On Mediated Qualitative Scholarship and Marginalized Voices in Music Education

Estelle R. Jorgensen

Indiana University

jorgense@indiana.edu

Abstract

This chapter addresses two interrelated questions concerning some of the characteristic features that should exemplify mediated qualitative scholarship in music education and ways in which mediated qualitative scholarship can enable marginalized voices in music education to be heard. Mediated scholarship is broadly defined as scholarship undertaken and/or disseminated through the arts and contemporary media. The term "marginalized voices" refers to those subjects, perspectives, media, approaches, objectives, and modes of dissemination that are not valued, studied, or accounted for in music education research. Drawing on two examples of work utilizing film and video and published as chapters in this book, I examine the possibilities and challenges for mediated qualitative scholarship in music education that highlights the voices of those not otherwise heard.

In this chapter, I unpack two interrelated questions: What features should characterize mediated qualitative scholarship in music education?[1] How can mediated qualitative scholarship enable marginalized voices in music education to be heard? Contemporary media offer possibilities for good or evil. I suggest that it is important for qualitative researchers in music education to approach these media in a clear-eyed manner that seeks to avoid the worst while taking advantage of the best. After analyzing some of the features of mediated qualitative scholarship, I examine its possibilities for music education scholarship in highlighting marginalized voices. Building on recent qualitative scholarship in music education focused on marginalized voices, I draw on two examples of mediated qualitative scholarship that utilize the possibilities of film and are published as chapters in this book.[2] This work illustrates ways in which marginalized voices can be impacted by mediated scholarship and challenges such scholarship present to music educators.

Some preliminary definitions

First, some definitions. By qualitative research, I think of the various traditions of inquiry and methodologies that lie in the middle ground between philosophical reflection on the one hand and scientific and quantitative research on the other.[3] These approaches exemplify a search for meaning, depth of understanding, and subjective perspective on knowledge and human experience. Publicly shared knowledge is also sought, probed, and tested, and researchers focus upon illumining specific situations and listening to the voices of those within them.

Scholarship in music education has traditionally been thought of as "research," namely the disciplined, systematic, and thorough investigation of a subject (person or thing) and an

objective and dispassionate accounting of the evidence or defense of a specific perspective on it. In this traditional view, each investigation is reported and disseminated as an addition to or critique of extant knowledge in a field. It is conducted within the frame of generally agreed upon principles within the scholarly community. Publicly disseminated results are adjudicated critically by this community. Scholarship may begin as a personal and even idiosyncratic journey undertaken within a social context. Ultimately, the "proof" of its quality is in the "pudding" of its results. I think of process and product as inextricably interconnected in scholarship so that the "medium" constitutes, in part, the "message." Judgments made about what is achieved and its merits involve propositional knowledge (that such-and-such is the case). Still, propositional knowledge does not suffice. Judgments are also made in the process of searching for truth (understood as a small t). Knowledge concerns the whole of human knowing that lies beyond propositional, ordinary, or explanatory discourse. Decades ago, Susanne Langer understood that propositional discourse is limited. Qualitative scholarship also needs to include what she termed "presentational" symbols. These symbols are what we might think of as performative, enacted and expressed through the arts, religions, myths, rituals, and dreams, and concerned with human feeling.[4] For me, scholarship comprises propositional and procedural knowledge in a unified whole. This whole is also embodied, or, as Liora Bresler and her colleagues might say, "knowing bodies" and "moving minds."[5]

By mediated scholarship in music education, I draw on Kurt Blaukopf's notion of the "mediamorphosis*"* of music whereby music is transformed into a global phenomenon by mass media.[6] This process also impacts music education scholarship. In a growing literature, music educators have addressed aspects of the mediation of music education practice and scholarship.[7] Philosophers of music education such as Elizabeth Gould and June Boyce Tillman have

employed performative pieces in and as philosophy.[8] Gould and Leonard Tan and Mengchen Lu have also argued for the limits of words and the importance of performative philosophy.[9] The nature of the medium (and the manner of the scholarship) is interconnected with the substance of the research. Words may even be ancillary or even irrelevant to the medium which is the focus of attention and has its own truth or significance. In suggesting this possibility, the very nature of truth and truthfulness as historically understood is challenged. Rather than the narrowly construed propositional discourse expected of traditional scholarship, ambiguity, subjectivity, and multiplicity characterize truth derived from musical study and performance and the various forms of qualitative research.

I use the term "marginalized voices" to refer to those subjects, perspectives, media, approaches, objectives, and modes of dissemination that are not valued, studied, or accounted for in research in music education. Among these are those associated with women, adults and the old, ethnic, linguistic, religious minorities, the differently gendered and abled. Although the descriptor "mediated" refers especially to scholarship conducted and disseminated through today's media, it is important to recognize that scholarship has always been framed within technologies. Beyond the spoken word communicated in ordinary discursive speech that is memorized and transmitted from one person to another, the written word has been preserved in stone inscriptions, papyri, scrolls, printed books that were later mass produced, and now through recorded audiovisual and digital means. These technologies have constrained as they have also enabled various modes of thought. In so doing, they have too often silenced women and marginalized their ways of seeing and hearing the world. For example, Mary Beard points to the silencing of women's authoritative voices in the spoken word from antiquity. She cites Homer's *Odyssey,* in which Penelope questions the judgment of her son, Telemachus. He commands her

to “go back into your quarters, and take up your own work, the loom and the distaff…speech will be the business of men, all men, of me most of all: for mine is the power in this household.” As Beard comments, “off she goes, back upstairs.”[10] Throughout history, even as their tongues were sometimes cut out to preclude them from speaking, women subverted male prohibitions on their speech by communicating in ways open to them. For example, as Beard notices, Philomena wove the story of her rapist into a tapestry.[11] Hildegard of Bingen also recorded her dreams and visions as she set them to music and sang them.[12] Nevertheless, these other means of representation have not carried the weight of the authoritative voice of scholarship valued in the academy.

Rescuing, reclaiming, and forwarding stories and performances of marginalized voices not only of women but of ethnic, linguistic, and religious minorities, the differently abled and gendered, and those of color, and forwarding presentational and performative discourse as a central aspect of qualitative scholarship in music education are central tasks of mediated qualitative research. It is critical to notice that in taking this position, mediated qualitative scholarship is at odds with scientific protocols and objectives in music education research that have been normative. Whereas quantitative and scientific researchers are interested in such things as measures of central tendency, typical instances, rational approaches to thought, systematic examinations of phenomena, and objective measurement, mediated qualitative researchers are intrigued by atypical subjects who represent different and divergent perspectives that are understood contextually and intuitively and where phenomena are not easily quantified or objectively observed. Rather than focusing on typical music educational subjects and commonplaces, mediated qualitative research mines previously unheard, unnoticed, or ignored

perspectives of women, adults and the elderly, ethnic and religious minorities, people of color, and the differently and gendered and abled.

Features of mediated qualitative scholarship

Among the qualities of mediated qualitative scholarship, I begin with its artful character and performative and presentational values. Art does not equate scholarship: both have differing emphases and functions.[13] Nevertheless, the borders between them are porous, or as Claire Detels puts it, "soft," in that they meld into each other.[14] Vibrant depictions of musical and educational ideas and activities can be enacted and presented for our contemplation through artistic creations. These include documentary films, recordings, podcasts, dramas, paintings, photographs, musical compositions and improvisations, constructed and curated artifacts and musical instruments, dance choreographies and performances, and stories and poems. Mediated scholarship "brings alive" ideas, people, and events under study and its worth can be evaluated publicly. Mediation not only impacts the presentational quality of scholarship but also comprises the actual stuff of the research itself.

I think of a documentary film, *Manakamana*, by Stephanie Spray and Pacho Velez released in 2013 by the Sensory Ethnography Lab at Harvard University. This film depicts Nepalese people and animals on a gondola journey to the famed mountaintop Manakamana temple.[15] Our interest is in a contextual depiction of a religious pilgrimage by people who might otherwise be regarded as "other" or "foreign" by western audiences. The film depicts their journey up to the temple and their return to the valley below. For an hour-and-a-half, viewers focus on the interior of the gondola. We glimpse mountain scenery in the background and a chicken being carried to the temple; we hear the creaks of the moving gondola, birdsong, and the

conversations of the pilgrims (with English subtitles provided). The film is gripping as a sensory ethnography that provides a virtual experience of what one might see, hear, and feel if one were to travel with them in this gondola.

Also, mediated qualitative scholarship is a humane and relational undertaking having to do with human feeling. It needs to communicate and express human emotion/thought/sense that escape the limits of words and can be enacted as well as thought. Since it requires human relationship and interaction, it necessitates the researcher's empathy and obligation to the subjects of the study. One incurs obligations to one's subjects who disclose intimate details of their lives, thoughts, attitudes, and feelings. In possession of this information, one is obligated to care about the subjects and participants who are interviewed and guard carefully their shared perspectives. There is a personal bond that now goes beyond the duration of the study. Mediated qualitative research allows researchers to come especially close to their subjects, as in the film of the villagers going to the mountain temple. This intimacy implies an even greater responsibility and obligation to subjects than would be the case were qualitative research accounts merely verbal and reported in print.[16] An ethic of caring plays out in the ways in which the stories are told and practices are revealed and in the continuing obligations incurred through the relationships formed during the research study. It is also likely that researcher empathy and caring for subjects requires commitments that transcend the period of the study. This approach resonates with Carol Gilligan's and Nel Noddings' descriptions of women's ethical commitments as profoundly relational and situated.[17]

Further, mediated qualitative research is a search for wisdom, an integrated whole that is manifestly unified, cogent, articulated, and coherent. Alfred North Whitehead describes wisdom as the epitome of generalization.[18] The romance of intuitive thought combines with the

instrumentalism of technical understanding to blend in a wide and deep grasp or understanding of what is crucially important or significant in life. Knowledge is contextualized in a whole that conveys what Susanne Langer terms "vital import."[19] The parts fit together in an articulated whole such that the whole is greater than the sum of its parts and the whole is animated and lives in the experience of those who encounter it. For this reason, some philosophers such as Jean Amos Comenius think of wisdom through the metaphor of enlightenment, as light that fills the mind.[20] Digging beneath the superficial and apparent state of things, qualitative researchers seek to understand those things that might otherwise remain out of view. As they focus on what Parker Palmer refers to as a "subject of great worth," these researchers also want to grasp its wider context.[21] Mediated qualitative research appears as a compelling unity in which veracity and significance seem to dwell. The ambiguity and artfulness of this work means that what is seen, heard, felt, and engaged with is subjectively known in differing ways. The viewers of the filmed temple visit to which I have referred may see this documentary differently in terms of their various "assumptive frames of reference."[22] Still, in this diversity of perspectives, especially in dialogue about it, viewers may also discover shared convictions. For example, conversing about the Spray and Velez film may reveal the importance of the temple visit to these pilgrims, their joy in the little things of life as they enjoy their ice creams on their way home, the wife's demure excitement in accompanying her husband in this rare adventure, and the husband's pride in the pilgrimage. In seeing this panoply of differences, it is also possible to better grasp our common humanity.[23] As I watch this film, I realize that despite our evident cultural differences, we share the kinship of humanity. I glimpse myself in these others and they in me.

Moreover, mediated qualitative research is context-specific. Its purposes and methods depend importantly on the circumstances in which mediation occurs. Increasingly, the media's prevalence enables qualitative researchers to work together virtually, across different times and contexts, to conduct research virtually rather than in face-to-face situations, and to report it in a host of audio-visual ways.[24] Aside from matters concerning the suitability of specific qualitative studies to mediation, the protection of human subjects is also a crucial consideration in determining whether or how identities should be disclosed. Acknowledging the distinction between technologically mediated and face-to-face communication also impacts how one treats one's data. For example, one may distinguish between face-to-face interviews in physical settings that are familiar to the researcher and virtual interviews conducted over technological platforms that may be manipulated by others or across different time zones that affect the disparate contexts in which these interviews are conducted.[25] Purposes and means of mediated qualitative research depend on the specific situations being studied and the research traditions and methods being employed. For these reasons, mediated qualitative scholarship requires specific protocols that respect the nature of the media in which studies are undertaken and/or disseminated.

The media are mixed blessings. For example, Facebook and Twitter have offered users an opportunity to connect with people socially; they have also proved amenable to political manipulation and have polarized people into virtual groups that may divide society and cause psychological and physical harm.[26] Virtual reality can only approximate physical lived reality, and while it offers benefits such as facilitating conversations between differently-abled people or those who are physically distant from one another, there is mounting evidence of technological addiction and social and economic disruption that threaten people's livelihood and the quality of

their lives. By dividing people in terms of those who have access to digital environments and those who do not, mediated qualitative research may disadvantage those without access. In scholarship, free-access research publications currently in vogue purport to offer cost-free access to readers and yet can exploit the people and organizations that offer them. It always costs to publish and eventually someone pays—the author, the editor, the publisher, or the individual or organization that underwrites the publication. Innovations have unexpected consequences. Given the potential benefits and detractions of mediation, it may be fortunate that tradition and inertia constitute roadblocks to widening the sorts of creative demonstrations that might count as scholarship in qualitative research. Qualitative researchers will also need to attend to the crucial practical tasks of stipulating the conditions under which mediation is warranted or appropriate.

Mediated qualitative research and marginalized voices in music education

Imagine if instead of reporting qualitative scholarship exclusively in print publications, other artistic means in alternative media formats are also employed in music education. One may describe in words a narrative or an ethnographic situation such as the temple pilgrims in the Spray and Velez film, but words alone cannot convey the conviction, impact, imperative, and vitality of audiovisual means. Creating a film in the way of a sensory ethnography conveys the immediacy and context of a music educational experience in ways that an essay cannot do. The academy has long regarded the composition of music as a suitable academic endeavor in music degrees, albeit accompanied by an expository essay. It seems eminently reasonable, then, to include an array of creative activities within mediated qualitative scholarship. One could envisage performance, improvisation, dance choreography and performance, film, visual art, plays, the design of computer programs that run artificial intelligence, among other possibilities.

Digital formats provide a rainbow of possibilities that demonstrate the skills, sense of style, and taste that ought to exemplify scholarship in all its forms. Each creation carries an import that is imaginatively grasped in differing ways by critical observers. When accompanied by an expository essay that explains the work propositionally and demonstrates more traditionally the authoritative nature of the investigation, this panoply of artistic possibilities and formats might reveal the artistic as well as didactic aspects of qualitative scholarship. It would also forward the thoughts and practices of those who diverge from most people at a given place and time and facilitate a study of the many different examples of what counts as music education around the world.

I think of Mary Jane Doherty's short film, *Let the River Run*, screened at the Narrative in Music Education 6 conference in Boston, Massachusetts, May, 2018.[27] In their chapter, Tawnya Smith and Mary Jane Doherty, "Narrative in Film," present Smith's interview with Doherty regarding the ways in which the story of the Boston Children's Chorus and its members were woven into this film. Traditionally, qualitative researchers might not count the documentary film as a piece of narrative inquiry but would insist, instead, on the necessity of a discursive exposition of the sort that Smith and Doherty's chapter on Doherty's film narrative represents. Such a reading would lead them to regard Smith and Doherty's narrative discussion as parasitic on Doherty's documentary film. For them, the film qua scholarship is not sufficiently self-reflexive and its meaning is too ambiguous to constitute a basis for truth claims. Alternatively, one might think more expansively of Doherty's film and Smith and Doherty's chapter as two distinctive scholarly projects: Doherty's published documentary film and Smith and Doherty's published research interview. In this reading, Doherty's film qua narrative inquiry feels closer to Spray and Velez's sensory ethnography, albeit with a narrative superimposed upon it. Smith and

Doherty's chapter represents a standard interview study focused on the narrative employed in making a documentary film.

If one is serious about including marginalized voices in qualitative music education research, the definition of qualitative scholarship would need to expand beyond traditional conceptions to allow a documentary film to stand alone without explanatory words as a legitimate scholarly undertaking. How can this be? It becomes clear in reading the transcript of Smith's interview with Doherty that Doherty seeks to narrate a story through film. In Doherty's film, one glimpses children and adults in rehearsal and concert, children working out theoretical problems, and adults reacting in the midst of rehearsal situations. One sees children chatting informally and authoritatively with Doherty in their bedrooms or other spaces outside their rehearsals about subjects as different as what music is to how they use their voices in singing together with others and what this experience means to them. We see them, as Panagiotis Kanellopoulos might regard them, as "little philosophers of music" who reflect intelligently about the musical experiences they are undergoing in the chorus and its ancillary musical and educational activities.[28] Doherty's film shows the viewer far more than Smith and Doherty could ever capture in words. We see participants in the Boston Children's Chorus animated, moving, gazing expressively, gesturing, laughing, with faces pensive or lit with joy. The immediacy, depth of meaning, and feeling are there in an array of settings, and Doherty's film artfully presents this array of experiences to us in a manner that defies reduction to words. In each viewing, I notice different things. Musicians know that much of significance hangs in the little details, the small moments and nuances that are irreducible to discursive language. These moments occur frequently in music making and animate the situations in which they occur. Building even this short film of 27 minutes would encompass hours of filming and editing. Had

she sought to tell a different story, Doherty might have filmed an entire rehearsal or sequence of rehearsals, a rehearsal and concert, or a sequence of concerts, or she might have shown us just the interviews with the children. Rather than do this, in seeking to tell the story of this multi-ethnic and multi-aged congregation of singers, she chooses to tell a story with an ambiguous meaning suggested in its figurative title, *Let the River Run.* In so doing, she invites imagination to do its work.[29] Mary Reichling thinks of imagination as encompassing thinking, feeling, perception, and intuition in a wholistic experience.[30] Doherty's documentary film can prompt all these modes of knowing.

The Smith and Doherty narrative chapter is of a different order. Here, Smith probes what Doherty is up to in this filmic narrative. How is she setting up the story? How does story telling in this film differ from other academic conversations and filmic storytelling? Smith asks Doherty to ponder what she is up to and how and why she does her work. Having had the privilege of reading the unedited transcripts for this interview study, I focus on the words that are spoken. The improvisatory nature of language replete with the immediacy and inevitably incomplete sentences and informal language conveys the eagerness and haste of the spoken word, with words sometimes tumbling out over others interspersed by pungent pauses or affirmations. Smith and Doherty are in a search for truth, although as with Doherty's film, ambiguity will also be present. My construction of their conversation may differ from theirs, given my positionality to the project. Now, with Doherty's film in mind, I imagine viewing a documentary film of their conversation. I can see and hear in their gestures, animation, the pauses and laughs, the points of surprise and self-doubt, or when serendipity overtakes the interview and the conversation moves into full flight. I can see how they relate together, how they sit and talk, how they are dressed, where they are meeting, and a constellation of other contextual elements that as human beings

we interpret in watching people in conversation. Embodied words live in ways that the words on the transcript before me can never accomplish. In the process of embodiment, words are personified and come alive as human evocation. Situated and contextualized, spoken words convey so much more than unembodied words; they take on even more power and poignancy than words on a transcript before me.

At first glance, it may seem that in the interview transcript, imagination is directed to principal ideas whereas in the film, the imagination is unfettered. Still, things are not this simple. In my writing about Tolkien's *Lord of the Rings* film trilogy, I notice that film can be directive, didactic, and linear and can constrict the imagination in ways that my reading of Tolkien's novels does not do.[31] In her conversation with Smith, Doherty also points to this linearity as a feature of storytelling. In a visually oriented world, sight may overpower sound, and a reader may imagine Tolkien's novels in ways that differ from the filmic representations. Whether in written word or film, much depends on the open-mindedness, intuition, and imagination of the reader or watcher. Each iteration, whether film or discursive presentation, is more than the other and lacking in one respect or another. I imagine that if a documentary film of Smith's interview of Doherty were to be shown to music teachers, these teachers would likely find much to talk about afterwards. I also imagine that this conversation may differ from one that might flow from a presentation of their chapter in this book. Nor is it surprising when those attracted to the possibilities of film and written narrative regard them as mutually complementary or in tension, a case of "this with that" in which both may be useful ways of grasping what people are up to.[32]

As a humane undertaking, mediated qualitative research can give voice to those whose lives and work have been marginalized and silenced, particularly the many women who have contributed to music education but whose perspectives and contributions are too often

overlooked. The history of American music education as told in widely read histories by Michael Mark and Charles Gary and James Keene often focuses on institutional developments often led by men.[33] Sondra Wieland Howe's history of women in music education begins to include more voices of women.[34] Still, many gaps remain. I think, for example, of the work of Beatrice Landeck, one of the important editors of textbooks for general music classes in schools. Her life was devoted to collecting songs for school use such as the basal series, *Making Music Your Own*, editing song collections, and providing materials for music teachers. I used her music texts in my general music classes in the 1970s but never met her in person. When I was working with Jane Roland Martin on her book, *School Was Our Life*, I encountered Landeck unexpectedly.[35] Landeck was Martin's music teacher at "Little Red" in New York City. The approaches Landeck used were progressive and humane, and I wished that her story might be told. Yet she, like too many women whose practical work in music education was recognized as important in their time, has been largely forgotten. Had music educators valued contributions beyond academic and intellectual discussions, her story might have been told and preserved for the future. Martin's study reminds me of the importance of telling the stories of these unsung heroines in the vibrant ways available to us in today's mediated technologies. It suggests the importance of integrity, veracity, fidelity, and carefulness of that research and its reporting. In telling and sharing these stories, it also incurs obligations to those whose stories are being told and forges relationships that live into the future after the study is concluded.[36] Present-day technologies provide the means of telling these stories. I hear Doherty say that the films that she makes cross genres and may not pass muster in academic film making. She seems to be speaking as practitioner rather than scholar. Yet her work reveals the intimacy, trust, and humanity of her subjects, and in bridging the worlds of scholarship and storytelling, Doherty opens a window into the lives of

practical music makers whose contributions to music education are significant but who might otherwise be forgotten.

The humanity of mediated qualitative research is also apparent in Randi Margrethe Eidsaa's short video entitled, "Musical Dialogues in Conflict Areas: Narratives from Sarajevo," that accompanies her chapter in this book.[37] Presented at the Narrative in Music Education 6 conference at Boston University, 2019, this video describes a multimedia, multi-institutional, and multi-specialist collaborative project between music education researchers based at the University of Adgar in Norway and performers and scholars at the music academy in Sarajevo, Bosnia-Herzegovina. The project consisting of dialogues and performances explores the meaning of music and music education at a time of conflict. In a bloody civil war, the musicians refuse to "let the music die" and faculty and students persist in making music where just to travel to the academy was a dangerous journey and they had to endure repeated bombings of the academy. Eidsaa gives us a percussive soundtrack evocative of gunfire set behind piano and song performances including William Blake's "Songs of Innocence on Another's Sorrow," and visuals based on animated stills. The sound track is expressive of sorrow and hope and is set behind still pictures of the words spoken by those who recalled their memories of musicking at this difficult time. Rather than include a researcher narrative or live interviews, viewers see a sequence of slides describing the project and revealing some of themes derivative from the investigation. For me, one slide of a cemetery with the graves of the many who died in the conflict is particularly moving because of its reminder of the futility of war and the inhumanity of too much human conduct. Unfettered by spoken words, the soundtrack allows viewers to grasp the powerful role of music as a means of solace during a time when those living through the conflict were searching for normalcy and hope that the violence and death would soon end.

In Eidsaa's video, the cross-disciplinary conjunction of performance and scholarship, with a sound track full of feeling and evocative in its pathos, leads us on a journey in search of wisdom or an integrated whole. Although Eidsaa's brief description of the narrative project directs attention to specific details, the video seeks to project an articulated or integrated whole, to move as much as inform us. For me, this wholistic and ambiguous video presentation is, as in the Smith and Doherty collaboration, more than as well as less than its didactic text.

Matters regarding the context-specific technologies and their relation to the specific projects and protocols in mediated qualitative research are also raised for music education. Large collaborative research projects facilitated by virtual as well as face-to-face relationships have emerged in the field, and Eidsaa's study fits within this growing trend.[38] Whereas we hear the voices of the children and adults in Doherty's film, Eidsaa's video gives us disembodied words and relies on the musical sound track behind the animated still pictures and texts to move and instruct us. The Eidsaa study illustrates a richly collaborative, cross cultural, and international undertaking possible because of an array of contemporary technologies and documentary techniques. Archival sources and animated still pictures imbue still photographs with life. The absence of audio-visual recordings of dialogues seems to create a distance or remove from subjects. By contrast, Doherty's film draws on live filming in which the camera seems to move in toward participants at some moments and away from them at others, an important point that Smith makes in her interview with Doherty. These two examples reveal the different resources and technological expertise from that of a professional filmmaker such as Doherty and Eidsaa's musical and educational expertise using simpler techniques at her disposal. Issues of the protection of human subjects and privacy also determine who can be shown and how. Where

presentation is an objective, collaboration between professional filmmakers and music education qualitative researchers can enrich the research product.

In regarding media as a mixed blessing and given the primacy of the written word in much academic scholarship, qualitative researchers in music education face significant challenges in undertaking mediated qualitative scholarship and broadening the definition of what counts as research. Before uncritically embracing technologies, conversations among researchers in music education are needed to determine specific characteristics of creative demonstrations and media formats deemed appropriate to qualitative scholarship. Developing the specific rules appropriate to mediated qualitative research obviously requires media skills on the part of music education researchers. As new generations of digital natives enter music education, I suspect that researchers may be less constrained by media possibilities than are digital immigrants. The growing commitment to technology and technological expertise among music education researchers could result in the development of new methodologies and alternative formats that might be employed in qualitative research. I think, for example, of the possibilities of sensory ethnography as a qualitative research methodology possible because of the range of media now available. Qualitative researchers might also call upon the expertise of specialists in mass media and associated artistic areas in drawing up expectations for each of these formats. If appropriate media protocols are to be developed, it will be necessary to rethink qualitative research more divergently and work though the impediments to broadening the array of what counts as mediated qualitative research.

In sum, I have sketched some characteristics of mediated qualitative scholarship, provided examples of how music educators might employ qualitative research as a means of highlighting the voices of those who have not been heard or seen centrally in music education

research. In so doing, I have indicated theoretical and practical challenges that need to be addressed. Despite the challenges, it is possible to broaden "what counts" as qualitative scholarship and diversify the processes and products of mediated qualitative research. In so doing, the voices of those who otherwise would be marginalized or silenced can be heard. While the elders may "dream dreams," I hope that those who are younger may "see visions" of how qualitative research might otherwise be undertaken and disseminated in our time.[39]

Notes

[1] This question builds on a question raised in Estelle R. Jorgensen, "Why is it Important to have a Media Journal in Music Education?" *Media Journal of Music Education,* 1 (2017), http: http://hosted.usf.edu/mjme/why-it-is-important-to-have-a-media-journal-in-music-education/, namely, "What should count as mediated scholarship in music education."

[2] Brent C. Talbot, ed., *Marginalized Voices in Music Education* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2018) includes voices of African Americans and those in non-stereotypical musical roles, women, women in non-stereotypical music education roles, the differently gendered, men singing in non-stereotypical ways, the differently abled, and intersections among these differences.

[3] On qualitative research methods, see, for example, Sharan B. Merriam and Elizabeth J. Tisdell, *Qualitative Research: A Guide to Design and Implementation*, 4th ed. (San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 2016).

[4] Susanne K. Langer, *Philosophy in a New Key: A Study in the Symbolism of Reason, Rite, and Art.* 3rd ed. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1957).

[5] Liora Bresler, ed., *Knowing Bodies, Moving Minds: Towards Embodied Teaching and Learning* (Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Kluwer, 2004).

[6] See Kurt Blaukopf, "Westernisation, Modernisation, and the Mediamorphosis of Music," *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 25, no. 1/2 (1994): 337-45. doi:10.2307/836950; Kurt Blaukopf, *Musical Life in a Changing Society*, rev. ed., trans. David Marinelli (Portland, OR: Amadeus Press, 1992), 171-177, 247-270.

[7] Recent published books on technology and music education include: Andrew R. Brown, *Music Technology and Education: Amplifying Musicality*, 2nd ed. (New York, NY: Routledge, 2015); Andrew King, Evangelos Himonides, and S. Alex Ruthmann, eds., *The Routledge Companion to Music, Technology, and Education* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2017); S. Alex Ruthmann and Roger Mantie, eds., *The Oxford Handbook of Technology and Music Education* (New York, NY: Oxford, 2017). Technologically-oriented journals include the *Journal of Music Technology and Education* and the *Media Journal of Music Education.* Ancillary web sites to published research articles are maintained by such journals as the *Journal of Research in Music Education.*

[8] I think, for example, of June Boyce Tillman's performances as part of her presentations to the International Society for the Philosophy of Music Education and Elizabeth Gould's Deleuzian performance piece in response to Estelle Jorgensen and Iris Yob, "Deconstructing Deleuze and Guattari's *A Thousand Plateaus* for Music Education," at the 8th International Symposium for the Philosophy of Music Education in Helsinki, Finland, June 2010. See the International Society for the Philosophy of Music Education website at http://www.ispme.net.

[9] Elizabeth Gould, "When Words Fail: Deleuze Singing," Keynote address to the 10th International Symposium for the Philosophy of Music Education, June 4, 2015; Leonard Tan and Mengchen Lu, "I Wish to Be Wordless": Philosophizing Through the Chinese Guqin," *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 26, no. 2 (Fall 2018): 139-154.

[10] Mary Beard, *Women & Power: A Manifesto* (New York and London: Liveright, 2017), 7.

[11] Beard, *Women and Power*, 21.

[12] See, for example, *Hildegard of Bingen's Book of Divine Works: With Letters and Songs*, ed., Matthew Fox (Santa Fe, NM: Bear and Co., 1987).

[13] See Iris M. Yob, "The Arts as Ways of Understanding: Reflections on the Ideas of Paul Tillich," *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 25, no. 3, Special Issue: Philosophy of Music and Music Education (Autumn, 1991): 5-20; "Religious Metaphor and Scientific Model: Grounds for Comparison," *Religious Studies* 28 (1992): 475-485.

[14] Claire Detels, *Soft Boundaries: Re-Visioning the Arts and Aesthetics in American Education* (Westport, CT: Bergin and Garvey, 1999).

[15] This film was featured in the 16th Annual Sarasota Film Festival in 2014. See https://film.list.co.uk/article/66881-manakamana/ accessed on February 7, 2018.

[16] On trust and intimacy, see Eleni Lapidaki, "Towards the Discovery of Contemporary Trust and Intimacy in Higher Music Education," In Iris M. Yob and Estelle R. Jorgensen, eds., *Humane Music Education and the Common Good* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, in press).

[17] Carol Gilligan, *In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1982); Nel Noddings, *Caring: A Relational Approach to Ethics & Moral Education,* 2nd ed. updated (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2013). This book was originally published under the title, *Caring: A Feminine Approach to Ethics & Moral Education* (1984).

[18] Alfred North Whitehead, *The Aims of Education, and Other Essays* ([1929; reprint, New York, NY: Free Press, 1967).

[19] See Langer*, Philosophy in a New Key.*

[20] See John Amos Comenius, *The Way of Light*, transl., Ernest Trafford Campagnac (Liverpool, UK: University Press; London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1938); John Amos Comenius, *The Great Didactic*, transl., Ernest Keatinge (New York, NY: Russell and Russell, 1967), also available

online at www.urweb.roehampton.ac.uk/digital-collection/froebel-archive/great-didactic/index.html.

[21] Parker J. Palmer, *The Courage to Teach: Exploring the Inner Landscape of a Teacher's Life*, 20th anniversary ed. (San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 2017).

[22] Edward A. Tiryakian, "Existential Phenomenology and the Sociological Tradition," *American Sociological Review* 30, no. 5 (October 1965): 674-688, discusses the compatibility of Talcott Parsons' notion of action frames of reference with existential phenomenology.

[23] Iris M. Yob makes this case in her essay, "There Is No Other," in Iris M. Yob and Estelle R. Jorgensen, eds., *Humane Music Education for the Common Good* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, in press).

[24] This is the case with much educational research conducted in virtual universities. For example, Walden University's doctoral students in education produce many qualitative dissertations and doctoral documents undertaken virtually and based increasingly on virtual interviews, online surveys, and the like.

[25] Estelle R. Jorgensen, *Pictures of Music Education* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2011).

[26] Interestingly, former Google and Facebook employees, Jim Steyer and Tristan Harris, are co-founders of the Center for Humane Technology (www.humanetech.com). The Center's purpose is to examine some of the negative aspects of social media platforms. For example, Steyer and Harris point to Facebook software that is designed to be addictive. This software draws on a human desire to be liked and it effectively distorts reality. See, Nellie Bowles, "Early Facebook and Google Employees Form Coalition to Fight What They Built," *New York Times*, February 4, 2018. See https://nyti.ms/2GJoKHg, accessed February 7, 2018.

[27] For a trailer of Mary Jane Dougherty's short documentary film on the Boston Children's Chorus, *Let the River Run*, an official selection of the IFFB 2018, see https://vimeo.com/249234596 accessed February 18, 2019.

[28] On children's reflective thought, see Panagiotis Kanellopoulos, "Children's Early Reflection on Improvised Music Making as the Wellspring of Musico-Philosophical Thinking," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 15, no. 2 (Fall 2008): 119-141.

[29] Interesting, Susanne Langer uses the dynamic metaphor of the river in her *Problems of Art: Ten Philosophical Lectures* (New York, NY: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1957) to depict the fluidity of dance and music. Reading into Doherty's film title, music does its work and impacts the lives of young people and adults, and music educators do not impede its flow or otherwise prevent it from running its course.

[30] Mary J. Reichling, "Images of Imagination," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 38, no. 4 (1990): 282-293, DOI: 10.2307/3345225.

[31] Estelle R. Jorgensen, "Myth, Song, and Music Education: The Case of Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* and Swann's *The Road Goes Ever On," Journal of Aesthetic Education* 40, no. 3 (Fall 2006): 1-21; and her "Music, Myth, and Education: The Case of 'The Lord of the Rings' Film Trilogy," *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 44, no. 1 (Spring 2010): 44-57.

[32] Estelle R. Jorgensen, "This-with-that": A Dialectical Approach to Teaching for Musical Imagination," *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 40, no. 4 (Winter 2006): 1-20.

[33] See Michael L. Mark and Charles L. Gary, *A History of American Music Education*, 3rd ed. (Rowman and Littlefield Education, 2007); James A. Keene, *A History of Music Education in the United States,* 2nd ed. (Centennial, CO: Glenridge, 2009).

[34] Sondra Wieland Howe, *Women Music Educators in the United States* (Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press, 2013).

[35] Jane Roland Martin, *School was our Life: Remembering Progressive Education* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2018).

[36] See Talbot, ed., *Marginalized Voices in Music Education*. For a discussion of women in music education see, for example, the *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 17, no. 2 (Fall, 2009) issue.

[37] Randi Margrethe Eidsaa, "Musical Dialogues in Conflict Areas: Narratives from Sarajevo," video, 17 minutes, undated, no publisher. Presentation to NIME 6. https://www.dropbox.com/s/7ua3ukr53fnq3wk/Sarajevo%20Solo%203%20Large.mp4?dl=0, accessed February 17, 2019.

[38] For example, I think of the collaborations between Sibelius Academy of the University of the Arts in Helsinki, Finland, and the Nepal Music Center, the Cultural Diversity in Music Education International Conference (CDIME XIII)**,** Annapurna Hotel, Kathmandu, Nepal, March 29-April 1, 2017. Also, see the Routledge World Music Pedagogy Series in School and Community Practice, edited by Patricia Shehan Campbell. See Patricia Shehan Campbell, *Music, Education, and Diversity: Bridging Cultures and Communities* (New York, NY: Teachers College Press, 2018).

[39] Joel 2: 28, KJV.