How Do We Know Advising Is Done Well? Using NACADA Core Competencies to Assess Advising

Jim Cole
BCSSE Project Manager & NSSE Analyst

Jillian Kinzie
Associate Director & NSSE Institute

NACADA 2020
Some Signs of Advising Done Well...

- Students are provided with timely accurate information and resources
- Advisors actively listen to student concerns
- Students feel respected
- Information about major and careers, special opportunities (internships, etc.), resources for well-being, are shared with students
- Advising contributes to improved persistence and graduation rates

How do you know?
Introduction to Sources of Information about the Quality of Advising
- NSSE and Advising module
- Brief Summary Results from NSSE 2020
- NACADA Core Competencies and Learning Outcomes
- New: Mapping NSSE to NACADA Core Competencies and Learning Outcomes
- BCSSE and Academic Advising
Introduction to NSSE and the Advising Module

NSSE collects data representing a breadth of student engagement behaviors, including 10 Engagement Indicators and 6 High Impact Practices.

**Engagement Indicators**
- Higher-Order Learning
- Reflective & Integrative Learning
- Learning Strategies
- Quantitative Reasoning
- Collaborative Learning
- Discussions w/Diverse Others
- Student-Faculty Interaction
- Effective Teaching Practices
- Quality of Interactions
- Supportive Environment

**High Impact Practices**
- Learning community
- Internship, co-op, etc
- Work w/faculty on research project
- Service Learning
- Study abroad
- Culminating senior experience

13. Indicate the quality of your interactions with... Academic advisors (1=poor to 7=excellent, NA)
What do we know from NSSE about Quality of Interaction with Advisors?

*True or False?*

About 60% of First-Year Students rate the quality of their interactions with academic advisors as “very good or excellent”.

False. 53% FY & 54% SR
Introduction to NSSE’s Advising Module

NSSE Topical Modules

1. Academic Advising (Updated 2019)
2. Civic Engagement
3. Development of Transferable Skills
4. Learning with Technology
5. Experiences with Writing
6. Experiences with Information Literacy
7. First-Year Experiences and Senior Transitions
8. Global Learning
9. Inclusiveness and Engagement with Cultural Diversity

Additional, optional modules to add to NSSE administration
Introduction to NSSE’s Advising Module

The Advising Module:
➢ Examines students' experiences with academic advising, including frequency of interaction with advisors and advising practices that reflect NACADA core values.
➢ Asks students to identify who has been most helpful.
➢ Complements a question on the core survey about the quality of students' interactions with academic advisors.

Visit the NSSE website for more details about the NSSE Tropical Modules: nsse.indiana.edu/nsse/survey-instruments/topical-modules/index.html
Introduction to NSSE’s Advising Module

1. During the current school year, how many times have you discussed your academic interests, course selections, or academic performance with the following individuals?
   
   Response options: 0, 1, 2, 3, 4 or more, Not applicable
   a. Academic advisor, faculty, or staff assigned to advise you
   b. Academic advisor(s) available to any student
   c. Faculty or instructor(s) not assigned to advise you
   d. Student services staff (career services, academic support, Trio, etc.)
   e. Success or academic coach
   f. Peer advisor or mentor
   g. Other, please specify: [text box]

2. Do you know how to contact (in person, email, phone, or online) an advisor at your institution?
   
   Response options: Yes, No, Unsure

3. Thinking about academic advising, how much have people and resources at your institution done the following?
   
   Response options: Very much, Quite a bit, Some, Very little, Not applicable
   a. Been available when needed
   b. Provided prompt and accurate information
   c. Provided information about learning support services (tutoring, writing center, etc.)
   d. Notified you of important policies and deadlines
   e. Reached out to you about your academic progress or performance
   f. Followed up with you regarding something they recommended
   g. Asked questions about your educational background and needs
   h. Actively listened to your concerns
   i. Respected your identity and culture
   j. Cared about your overall well-being

4. Thinking about academic advising, about how often did someone at your institution discuss the following with you?
   
   Response options: Very often, Often, Sometimes, Rarely, Never, Not applicable
   a. Your academic goals and future plans
   b. How your major or expected major relates to your goals and future plans
   c. Special opportunities (study abroad, internship, service-learning, research, etc.)
   d. Participation in co-curricular activities (organizations, clubs, performing arts, sports, etc.)
   e. Resources for your well-being (health, counseling, financial guidance, etc.)

5. How much have each of the following helped you develop your academic goals and future plans?
   
   Response options: Very much, Quite a bit, Some, Very little, Not applicable
   a. Academic advisor, faculty, or staff assigned to advise you
   b. Academic advisor(s) available to any student
   c. Faculty or instructor(s) not assigned to advise you
   d. Online advising system (degree progress report, etc.)
   e. Website, catalog, or other published sources
   f. Student services staff (career services, academic support, TRIO, etc.)
   g. Success or academic coach
   h. Peer advisor or mentor
   i. Friends or other students
   j. Family members
   k. Other, please specify:
First Year Students: Do you know how to contact (in person, email, phone, or online) an advisor at your institution?

- No: 17%
- Yes: 68%
- Unsure: 14%
Academic Advising Module Question:

1. During the current school year, how many times have you discussed your academic interests, course selections, or academic performance with the following individuals?

Response options: 0, 1, 2, 3, 4 or more, Not applicable

a. Academic advisor, faculty, or staff assigned to advise you
b. Academic advisor(s) available to any student
c. Faculty or instructor(s) not assigned to advise you
d. Student services staff (career services, academic support, Trio, etc.)
e. Success or academic coach
f. Peer advisor or mentor
g. Other, please specify: [text box]
How many times do students meet with an advisor to discuss their academic interests, courses, performance?

• More than half of both first-year students & seniors had 5 or more meetings with advisors during the current school year.

• Only a trivial proportion (3% first-years and 6% seniors) never discussed their academic interests, course selections or academic performance with an advisor, faculty member or success coach in the current year.
10 items to Assess Advising Quality*

3 a-j. How much have people and resources done the following...

a. Been available when needed
b. Provided prompt and accurate information
c. Provided information about learning support services (tutoring, writing center, success skills, etc.)
d. Notified you of important policies and deadlines
e. Reached out to you about your academic progress or performance
f. Followed up with you regarding something they recommended
g. Asked questions about your educational background and needs
h. Actively listened to your concerns
i. Respected your identity and culture
j. Cared about your overall well-being

*Summed scores for OVERALL measure of Advising Quality. Created 4 groups: low, low-med, med-high, high
Punchlines about Academic Advising findings...

- Advising **Quality** Matters more than **Quantity**
- Some advising practices more strongly influence FY interaction with faculty & intention to persist
  - FY interaction with faculty most influenced by ADVISING QUALITY not QUANTITY (number of times)
  - Advising QUALITY really mattered to intention to persist – students with HIGH QUALITY advising had 17% higher score on intent to return than those who experienced LOW QUALITY advising.

Download your own copy of the NSSE 2019 Annual Results: nsse.indiana.edu/research/annual-results/index.html
Punchlines about Academic Advising findings...

- Advising **Quality** Matters more than **Quantity**
- Some advising practices more strongly influence FY interaction with faculty & intention to persist
- Seniors who experienced high-quality advising, compared to those who experienced low-quality advising, indicated their college experience contributed much more to their job- or work-related knowledge and skills

Download your own copy of the NSSE 2019 Annual Results: nsse.indiana.edu/research/annual-results/index.html
NSSE 2019 Annual Results
Take Aways: Advising Quality vs Quantity

- **Frequency of advising** is not nearly as important as the **quality of advising** to crucial aspects of student engagement and success.

- Meeting more often with an advisor had some benefits, the **strongest and most consistent relationships were with the quality of academic advising**.

Download your own copy of the NSSE 2019 Annual Results: nsse.indiana.edu/research/annual-results/index.html
“Through academic advising, students learn to become members of their higher education community, to think critically about their roles and responsibilities as students, and to prepare to be educated citizens of a democratic society and a global community. Academic advising engages students beyond their own world views, while acknowledging their individual characteristics, values, and motivations as they enter, move through, and exit the institution.”

NACADA: https://nacada.ksu.edu/Resources/Pillars/Concept.aspx
The competencies are a broad range of understanding, knowledge, and skills that support academic advising.

Three major areas provides advisors the knowledge and skills to be effective guides for their students.

1. The **Conceptual** component provides the context for the delivery of academic advising. It covers the ideas and theories that advisors must understand to effectively advise their students.
2. The **Informational** component provides the substance of academic advising. It covers the knowledge advisors must gain to be able to guide the students at their institution.
3. The **Relational** component provides the skills that enable academic advisors to convey the concepts and information from the other two components to their advisees.

Advisor professional development and competencies are integral to a meaningful and high quality advising experience for the student.
NACADA Learning Outcomes

“These outcomes, defined in an advising curriculum, articulate what students will demonstrate, know, value, and do as a result of participating in academic advising. Each institution must develop its own set of student learning outcomes and the methods to assess them. The following is a representative sample.”

NACADA: https://nacada.ksu.edu/Resources/Pillars/Concept.aspx

Students will:
- craft a coherent educational plan based on assessment of abilities, aspirations, interests, and values
- use complex information from various sources to set goals, reach decisions, and achieve those goals
- assume responsibility for meeting academic program requirements
- articulate the meaning of higher education and the intent of the institution’s curriculum
- cultivate the intellectual habits that lead to a lifetime of learning
- behave as citizens who engage in the wider world around them
Mapping NSSE and NACADA

ADVISOR COMPETENCIES

Conceptual component (concepts academic advisors must understand) include understanding of:

C4 Academic advising approaches and strategies.
C6 How equitable and inclusive environments are created and maintained.

Informational component (knowledge academic advisors must master) include knowledge of:

I2 Curriculum, degree programs, and other academic requirements and options.
I3 Institution specific policies, procedures, rules, and regulations.
I5 The characteristics, needs, and experiences of major and emerging student populations.
I6 Campus and community resources that support student success.

Relational component (skills academic advisors must demonstrate) include the ability to:

R2 Create rapport and build academic advising relationships.
R3 Communicate in an inclusive and respectful manner.
R4 Plan and conduct successful advising interactions.
R5 Promote student understanding of the logic and purpose of the curriculum.
R6 Facilitate problem solving, decision-making, meaning-making, planning, and goal setting.

Mapping NSSE and NACADA

**STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LO1</th>
<th>NSSE and Acad Adv Module</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Craft a coherent educational plan based on assessment of abilities, aspirations, interests, and values</td>
<td>AA4a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use complex information from various sources to set goals, reach decisions, and achieve those goals</td>
<td>2a-g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articulate the meaning of higher education and the intent of the institution’s curriculum</td>
<td>AA4b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultivate the intellectual habits that lead to a lifetime of learning</td>
<td>18h; 18i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behave as citizens who engage in the wider world around them</td>
<td>14h; 14i; 18g; 18j</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How do you know if the competencies are being achieved?
Do all students experience advising equitably?
Do some student populations – gender identity, race-ethnicity, disability, major etc. differ in their advising experiences?

The following are examples of using NSSE data to examine the connection between student experiences with advising and NACADA core competencies and student learning outcomes.
NSSE and NACADA: Student Outreach

CONCEPTUAL
Understands advising approaches and strategies.

THE ADVISOR:

HOW OFTEN THE ADVISOR:
Reached out about academic progress or performance
NSSE and NACADA: Student Outreach Overall

CONCEPTUAL
The Advisor:
Understands advising approaches and strategies.

How Often The Advisor:
Reached out about academic progress or performance

Overall

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conceptual</th>
<th>How Often</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very much/Quite a bit</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some/Very little</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First-Year Students

Asian

Black/Afr American

Hispanic

White

Two or more
NSSE and NACADA: Student Outreach by Race-Ethnicity

First-Year Students

CONCEPTUAL
Understands advising approaches and strategies.

THE ADVISOR:
Reached out about academic progress or performance

HOW OFTEN THE ADVISOR:

0% 25% 50% 75% 100%

Very much/Quite a bit

Some/Very little

Overall 44%
Asian 59%
Black/Afr American 50%
Hispanic 51%
White 59%
Two or more 58%

First-Year Students
NSSE and NACADA: Student Outreach by FG Status, Gender Identity, Disability

CONCEPTUAL: Understands advising approaches and strategies.

THE ADVISOR: Reached out about academic progress or performance.

HOW OFTEN THE ADVISOR:

First-Year Students
NSSE and NACADA: Student Outreach by FY Grades and Intention to Return

CONCEPTUAL
Understands advising approaches and strategies.

THE ADVISOR:

HOW OFTEN THE ADVISOR:
Reached out about academic progress or performance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FY Grades</th>
<th>Intend to Return</th>
<th>Very much/Quite a bit</th>
<th>Some/Very little</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C+ or lower</td>
<td>No or Unsure</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B- or higher</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First-Year Students
NSSE and NACADA: Sharing Resources by FG Status, Gender Identity, Disability

INFORMATIONAL
Knowledge of campus and community resources that support student success.

THE ADVISOR:
Knowledge of campus and community resources that support student success.

HOW OFTEN THE ADVISOR:
Provided information about learning support services

First-Year Students

- **FG-Yes**: 28% (Very much/Quite a bit), 27% (Some/Very little)
- **FG-NO**: 27% (Very much/Quite a bit), 29% (Some/Very little)
- **Man**: 29% (Very much/Quite a bit), 27% (Some/Very little)
- **Woman**: 27% (Very much/Quite a bit), 28% (Some/Very little)
- **Another**: 28% (Very much/Quite a bit), 29% (Some/Very little)
- **Disability-No**: 27% (Very much/Quite a bit), 29% (Some/Very little)
- **Disability-Yes**: 73% (Very much/Quite a bit), 71% (Some/Very little)
NSSE and NACADA: Sharing Resources by FY Grades and Intention to Return

INFORMATIONAL
Knowledge of campus and community resources that support student success.

THE ADVISOR:
Provided information about learning support services

HOW OFTEN
Very much/Quite a bit
Some/Very little

First-Year Students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FY Grades</th>
<th>C+ or lower</th>
<th>B- or higher</th>
<th>No or Unsure Intend to return</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intent to return</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

0% 25% 50% 75% 100%
RELATIONAL
Communicate in an inclusive and respectful manner

HOW OFTEN THE ADVISOR:
Actively listened to your concerns

Overall:
- 62% Very much/Quite a bit
- 38% Some/Very little

First-Year Students:
- Asian
- Black/Afr American
- Hispanic
- White
- Two or more
NSSE and NACADA: Sharing Resources by Race-Ethnicity

RELATIONAL
Communicate in an inclusive and respectful manner

THE ADVISOR:
Actively listened to your concerns

HOW OFTEN

First-Year Students

Overall
Asian
Black/Afr American
Hispanic
White
Two or more

Very much/Quite a bit
Some/Very little

38%
44%
41%
38%
37%
37%
62%
56%
59%
62%
64%
63%

0%
25%
50%
75%
100%
NSSE and NACADA: Active Listening by FY Grades, Intention to Return

RELATIONAL
Communicate in an inclusive and respectful manner

THE ADVISOR: How often the advisor actively listened to your concerns

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FY Grades</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Some/Very little</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C+ or lower</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B- or higher</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No or Unsure Intend to return</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First-Year Students
LEARNING OUTCOMES: Craft a coherent educational plan based on assessment of abilities, aspirations, interests, and values.

HOW OFTEN DISCUSSED: Your academic goals and future plans.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/Ethnicity</th>
<th>Very much/Quite a bit</th>
<th>Some/Very little</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Overall</strong></td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Asian</strong></td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Black/Afr American</strong></td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hispanic</strong></td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>White</strong></td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Two or more</strong></td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Senior Students**
LEARNING OUTCOMES: Craft a coherent educational plan based on assessment of abilities, aspirations, interests, and values.

HOW OFTEN DISCUSSED: Your academic goals and future plans.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Very much/Quite a bit</th>
<th>Some/Very little</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C+ or lower</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B- or higher</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Def/Prob No</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Def/Prob Yes</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
NSSE and NACADA

This sessions suggests how institutions can use NSSE & the Advising Module:

- to consider advising practice overall – are students experiencing quality advising to support learning, engagement and persistence?
- to assess the impact of advising aligned with NACADA standards
- to investigate differences in advising experiences by race/ethnicity, first generation status, gender identity, and disability status for their students
- to determine if groups of students – for example, those earning lower grades or who have lower intentions to return – differ in their advising experiences

We encourage connecting institutional data with NSSE/Advising data for a more in-depth analysis (i.e., investigating advising experiences with actual FY persistence.)
BCSSE and Academic Advising

BCSSE provides important advising information for entering students

Southern CT State University

- FY Seminar instructors receive BCSSE Advising Reports
- Predictive modelling to identify student success factors
- NSSE Academic Advising module to identify issues with the campus’s advising practices
- BCSSE-NSSE analysis resulting in a special High-Impact Practice offering First-Generation College Student Living and Learning Communities

Visit the BCSSE website for more details: nsse.indiana.edu/bcsse/index.html
Thanks so much for joining us!

Jim Cole & Jillian Kinzie
National Survey of Student Engagement (NSSE)
Indiana University Center for Postsecondary Research

nsse.indiana.edu