003): 130–140.

⁵See James F. Daugherty, "Trouble in River City?" A Response to Estelle R. Jorgensen, "Western Classical Music and General Education". <http://cmed.faculty.ku.edu/~cmed/813/PMErresponse.pdf>, accessed November 24, 2019.

⁶For example, see John Shepherd, *Music as Social Text* (Cambridge, MA: Polity Press, 1991); Christopher Small, *Musicking: The Meanings of Performing and Listening* (Hanover, NH: Wesleyan University Press, 1998); Derek B. Scott, ed., *Music, Culture, and Society: A Reader* ([2000]; reprinted, New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2002); Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert, Richard Middleton, eds., *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2003); Tia DeNora, *After Adorno: Rethinking Music Sociology* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2003); John Shepherd and Kyle Devine, eds., *The Routledge Reader on the Sociology of Music* (London, UK: Routledge, 2015).

⁷Jorgensen, *Values and Music Education*; Israel Scheffler, *Reason and Teaching* (Indianapolis, IN: Bobbs-Merrill, 1973), 80.

⁸See Philip Alperson, "What Should One Expect from a Philosophy of Music Education," *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 25, no. 3 (Fall 1991): 215–242; and his "Robust Praxialism and the Anti-Aesthetic Turn," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 18, no. 2 (Fall 2010): 171–193.

⁹Plato, *Phaedrus*, in *Symposium and Phaedrus* transl., Benjamin Jowett (New York, NY: Dover Publications, 1993), has Socrates say, "If I find any man who is able to see a 'One

and Many' in nature, him I follow and 'walk in his footsteps as if he were a god.'" Jowett's translation of *Phaedrus* is available online at <http://classics.mit.edu/Plato/phaedrus.html>. Accessed June 28, 2018.

¹⁰See, for example, F. H. Shera, *The Amateur in Music* (London, UK: Oxford University Press, 1939); Noah Adams, *Piano Lessons: Music, Love and True Adventures* (New York, NY: Delta Book, 1996); Wayne Booth, *For the Love of It: Amateuring and Its Rivals* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1999); Johann Heinrich Pestalozzi, Excerpts from *The Evening Hour of a Hermit and Leonard and Gertrude* in Robert Ulich, ed., *Three Thousand Years of Educational Wisdom: Selections from Great Documents*, 2nd ed. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1954), 480–507; Maria Montessori, *The Discovery of the Child*, trans., M. Joseph Costelloe (New York, NY: Ballantine, 1967), and her *The Absorbent Mind*, trans., Claude A. Claremont (New York, NY: Dell, 1967); Max van Manen, *The Tact of Teaching: The Meaning of Pedagogical Thoughtfulness* (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1991); Shinichi Suzuki, *Nurtured by Love: A New Approach to Education*, trans., Waltraud Suzuki (New York, NY: Exposition, 1969). Donald Phillip Verene, *The Art of Humane Education* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2002) posits qualities of pedagogical eloquence and authority as qualities of humane education and Stephen L. Carter, *Civility: Manners, Morals, and the Etiquette of Democracy* (New York, NY: Basic Books, 1998) argues that love for one's fellow human beings is at the root of the value of civility which is crucial to democratic discourse and society. On music appreciation, see Percy A. Scholes, *Music, The Child and the Masterpiece: A Comprehensive Handbook of Aims and Methods in All that is Usually Called 'Musical Appreciation'* (London, UK: Oxford University Press, Humphrey Milford, 1935).

¹¹"love, n.1." OED Online. March 2018. Oxford University Press. <http://www.oed.com.proxyiub.uits.iu.edu/view/Entry/110566?rskey=Y5bLr8&result=1&isAdvanced=false> Accessed May 02, 2018).

¹²"love, n.1." OED Online.

¹³See Nancy Ellen Abrams, *A God that Could be Real: Spirituality, Science, and the Future of our Planet* (Boston, MA: Beacon Press, 2015) on a notion of God compatible with the science of emergence.

¹⁴Among my colleagues at the Indiana University Jacobs School of Music, Menahem Pressler was beloved by his students. His love of the music he taught and performed was legendary. This love was exemplified in the care with which he approached his students and the repertoire, his devotion to his pianistic heritage, his artistic expectations of his students and of himself in his long performing career as a chamber musician and soloist. See William Brown, *Menahem Pressler: Artistry in Piano Teaching* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2008).

¹⁵"love, n.1". OED Online.

¹⁶William Shakespeare, *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, Act 1, Scene 1, available at <http://shakespeare.mit.edu/midsummer/full.html>. Accessed September 13, 2018.

¹⁷Samuel Taylor Coleridge, *Coleridge's Notebooks: A Selection*, ed., Seamus Perry (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2002) III. 70, (1809) also cited in "love, n.1." OED Online.

¹⁸Virginia Woolf, *Between the Acts* (New York, NY: Harcourt, Brace and Co., 1941), 92, also cited in “love, n.1.” OED Online. This book was published shortly after Woolf’s death and the manuscript had not been finally revised by the author. A more recent edition edited by Mark Hussey was published by Cambridge University Press in 2011.

¹⁹“love, n.1.” OED Online.

²⁰Ibid.

²¹Nel Noddings, *Caring: A Relational Approach to Ethics and Moral Education*, 2nd edition updated (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2013). Noddings originally published this book with the same publisher under the title, *Caring: A Feminine Approach to Ethics and Moral Education* (1984). While updated and possibly more inclusive, something is also lost in this revised title.

²²In Estelle R. Jorgensen, “On a Choice-based Instructional Typology in Music,” *Journal of Research in Music Education* 29 (1981): 97–102, I hypothesize that mutual attraction of teacher and student is a more productive basis for musical instruction than its logical opposite of mutual antipathy.

²³Deanne Bogdan, “The Shiver-Shimmer Factor: Musical Spirituality, Emotion, and Education,” *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 18, no. 2 (Fall 2010): 111–129; her article in this issue, “Incarnating the Shiver-Shimmer Factor: Toward a Dialogical Sublime.”

²⁴Email communication from Deanne Bogdan to the author, June 25, 2020.

²⁵Graham MacPhail, “Too Much Noise in the Classroom? Towards a Praxis of Conceptualization,” *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 27, no 2 (Fall 2018): 176–198.

²⁶Immanuel Kant, *The Critique of Judgement*, trans., James Creed Meredith ([1928]; reprinted, New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1982).

²⁷On the idea of wide-awakeness, see Maxine Greene, *Releasing the Imagination: Essays on Education, the Arts, and Social Change* (San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 1995), 43; Keith Swanwick, *The Arts in Education: Dreaming or Wide Awake* (London, UK: University of London Institute of Education, 1983).

²⁸John Shepherd, “Music and the Last Intellectuals,” *The Journal of Aesthetic Education* 25, no. 3 (Fall 1991): 95–114.

²⁹Claude Lévi-Strauss, *The Raw and the Cooked*, trans., John and Doreen Weightman ([1969]; reprint, Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1983).

³⁰Plato, *Republic*, translated, Robin Waterfield (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1993), para. 401d. On intimacy in music education, see Eleni Lapidaki, “Towards the Discovery of Contemporary Trust and Intimacy in Higher Music Education,” in Iris M. Yob and Estelle R. Jorgensen, eds., *Humane Music Education for the Common Good* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2020).

³¹See *Itzhak*, Alison Chernick, director. Documentary film, (USA: Greenwich Entertainment, 2018); *The Music of Strangers: Yo Yo Ma and the Silk Road Ensemble*, Morgan Neville, director. Documentary film (USA: Tremolo Productions, 2016).

³²See Rose Rosengard Subotnik, “The Challenge of Contemporary Music,” in Philip Alperson, ed., *What is Music? An Introduction to the Philosophy of Music* (University Park, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, [1987] 1994).

³³Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, *Globalizing Music Education: A Framework* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2018).

³⁴Estelle R. Jorgensen, "On Values and Life's Journey through Music: Reflections on Eriksons' Life Stages and Music Education," paper presented to the 33rd World Conference of the International Society for Music Education, Baku, Azerbaijan, July 15–20, 2018. Also, in Karin S. Hendricks and June Boyce-Tillman, eds., *Authentic Connection: Music, Spirituality, and Wellbeing* (Bern, Switzerland: Peter Lang, to be released 2021).

³⁵After racial and social protests accompanying the Covid-19 pandemic in the United States, music critics documented racial issues in classical music that require urgent attention. See, for example, Joshua Barone, "Opera Can No Longer Ignore Its Race Problem: As the Industry Rebuilds from the Coronavirus Pandemic It Must Face Long-simmering Issues of Representation," *New York Times*, July 16, 2020, <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/07/16/arts/music/opera-race-representation.html>, accessed August 5, 2020; Anthony Tommasini, "To Make Orchestras More Diverse, End Blind Auditions," *New York Times*, July 16, 2020, <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/07/16/arts/music/blind-auditions-orchestras-race.html>, accessed August 5, 2020; Zachary Woolfe and Joshua Barone, "Black Artists on How to Change Classical Music: Nine Performers Describe the Steps they Recommend to Begin Transforming a White-dominated Field," *New York Times*, July 16, 2020, <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/07/16/arts/music/black-classical-music-opera.html>, accessed August 5, 2020. Recently published scholarship also recognizes the legacy of racism in music theory and the need for systemic and structural change. See, for example, Philip A Ewell, "Music Theory and the White Racial Frame," *Music Theory Online* 26, no. 2 (September 2020). DOI: 10.30535/mto.26.2.4.

³⁶On hospitality, see Patrick Schmidt, "A Rabi, an Imam, and a Priest Walk into a Bar . . . Or, What Can Music Education Philosophy Learn from Comparative Cosmopolitanism?" *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 21, no. 1 (Spring 2013): 23–40.

³⁷Suzuki, *Nurtured by Love*, 8, states: "What is man's ultimate direction in life? It is to look for love, truth, virtue, beauty."

³⁸Scheffler, *Reason and Teaching*, 80.