It may be, at first impression, difficult to reconcile eighteenth-century European audiences with their acceptance of female singers (with female voices and bodies) portraying male characters on stage. Understanding how these cross-dressing women fit in with an art form like opera can be especially difficult considering that opera in Central Europe in the late eighteenth century (a) appealed to diverse audiences -- from royalty to fairly lower-middle class patrons1 -- and (b) was expected to reinforce the morality of the day2.

The roles of Cherubino from Mozart's *Le Nozze di Figaro* and Sesto and Annio from his *La Clemenza di Tito* represent two archetypal trouser roles in opera. Cherubino, belonging to one well-known type, and Sesto and Annio belonging to the other, represent two ways in which bending traditional gender roles in parts of continental Europe during the late eighteenth century remained accommodating and acceptable. In his article, “Percy's Prologue: From Gender Play to Gender Panic in Eighteenth-Century England,” Dror

---

1 *Opera seria* was still largely commissioned by nobility and premiered at official royal events or celebrations, such as the coronation of Leopold II, for which Mozart's *La Clemenza di Tito* was commissioned. Operas of this type still ran beyond their premier and were transplanted to various cities, much as Mozart's *Clemenza* was. See: Rice, *WA Mozart La Clemenza di Tito* p. 7; Strohm, *Drama per Musica: Italian Opera Seria of the Eighteenth Century*, Introduction, p. 5. *Opera buffa*, was often devoted to portrayal of ordinary life and attended by diverse audiences. They were, however, still frequently commissioned by nobility, supported by royalty, or at least encouraged by royal taste. For instance, Mozart's comic opera *Don Giovanni* was performed in the same coronation festivities as the premier of *Clemenza*. See: Rice, *WA Mozart La Clemenza di Tito*, p. 60-4; Hunter, *Mozart's Operas: A Companion*, p. 136; Steptoe *The Mozart-Da Ponte Operas*, “Opera and Popular Taste in Mozart's Vienna,” p. 42-52.

2 As Nicholas Till points out in his book, *Mozart and the Enlightenment: Truth, Virtue, and Beauty in Mozart’s Operas*, many theories were authored during the eighteenth century discussing the moral influence drama had over an audience as well as theories about the "moral capabilities" of music (38-43).
Wahrman argues that in England, acceptance of women who took on masculine characters and characteristics became less tolerated by audiences during the American Revolution. The three pants roles examined in this paper, and their prevalence during the late eighteenth century, however, demonstrate that bending and even crossing gender boundaries remained acceptable in other parts of Europe.

One archetypal trouser role is the adolescent boy in love. This character, exemplified by Beaumarchais’s Chérubin and Mozart’s Cherubino, has since been recreated in notable opera roles in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries (e.g. Siebel in Gounod’s Foust and Octavian in Richard Strauss’s Der Rosenkavalier). Cherubino’s status as a trouser role reinforces theories of the day about youth and adolescence: because he is not yet fully mature, he is not expected to be a model of masculinity. Instead, his youth is reinforced in operagoers’ minds through descriptions of his femininity and the feminine aspects of appearance, manner, and voice that the female singer brings to the role. It is because of the inherent femininity and sexual immaturity attributed to Cherubino’s character that a woman’s smaller, lovelier shape and lighter, higher voice were acceptable and illustrative to audiences at the time.

*Opera buffa* was a style of comic opera originating in Italy in the first half of the eighteenth century, which grew widely in popularity in Central Europe in the second half of the same century. It drew heavily on the set cast of characters from Italian *Commedia dell’arte* and is usually characterized by (a) simpler vocal music and language than *opera seria*, (b) a plot involving some obstacle to the eventual marriage of young lovers, and (c)

---


characters of middle and working class birth. Mozart’s *opera buffa* productions with librettist Da Ponte, *Le Nozze di Figaro, Don Giovanni,* and *Cosi fan Tutte,* like other *opera buffa* of the late eighteenth century, were more complicated and subtle than either traditional *commedia dell’arte* or crude, early *opera buffa*.\(^5\)

The plot and characters of Mozart’s *Le Nozze di Figaro* and Beaumarchais’s *Le Mariage de Figaro* are rooted in the *commedia dell’arte* tradition. *Le Mariage* (and as a result *Le Nozze*) revolved around heavy, controversial social commentary; however, Mary Hunter rightly points out that audiences knew what to expect of the opera’s outcome as soon as they were introduced to the paradigm of two young lovers whose happy fate is being blocked by an older, more powerful man.\(^6\) Furthermore, like *commedia dell’arte* and traditional *opera buffa*, the moral of the story is represented through critiques and caricatures of the faults of characters that try to prevent the lovers from marrying.\(^7\)

In *Le Mariage* and *Le Nozze*, Chérubin/Cherubino is a comic character. As Mary Hunt points out, he has the misfortune of inadvertently preceding the Count’s moves and foiling his various sexual endeavors, much to the Count’s exasperation and wonder.\(^8\) In Act I Scene V and later in Act I Scene VII of *Le Nozze*, Cherubino and the Count respectively relate that the Count discovered Cherubino all alone with the gardener’s daughter Barbarina, most likely when the Count himself was planning on paying her a visit that was not altogether innocent.\(^9\) Two nearly identical scenes unravel within the action of the opera following this account. In Act I Scene VII, the Count is recalling the event involving

---


\(^7\) Robinson, Michael. “Opera Buffa,” p. 81.

\(^8\) Hunt, Mary. *Mozart’s Operas*, p. 143-4.

Barbarina. He says that after finding the door locked and Barbarina flustered, “lifting the tablecloth, there I saw the page.”\textsuperscript{10} Hilariously, as the Count demonstrates this action by lifting Susanna’s dress from the chair, he discovers Cherubino again hidden alone in the room of a girl he was trying to seduce. The Count at this point realizes Cherubino was not only witness to the illicit advances the Count had made on Susanna, but yet \textit{again} beat him to the punch (or so he thinks).

Next, in Act II, the Count, ready to boil over with jealousy because of suspicions that the Countess has taken Cherubino as a lover, only narrowly misses catching Cherubino alone in the Countess’s chambers. After hearing the gardener’s accounts of a young boy who jumped from the Countess’s window, however, he remains convinced that the young page had somehow managed to undermine him yet \textit{again}.\textsuperscript{11}

These encounters with Susanna and the Countess respectively, are in truth far more innocent than the Count suspects. In fact, part of what makes Cherubino such a loveable and comic character is that the sexual transgressions for which he is constantly punished are in actuality only imagined by the Count. Susanna and the Countess often find his amorous ambitions laughable, as does the audience, which is privy not only to the same information as the characters on stage, but also is the knowledge that Cherubino is played by a woman.

In Act I Scene V, for instance, Susanna teases Cherubino about his love for the Countess when he steals one of the Countess’s ribbons from Susanna.\textsuperscript{12} During Act II Scene III in the Countess’s bedroom, both the Countess and Susanna mock him for his infatuations

\textsuperscript{10} Act I Scene VII. \textit{Le Nozze di Figaro}. Translation from www.opera-guide.ch.
\textsuperscript{11} Act I Scene VII. \textit{Le Nozze di Figaro}. Translation from www.opera-guide.ch.
\textsuperscript{12} Act II Scene VIII. \textit{Le Nozze di Figaro}. Translation from www.opera-guide.ch.
with women. They, unlike the Count, obviously think his advances are utterly harmless. In this scene, they make Cherubino sing his love song, “Voi che sapete” to the Countess. They condescendingly enjoy his nervousness and take pleasure in both his lack of experience in matters of love and his open adoration for the Countess. Of his self-consciousness, Susanna remarks “Look: he’s blushing all over his face.” Once they’ve put a lady’s cap on him, Susanna describes him, saying, “Look at the little rascal, isn’t he handsome?” In addition, just before the Count comes knocking at the Countess’s door, the Countess disregards Cherubino’s forlorn wish that he could kiss her, saying, “Be sensible: what is this nonsense?” A “little rascal” is certainly not someone who could pose any real threat to the Countess or Susanna’s honor.

Cherubino is obviously able to feel romantic and sexual attraction – in fact this is above all his defining feature. Both of his two arias revolve around his inability to control his romantic and sexual urges, such that they seem to consume him completely. In his first aria, “Non so piu,” he describes how

Every woman makes me change colour,  
Every woman makes me tremble.  
At the very word love or beloved  
My heart leaps and pounds,  
And to speak of it fills me  
With a longing I can’t explain!

Cherubino is, like the count, of noble birth – the Countess is his godmother. His crushes are entirely non-threatening, however, unlike the Count’s attraction to Susanna, which is entirely threatening. It is not his class, therefore that makes him powerless in comparison to the Count, but partially his age. It is his perceived sexual impotency as an adolescent

boy that makes him so cute to the women. Beaumarchais himself said that Chérubin's antics shouldn't be too alarming because although “he is no longer a child...he is not yet a man.”

Furthermore, after the Count discovers Cherubino in her room, Susanna pleads with the Count on Cherubino's behalf, saying, “He's still a child.” Although Cherubino impregnates the Countess prior to Beaumarchais's *La Mère coupable*, the tryst the two have takes place when Cherubino is older, after the setting of *Le Mariage*.

Cherubino's adolescence – characterized as an intermediate stage between the innocence of his youth and the sexual virility of manhood – was not a unique depiction in the eighteenth century. Adolescence as a developmental stage was presented in both Rousseau’s *Emile* and Goethe's *Werther* in the two decades that preceded *Le Mariage*. Although neither Werther nor Emile is a comic character, they share many characteristics with Cherubino. By the time Beaumarchais's and Mozart’s “little cherub” appeared on stage, audience members would have found a character who felt love but was unable to yet act on it plausible and familiar.

Werther's age is unknown– although he may not be as immature as Cherubino or Emile, he is at least youthful. He becomes infatuated, much as Cherubino does, with a woman who is utterly unattainable. Also, identical to the depiction of Werther's obsession with Lotte’s pink ribbon, Cherubino snatches a ribbon from Susanna that he knows came form the Countess’s dressing cap, saying “O dear, sweet, fortunate ribbon!/I'll

---

18 *Emile: or on Education* was published in 1762, *The Sorrows of Young Werther* in 1774, and *Le Mariage* was written in 1778 and premiered in 1784.
not give it up except with my life.” Later, he uses it to tie up a wound, believing that it might have special healing powers because it “bound the hair or touched the skin of” the Countess.

Emile provides a more explicit illustration of the distinct developmental state that Cherubino and Emile (from Book V) share. Rousseau says, “it is our passion that makes us weak.” The desires of men must be tempered at a young age if a boy is to grow into an upstanding man. Obviously, Cherubino, who is racked by feelings that make him one moment feel his “spirit all ablaze, / And the next moment / Turn again to ice,” is incapable yet of controlling his passions. Rousseau says that without rational control, his weakness comes “from the inequality between his strength and his desires” and he lacks the strength to accomplish what he desires.

In Book V, Emile falls in love with Sophie and exhibits many of the same lovesick symptoms as Werther and Cherubino. Notably, the tutor says that in social functions, “Emile is part of the women’s crowd, and he is always on the lookout to steal some dish of custard into which Sophie has dipped her spoon.” Much like Werther and Cherubino’s ribbons, Emile cherishes the thought that he might possess the custard that Sophie touched. Furthermore, eating custard and running with the women’s crowd are rather feminine characteristics, made acceptable because of Emile’s tender age and love for Sophie. Much like Emile, Cherubino’s youth is exemplified at least partially through his femininity.

---

Cherubino’s femininity is most clearly described in Act II Scene III. After singing his love song, “Voi che, sapete,” the Countess says Cherubino has a “charming voice.”26 Late in the scene, when describing his love to the Countess, he begins to cry – a peculiarly sensitive (i.e. feminine) thing to do. Also in this scene, the women make an outrageous plan to fool the Count into thinking that Cherubino is actually Susanna. To test if this theory would be possible, they dress Cherubino in women’s clothing and teach him to walk like a girl. Susanna remarks on his feminine beauty, when he is partially dressed up in women’s garb, saying,

I’m almost inclined
To be jealous myself.
(taking Cherubino by the chin)
You little scamp,
You’ve no right to look so pretty! 27

Heather Hadlock develops a similar argument, pointing out that Susanna also establishes Cherubino’s femininity when she comments on the paleness of his arms.28 Hadlock and David Cairns both assert that Act II Scene III there are several indications that Susanna and the Countess are attracted to Cherubino and the “masquerade” of a woman cross-dressing as a man who cross-dresses as a woman sends homoerotic messages29. This may be true on some level; however, more importantly, this scene and Cherubino’s depicted femininity are tools of physical comedy that help further establish him as adolescent. For instance, in Act II Scene III, it is the fact that Cherubino is no taller than Susanna and is also slim enough to wear women’s clothing (characteristics attributable to his youth) that makes her believe the Count will be fooled into thinking he is a girl (giving

Cherubino, consequently, is a rather effeminate boy. His effeminacy seems to be explained by the fact that he is young and still sexually immature. The woman who plays Cherubino is therefore not required to do a very convincing job of becoming masculine. Audiences are also not asked to stretch their own ideas of gender construction overly much because the character of Cherubino lies somewhere between traditional masculinity and traditional femininity on a gender continuum. The kind of gender crossover occurring for this role and those like it was, as such, uncontroversial.

The other archetypal pants role represented in this paper, deriving primarily from Baroque and Classical opera seria, were roles originally written for castrati. As the prevalence and popularity of castrati declined in the late eighteenth century, women not only began to take over castrati roles in productions of older operas, but were written into contemporary opera seria roles that might once have been filled by a castrato, and which were recognizable to audiences as such. Sesto and Annio from La Clemena di Tito are two such roles.

Metastasio’s libretto to La Clemena di Tito was altered and set to music some forty times during the eighteenth century. Both Sesto and Annio were traditionally sung by castrati, but Annio was written as a trouser role in Mozart’s production. Sesto was, following tradition, written for a castrato in Mozart’s production, but was repremiered several times in the following two decades by women.

---

32 McClymonds, MP. "Review."
This second type of trouser role is not necessarily typified by adolescence or sexual immaturity like Cherubino. As such, it is not the inherent femininity of the roles themselves that made the portrayal of Sesto and Annio by female singers acceptable to eighteenth century audiences. Instead, the historical precedence of gender crossover already established by castrati in these roles paved the way for masculinizing women singers. Because women could produce a similar vocal aesthetic and because castrati belonged to a kind of intermediate gender category, women were easily accepted as the successors of castrato roles in opera seria during the time of Mozart’s La Clemenza.

Opera seria was a serious style of opera, originating in Italy during the late Baroque period. It reached the height of its popularity during the mid eighteenth century, and is characterized by (a) plots set in the classical period, (b) small casts of characters almost exclusively of noble birth, and (c) scores consisting almost solely of arias and recitative. It remained popular through the end of the eighteenth century in many parts of Europe, although it fell out of favor in Vienna for several years because Emperor Joseph II is said to have found opera seria boring. Apostelo Zeno and Pietro Metastasio reformed the genre, and are often thought of as the fathers of opera seria in its most popular form. They hoped to “bring opera closer to the conventions of neo-Aristotolian drama,” and “expunge the worst excesses of Italian (and particularly Venetian) seventeenth-century opera.” Thus, like opera buffa, opera seria was a moral form of art. The messages of early opera seria

---

36 Rice, John. La Clemenza di Tito, p. 7.
often reinforced absolutism, but after the reforms of Gluck, the bourgeois values of conjugal love and the power of the family were more often the focus.38

In Mozart’s *La Clemenza di Tito*, the leads Sesto and Vitellia are contrasted with the secondary couple, Annio and Servilia. Vitellia, the prima donna, is vengeful and manipulative. When Tito does not choose her to be his empress she feels robbed and manipulates Sesto’s love to get him to betray the good emperor and the state. She is directly contrasted with Servilia, the second donna. Servilia is honest to the emperor, even when it might cost her dearly, and was happy to sacrifice the power of the throne for her love of Annio. Sesto, the lead with Vitellia, is weak and traitorous. He is a slave to his love for Vitellia. Even though he knows it is wrong, he is manipulated by her wiles into betraying his friend, the emperor. Annio, on the other hand, is ever loyal to the emperor. When Tito chooses Servilia to be his empress, Annio is able to sublimate his own love for her to his love for the state.39

The two trouser roles in this opera, as such, are not confined the way Cherubino’s character is by his age, his sexual immaturity, or his limited importance to the plot. Sesto and Annio are not adolescent, nor are they sexless--both characters are romantic. In fact, Sesto is a romantic lead in the main heterosexual couple in the opera. While both characters are probably meant to be fairly youthful considering they are in love and wish to be married, they are not sexually immature like Cherubino. Sesto, for example is described as the emperor’s friend, a label that would not likely be bestowed upon a flighty, adolescent...

---

boy\textsuperscript{40}. Furthermore, Annio is mature enough to not only love Servilia, but to have earned her love and devotion in return, which Cherubino is unable accomplish with the women he loves.

This kind of trouser role expects the female singers to be more convincingly masculine and the audience to be even more imaginative with regards to the gender of the role. As I have demonstrated, it was probably fairly easy to reconcile a woman’s voice and body with the role of a sexless, adolescent boy like Cherubino. Reconciling a woman with characters such as Sesto and Annio, however, is a something completely different. Portrayal of Sesto and Annio by a woman transgresses traditional gender roles much more seriously because it expects the women to really become \textit{men} -- to be in love with women and loved by women. These difficult transitions were made easier for audiences to understand and accept because of the long tradition of castrati playing these roles. In Metastasian \textit{opera seria}, it was typical to cast a male tenor playing an authority figure, a castrato playing a young prince or nobleman who is in love, and a female soprano as the beautiful princess or noblewoman he is in love with\textsuperscript{41}. Furthermore, in the thirty-something different settings of Metastasio’s \textit{Clemenza} that had been produced in the early to mid eighteenth century, Sesto and Annio were traditionally cast as castrati.

Castrati, according to Martha Feldman, had largely fallen out of favor in the late eighteenth century. “Charges of aristocratic luxury, vanity, and decadence” regarding the Castrati as well as the idea of castration itself, were coupled with liberal ideas that

\textsuperscript{40} Sestus says, “Ah, let us not in Titus/take from the world its delight, from Rome its father, from us a friend,” Act I Scene I. Also, in Act I Scene IV, Tito greets Sestus saying, “Ah, Sestus, my friend.” \textit{La Clemenza di Tito}. Translation from www.opera-guide.ch.

castration disfigured or somehow destroyed nature.\textsuperscript{42} Castrati, especially in the atmosphere Feldman describes in late eighteenth century, were seen as unnatural. The readiness to accept a woman in these roles was probably in part due to this kind of widespread unpopularity.

Furthermore, despite the great familiarity that eighteenth-century audiences had with castrati\textsuperscript{43}, their portrayal of heroic opera roles still required some suspension of disbelief by the audience. The castrati were not really full men, lacking (like Cherubino) the masculine qualities attributed to sexual virility. Audiences were constantly reminded of this by differences in the physical appearances of the casatrati as well as their voices. Robert Freitas argues that they were not utterly sexless, however. He says that at least during the Baroque period, they, much like adolescent boys, existed in a kind of sexual and gender middle-ground. According to contemporary theories, gender had much more to do with the quantity of a sexual “vital-heat” than with its quality\textsuperscript{44}. Castrato and young boys were seen as existing somewhere in the middle. This theory may account for why young boys like Emile and Cherubino were thought to naturally possess some feminine characteristics. The acceptance of women in these roles was therefore likely due to two main reasons. First, women were closest to matching the vocal aesthetic of castrati roles to which audiences were accustomed. Second, the sexual ambiguity of the castrati themselves allowed women to take over their roles and bend gender norms without disrupting the natural order of things too greatly.

\textsuperscript{44} Freitas, Roger. “The Eroticism of Emasculation.”
Objections about the gender casting of Sesto (and sometimes Annio, despite his secondary nature in the plot) did arise, but not until decades after the premier of *La Clemenza*. As Rice says, arguments made against casting women in the role of Sesto claimed that the women destroyed the "dramatic realism" of the roles.\(^{45}\) Mary Hunter points out that in the 1850s, Mozart’s biographer Otto Jahn complained about the role for similar reasons: it is impossible to achieve a realistic romance between two women on stage.\(^{46}\) These complaints are evidence that by the early to mid nineteenth century, gender constructions were becoming far more rigid in Central Europe. *La Clemenza di Tito* actually became highly unpopular during the nineteenth century and was not rediscovered until after the sexual revolution of the twentieth (although I’m not willing to speculate about how much that had to do with attitudes about gender as opposed to coincidence or differences in artistic preferences).

Though these characters only directly demonstrate gender flexibility in the context of artistic freedom, they no doubt have farther reaching implications for women in eighteenth century society. Art was not meant in the eighteenth century to push the boundaries of acceptability like it is today. Opera was a conventional, morally obligated, and extremely popular artform. As such, it reflects the opinions and influences of audiences, noble patrons of the arts, librettists, composers, and opera troupes. While Wahrman asserts that gender constructions in England were strictly enforced beginning during the American Revolution, the three Mozart roles analyzed in this paper demonstrate that at least in Central Europe, constructions about gender were still somewhat fluid.

---


