More Than Meets the Eye: Photographs as Research Documents

Thomas Kavanagh
Curator of Collections
Mathers Museum
More Than Meets the Eye: Photographs as Research Documents

Thomas Kavanagh
Curator of Collections
Mathers Museum
What Can We Learn from Historical Photographs?

This booklet explores some of the potential uses of photographs as documents through an examination of the Wanamaker Collection of American Indian photographs at the William Hammond Mathers Museum.

Photographs of American Indians, long used simply as illustrations or as icons to evoke an emotional response, can themselves be sources of ethnographic and historical information, particularly about aspects of material culture. In documenting artifact use, photographs can supplement museum collections, which often lack that important information. Moreover, while an individual photograph is a singular record of a moment in time, a group or series of photographs can be a record across time and space and can expand the information potential of photographic interpretation.
Extracting information requires that one read the photographs. Reading a photograph involves identifying as many aspects of the images as possible, from the photographer, date, and photographic technology used to produce the image, through its subjects and locations, to the artifacts represented in the image. This process, particularly that of identifying the artifacts represented in the image, involves a continual cross-reference between photographs and artifacts. This process can often result in the revision of interpretations of both artifact and photograph—tribal affiliation, date, and so on. In this way, reading a photograph moves from the most general aspects of the photograph as a photograph to its most specific details as a document.

A Brief History of American Indians and Photography

The techniques for permanently rendering a scene by means of light-sensitive chemicals were introduced to the European and American publics in 1839. At first, studio portraits of family members were the primary subject matter, but soon views of exotic people and places were in demand. In 1844, just five years after the introduction of photography, American Indians were being photographed.

The early technology was cumbersome and time-consuming, and allowed for only single images; there was no easy way to reproduce images for wide distribution. However, by the early 1850s developments in photographic technology not only allowed photographers to escape from the confines of the studio and move into the field, but also to make reproducible images. The photographer began by composing the scene, placing the subjects, and focusing the tripod-mounted camera. He then went into a darkened room—or tent if he was outside—where he covered a clean sheet of glass with light-sensitive liquid chemicals. While the plate was still wet (the process is called "wet plate photography") the photographer placed it into his camera and removed a lens cap to expose the plate. After several seconds, he replaced the lens cover, removed the plate, and retired to his tent, where other chemicals made the negative image permanent. Multiple positive prints could be produced from these glass plate negatives.

With this new technology, professional photographers began to market prints to a widening public. Most of the photographs of American Indians taken in the 1850s and early 1860s were made to document the diplomatic tribal delegations to Washington, DC. After the Civil War photographers began to follow the westward expansion and to record—sometimes accurately, sometimes not—the encounters between the native peoples and the Euro-Americans.

By 1889 George Eastman had developed the process of treating a flexible nitro-cellulose film with light-sensitive chemicals. This had several long-term effects upon photography. On the one hand, the new films were not as sensitive to light as were the glass plates, so glass continued to be used for much professional photography. At the same time, the first "Kodak" cameras were inexpensive and easy to use. This brought photography out of the hands of the professional photographer or dedicated amateur and into hands of the snapshot photographer. In response, many professional photographers turned from straightforward documentary photography to the styles and techniques called "Pictorialism," the use of Impressionist photographic technique: novel angles, dramatic close-ups, and soft focus to create an image rather than simply to record a scene.
The Wanamaker Collection of American Indian Photographs

In 1906 John Wanamaker, owner of the Wanamaker department stores of Philadelphia and New York, hired Joseph Kossuth Dixon to be director of the Education Bureau. As part of this position, "Dr." Dixon—the doctorate was apparently purely honorary—gave daily public lectures in the store's 3,000-seat auditorium, illustrated with slides or the newly invented motion pictures.

Eli Blackhawk as Hiawatha, Angela Star Blackhawk as Minehaha, and Wolf Lies Down as the Arrowmaker [W339]

In late 1908, in part because of the Wanamaker family's long-standing but unfulfilled interest in American Indians, Dixon travelled to the Crow Indian Reservation in Montana to dramatize and film Longfellow's epic poem, "The Song of Hiawatha," using Indian actors. Dixon also made over 1,400 other photographs in and around Crow Agency. Unfortunately, little of the movie survives, but most of the glass and nitrate negatives have survived in the Mathers Museum collections.
In 1909 Dixon gathered about 50 "chiefs"—actually relatively few were political leaders—from several Plains and Plateau tribes at the Crow Reservation to participate in what he called the "Last Great Indian Council." Dixon also staged several mock battles and filmed in and around the Little Big Horn Battlefield. Afterwards, the chiefs symbolically rode "into the sunset." Some 1,500 glass and nitrate negatives survive from 1909.
That same year Dixon and the Wanamakers began a more activist program seeking to improve the life of Indian people. In 1913 they persuaded the U.S. Congress to set aside Fort Wadsworth, an island fort in New York harbor, to be the site for a proposed National Indian Memorial; the statue would be larger than the Statue of Liberty. Concluding that one solution to the poverty on many reservations would be granting U.S. citizenship to Indians, Dixon then traveled to over 180 tribes on 79 reservations and Indian communities, asking individuals to sign a "Declaration of Allegiance" and to pledge loyalty to the American flag. There are some 2,000 images from 1913.
A squad of Indian soldiers; 1-r Thomas Slinker (tribe unknown), John Grass (Sioux), Fred Chavez (Mission), Webster Hovis or Charlie Carter (tribe unknown), Joseph La Jeunesse (Chippewa), Morgan Bradley (Cherokee) [W6522]

Continuing the citizenship campaign after World War I, Dixon documented Indian participation in the American armed forces. He traveled to a number of military posts in the United States, as well as battlefields in France. There are about 100 portraits of Indian soldiers, several hundred photographs of battlefields, and several thousand other documents about Indian participation in the war.

Whether Dixon's campaign had any direct influence is unknown, but Indians were granted citizenship in 1924.

Following the deaths of both Dixon and the Wanamakers in the late 1920s, their Indian materials were dispersed, and the Indian Memorial was forgotten. Many of the photographs, negatives, and prints, along with other papers and documents, came to Indiana University in the early 1940s. Other materials, including glass and nitrate negatives, were sent to the American Museum of Natural History in New York; the American Museum donated their nitrate negatives to Indiana University in 1972.
Photographic Analysis

While Dixon's original purpose in this monumental endeavor was to evoke a romantic image of Indians as a "Vanishing Race," his photographs can be used as documents of American Indian culture and history of the early 1900s.

A photograph is a selective recording of a visual scene. The camera does not see all, and what it does see can be intentionally manipulated both by the photographer and by the subject. Understanding the degree of photographic manipulation is necessary for the evaluation of any particular image or set of images.

One of the most common ways photographers manipulated Indian images was through the use of studio props. In much the same way that "old time" photographers today have a stock of clothing in which to dress up their patrons, photographers might have had a stock of "Indian" objects—clothing, war bonnets, tomahawks, etc.—with which they posed their subjects. Thus, one of the first steps in evaluating a set of photographs is to look for objects which appear in more than one photograph.

There is very little evidence of such manipulation in Dixon's photographs. One of the few examples is a pair of photographs from the 1913 expedition showing two men from the Siletz Reservation in Oregon wearing the same leather shirt, pants, and necklaces. It is not clear who—Dixon or the men themselves—decided to have the two men wear the same clothes.
Another common manipulation is the use of darkroom techniques to manipulate the atmosphere—the background, sky, or clouds—of a photograph. The Wanamaker Collection includes several cases that show such photographic manipulation to enhance the romantic image. The most obvious is “The Sunset of a Dying Race” (Dixon’s title).

This image began in 1909, when Dixon had the participants in his "Last Council" ride over a hilltop while he photographed them. From one of the negatives of this series, he prepared an "overlay" of celluloid to block out two of the figures. For the final print, the sky was artificially darkened to simulate a sunset. [W2671a; W2671b; W1485a]
Mountain Chief [W1759]
Still another form of image manipulation is metonymy, the use of a part to stand for the whole. In photography, this is the presentation of only one part of a scene or only one portrait intended to stand for the whole scene or person. For instance, Dixon's visual image of Indians ignored most evidence of Euro-American artifacts, and the subjects are wearing their best "Indian clothes."

This can leave the impression that Indians still wore "traditional" clothes into the 20th century. However, the collection also includes snapshots showing more informal and daily dress.

In the second photograph, Mountain Chief wears a three piece western-cut suit, a watch fob, and a broad-brimmed hat. Indeed, all of the Indians in this photograph wear Euro-American clothes. There is no reason to suspect that these are not their normal "good clothes"; the only visible clue to their Indian identity is their braids and one feather. Ironically, it is Dixon who dressed up in a "costume"—crowned campaign hat, riding britches, leather leggings, and high-top boots.
History

Although many of the Dixon's photographs were intended to represent a timeless romantic view of the American Indian, they also document the contemporary conditions of the early 20th century.

By the 20th century, many Indian people were living in European-style cabins, although many still used tipis and tents in the summer or for ceremonies.

"Typical" Indian house, Crow Reservation [W229]

However, not all Indian families had escaped the poverty of reservation life. [W5777]
The reservations were places of interaction between Indians and whites. The first agent to the Crows, F.D. Pease, married a Crow woman. Their son, George Pease, built this store in 1906.

George Pease married Sarah Walker, daughter of Walks Amongst, an Hidatsa woman from Fort Berthold, ND, and a Scotsman, James Walker. Their daughter, Helen, was born in December 1906. She still lives in Lodge Grass, Montana.
Clothing Styles

The decoration of formal Indian clothing by the Plains Indians reached a peak in the late 19th and early 20th centuries. Unfortunately, understanding the range and creativity of this decorative trend has been hampered by the limited number of such pieces in museum collections. However, the technical quality, as well as the sheer quantity, of the Wanamaker Collection allows a detailed examination and comparison of clothing styles and decorations.
Men's Clothing

Crow beadworkers at the turn of the century used the two-thread "overlay stitch" to produce flat and tight design fields. On beaded strips, large blocks of solid color were broken by panels of contrasting design.

Lakota Sioux beadwork used the single-thread "lazy stitch" to produce ridged lanes that carry the design elements. Lakota designs were often complex combinations of geometric shapes, lines, and colors.
Women's Clothing

Although Plains Indian men quickly adopted European-style clothes for everyday wear (note Mountain Chief), women's everyday wear was often an adaptation of traditional clothing using new materials.

Mrs. Wolf Plume (right) wears a wool dress with silk ribbon decorations at the hem. The yoke is decorated with large "pony" beads. Thimbles are used as tinklers.

Mrs. Wolf Plume (Blackfoot) [W1619]

These women (left) wear woolen trade cloth dresses decorated with dentalium shells at the yoke. Half-inch metal sequins, studs, metal fringe, and silk ribbon are additional decorations.

Bessie Standing Elk and Theresa Scalp Cane (Northern Cheyenne) [W1865]
Ms. Rock wears a plain calico "camp dress" and a commercial fringed blanket. She carries her baby in a Northern Cheyenne- or Lakota-style soft baby carrier.
Domestic Activities

Although most of the Wanamaker Collection photographs are posed portraits, the collection also includes photographs of many traditional domestic activities that continued into the 20th century.

Long strings of meat drying on rope [W883]

One of these is the preparation of "jerked" meat and pemmican. Jerked, or dried, meat was prepared by sun-drying thin slices of meat. To make pemmican, dried meat was pulverized by pounding in a rawhide mortar. It was then mixed with pounded cherries and tallow and packed in rawhide bags.

Old woman pounding choke cherries [W1117]
One of the tasks involved in making quillwork was pulling the long quills from a porcupine's tail.
Sources of Research Questions

Photographs can also be the starting point for research. For instance, in this picture Joseph Ratunda, a young Nez Perce, wears a pin labeled "First National Indian Congress, Spokane Fair, Sept 13-21, 1913." [W3550]. Little more is known about this "Congress"; was it a Wild West Show dance performance, implied by Ratunda's dance outfit?, or was it part of the budding Indian political consciousness of the early 20th century?

Other works on Reading American Indian Photographs

Blackman, Margaret

Fleming, Paula R., and Judith Luskey

Kavanagh, Thomas W.

Scherer, Joanna Cohan
Tribes Represented in the Wanamaker Collection

Apache
- Kiowa Apache (Anadarko, OK—1913)
- Jicarilla Apache (Jicarilla Res, NM—1913)
- Mescalero Apache (Mescalero Apache Res, NM—1913)
- San Carlos Apache (San Carlos Res, AZ—1913)
- White Mountain Apache (San Carlos Res, AZ—1913)

Arapaho
- (El Reno, OK—1913)
- (Wind River Res, WY—1913)

Arikara
- (Elbowoods, Fort Berthold Res, ND—1913)

Assiniboine
- (Crow Reservation, MT—1909)
- (Harlem, Fort Belknap Res, MT—1913)
- (Poplar, Fort Peck Res, MT—1913)

Bannock
- (Fort Hall Res, ID—1913)

Blackfoot
- (Crow Res, MT—1908)
- (Crow Res, MT—1909)
- (Browning, Blackfoot Res, MT—1913)
- (Spokane, WA—1913)

Blood
- (Browning, Blackfoot Res, MT—1913)

Piegan
- (Browning, Blackfoot Res, MT—1913)

Cahuilla
- (Banning, CA—1913)

Caddo
- (Anadarko, OK—1913)

Cayuse
- (Pendleton, Umatilla Res, OR—1913)

Cherokee
- (Tahlequah, OK—1913)

Chewella
- (Spokane, Colville Res, WA—1913)

Cheyenne
- (Crow Res, MT—1908)
- (Crow Res, MT—1909)

Northern Cheyenne (—1909)
- (Lame Deer, Tongue River Res, MT—1913)

Southern Cheyenne (Crow Res, MT—1909)
- (El Reno, OK—1913)

Chickasaw
- (Tishomingo, OK—1913)

Chippewa
- (Browning, Blackfoot Res, MT—1913)
- (Long Lake Res, MN—1913)
- (White Earth, White Earth Res, MN—1913)
- (Ashland, Bad River Res, WI—1913)
- (Ashland, Bad River Res, WI—1907)
- (Omigum, Leech Lake Res, MN—1913)
- (Omigum, Leech Lake Res, MN—1913)
- (Devil’s Lake Res, ND—1913)

Choctaw
- (Tuskahoma, OK—1913)
- (Tekoa, WA—1913)
- (Spokane, WA—1913)

Coeur D’Alene
- (Tekoa, WA—1913)
- (Spokane, WA—1913)

Columbia River
- (Shasta)
- (Warm Springs Res, OR—1913)

Comanche
- (Crow Res, MT—1909)
- (Anadarko, OK—1913)

Concow
- (Covola, Round Valley Res, CA—1913)

Creek
- (Okmulgee, OK—1913)

Crow
- (Crow Res, MT—1909-1913)

Delaware
- (Anadarko, OK—1913)

Flathead
- (Spokane, WA—1913)
- (Jocko, Flathead Res, MT—1913)
- (Ravalli, Flathead Res, MT)

Gros Ventre
- (Crow Res, MT—1909)
- (Harlem, Fort Belknap Res, MT—1913)

Havasupai
- (Cataract Canyon, Havasupai Res, Grand Canyon, AZ—1913)

Hidatsa
- (Elbowoods, Fort Berthold Res, ND—1913)

Hoh
- (Neah Bay, Makah Reservation, WA—1913)
Hoopa (Hoopa Valley Res, CA—1913)
Hopis (Hopi Res, AZ—1913)
Iroquois
Cayuga (Cattaraugus Res, NY—1913)
Mohawk (Hogansburg, St. Regis Res, NY—1913)
Oneida (Oneida, Oneida Res, WI—1913)
Onondaga (Syracuse, Onondaga Res, NY—1913)
Seneca (Akon, Tonawanda Res, NY—1913)
(Alleghany Res, NY—1913)
(Thomas Indian School, Cattaraugus Res, 1913)
(Tulalip, Tulalip Res, WA—1913)
(Salamanca, NY—1913)
(Tuscarora (Niagara, Tuscarora Res, NY—1913)
Kalapuya (Siletz, Siletz Res, OR—1913)
Kaliispel (Spokane, WA—1913)
Kansa (Otoe, OK—1913)
Kickapoo (Shawnee, OK—1913)
Kiowa (Crow Res, MT—1909)
(Klamath Falls, OR—1913)
(Klamath Res, OR—1913)
(Kootenai, Jocko, Flathead Res, MT—1913)
La Jolla (Banning, CA—1913)
Lake (Davenport, Colville Res, WA—1913)
Lemmi (Ft. Hall, Ft. Hall Res, ID—1913)
Makah (Neah Bay, Makah Res, WA—1913)
Mandan (Elbowoods, Fort Berthold Res, ND—1913)
Maricopa (Sacaton, Gila Res, AZ—1913)
Martinez (Banning, CA—1913)
Menominee (Neopit, Menominee Res, WI—1913)
Mesa Grande (Banning, CA—1913)
Mission Indians (Banning, CA—1913)
Moalalla (Siletz, Siletz Res, OR—1913)
Modoc (Klamath Falls, Klamath Res, OR—1913)
Mojave (Crow Res, MT—1907)
(Moon Alepy, Mojave Res, AZ—1913)
Morongo (Banning, CA—1913)
(Nova Scotia, Nova Scotia Res, CA)
Navajo (Ganado, Navajo Res, AZ—1913)
Nes Pelem (Spokane, Spokane Res, WA—1913)
Nez Perce (Lapwai, Nez Perce Res, ID—1913)
(Spokane, WA—1913)
Nisqualli (Tulalip, Tulalip Res, WA—1913)
Nomelackie (Covalo, Round Valley Res, CA—1913)
Okangon (Davenport, Colville Res, WA—1913)
Omaha (Winnebago, Winnebago Res, NE—1913)
Osage (Pawhuska, Osage Res, OK—1913)
Osetto (Neah Bay, Makah Res, WA—1913)
Otoe-Missouri (Otoe, OK—1913)
Paiute (Klamath Res, OR—1913)
(Warm Springs Res, OR—1913)
Pala Mission (Pala, CA—1913)
Papago (San Xavier Res, AZ—1913)
(Sacaton, Gila River Res, AZ—1913)
Pawnee (Pawnee, OK—1913)
Pechango (Pala, CA—1913)
Pima (Sacaton, Gila River Res, AZ—1913)
Pitt River (Covolo, Round Valley Res, CA—1913)
(Klamath Res, OR—1913)
Ponca (Otoe, OK—1913)
Potowatomie  (Shawnee, OK–1913)  
Pueblo  (Santa Fe, NM–1913)  
Acoma  (Acoma Res, NM–1913)  
Isleta  (Isleta Res, NM–1913)  
Laguna  (Casa Blanca, Laguna Res, NM–1913)  
Nambe  (Santa Fe, NM–1913)  
San Idelfonso  (Santa Fe, NM–1913)  
San Juan  (Santa Fe, NM–1913)  
Santa Clara  (Santa Fe, NM–1913)  
Taos  (Taos NM–1913)  
Tesuque  (Santa Fe, NM–1913)  
Puyallup  (Tacoma, WA–1913)  
Quileute  (Neah Bay, Makah Res, WA–19??)  
Redwood  (Covolo, Round Valley Res, CA–1913)  
Rincon  (Banning, CA–1913)  
Sac and Fox  (Shawnee, OK–1913)  
Salt River  (Sacaton, Gila River Res, AZ–1913)  
San Poil  (Spokane, Colville Res, WA–1913)  
Salish  (Jocko, Flathead Res, MT–1913)  
Seminole  (Wewoka, OK–1913)  
Serano  (Banning, CA–1913)  
Shasta  (Siletz, Siletz Res, OR–1913)  
Shawnee  (Shawnee, OK–1913)  
Shinnecock  (South Hampton, Long Island, Shinnecock Res, NY–1913)  
Shoshone  (Wind River, Wind River Res, WY–1913)  
( Fort Hall, Fort Hall Res, ID)  
Siletz  (Siletz Res, OR–1913)  
Sioux  
Blackfeet  (Fort Yates, Standing Rock Res, ND–1913)  
Lower Brulé  (Rosebud, Rosebud Res, SD–1913)  
Cheyenne River  (Crow Res, MT–1909)  
Cut Head  (Devil’s Lake Res, ND–1913)  
Devil’s Lake  (Devil’s Lake Res, ND–1913)  

Sioux  
Hunkpapa  (Fort Yates, Standing Rock Res, ND–1913)  
Miniconjou  (Cheyenne River Res, SD–1913)  
Oglala  (Crow Res, MT–1909)  
(Pine Ridge, pine Ridge Res, SD–1913)  
Crow Creek Band, Southern Yankton  (Crow Res, MT–1909)  
Sisseton  (Devil’s Lake Res, ND–1913)  
Wahpeton  (Devil’s Lake Res, ND–1913)  
Yankton  (Poplar, Fort Peck Res, MT–1913)  
( Fort Yates, Standing Rock Res, ND–1913)  
Yanktonai  (Poplar, Fort Peck Res, MT–1913)  
( Fort Yates, Standing Rock Res, ND–1913)  
( Crow Creek Res, SD–1913)  
( Greenwood, Yanktonai Res., SD–1913)  
( Poplar, Fort Peck Res, MT)  
Lower Yanktonai  (Fort Yates, Standing Rock Res, ND–1913)  
( Crow Creek Res, SD–1913)  

Skykomish  (Tulalip, Tulalip Res, WA–1913)  
Snohomish  (Tulalip, Tulalip Res, WA–1913)  
Snoqualmie  (Tulalip, Tulalip Res, WA–1913)  
Soboba  (Banning, CA–1913)  
Spokane  (Spokane, Spokane Res, WA–1913)  
Stockbridge  (Neopit, Menominee Res, WI–1913)  
Suquamish  (Fort Madison, Suquamish Res, WA–1913)  
Tulalip  (Tulalip, WA–1913)  
Uintah  (Fort Duchesne, Uintah & Ouray Res, UT–1913)  
Umatilla  (Crow Res, MT–1909)  
(Pendleton, Umatilla Res, OR–1913)  

Ute  
Uncompagre  (Fort Duchesne, Uintah and Ouray Res, UT–1913)  
Southern Ute  (Ignacio, Southern Ute Res, CO–1913)  


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place</th>
<th>Location Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Walla Walla</td>
<td>(Pendleton, OR—1913)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wasco</td>
<td>(Warm Springs, Warm Springs Res, OR—1913)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnebago</td>
<td>(Winnebago, Winnebago Res, NE—1913)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Wisconsin)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wichita</td>
<td>(Anadarko, OK—1913)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wylackie</td>
<td>(Covolo, Round Valley Res, CA—1913)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yahi</td>
<td>(San Francisco, CA—1913)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yakima</td>
<td>(North Yakima, WA—19??)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yuma</td>
<td>(Yuma, Yuma Res, CA—1913)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mrs. White Elk (Crow) [W1849]
About the Mathers Museum...

Traditions, values, and beliefs are revealed in the objects people create and use everyday. At the William Hammond Mathers Museum, Indiana University's accredited museum of world cultures, artifacts from near and far are collected, preserved, researched, and exhibited to increase our understanding of their makers.

Through its collections, exhibits, and programs, the museum is dedicated to preserving and promoting knowledge of the world's cultures, past and present. In all of its activities, the museum strives to further its audiences' understanding of both the diversity of the world's specific cultures and the underlying unity of culture as a human phenomenon.

Explore the diversity and creativity of our world through the museum's changing exhibits and programs. Visit the Mathers Museum exhibit hall at 416 N. Indiana Avenue, Bloomington, Indiana. The exhibit hall is open Tuesdays through Fridays, from 9 a.m. to 4:30 p.m.; and Saturdays and Sundays, from 1 to 4:30 p.m. Admission to the museum is free.