

**COHERENCE AND DIVERSITY  
IN SCHUBERT'S IMPROMPTUS, D. 935**

**BY  
JAE KYUNG SONG**

**Submitted to the faculty of the  
Jacobs School of Music in partial fulfillment  
of the requirements for the degree,  
Doctor of Music,  
Indiana University  
May, 2012**

Accepted by the Faculty of Indiana University, in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Music.

---

Edmund Battersby, Chair

Doctoral Committee

---

Evelyne Brancart

---

Shigeo Neriki

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF TABLES.....	ii
LIST OF EXAMPLES.....	iii
INTRODUCTION .....	1
Critics on Schubert's Music	
CHAPTER	
I.    Schubert and Impromptus, D. 935.....	4
II.   Coherence.....	8
A. Structure and Form	
B. Cyclic Organization	
III.  Diversity.....	19
A. Topics	
B. Textures	
1) Song Texture	
2) Chamber Music Texture	
3) Pianistic Texture	
CONCLUSION.....	38
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	40

## LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
1.	The Key Scheme and Formal Design of Schubert's Impromptu, D. 935	15

## LIST OF EXAMPLES

Example		Page
1.	Schubert, Impromptu in A-flat major, D. 935 no. 2, mm. 47–54.....	16
2.	Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 4, mm. 420–39.....	16
3.	Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 1, mm. 230–34.....	17
4.	Schubert, Impromptu in A-flat major, D. 935 no. 2, mm. 1–7.....	17
5.	Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 1, mm. 44–51.....	21
6.	Schubert, March in G minor, D. 819 no. 2, Trio, mm. 1–5.....	22
7.	Schubert, Impromptu in B-flat major, D. 935 no. 3, mm. 37–42.....	23
8.	Schubert, Impromptu in A-flat major, D. 935 no. 2, mm. 120–28.....	24
9.	Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 4, mm. 1–43.....	25
10.	Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 4, mm. 251–72.....	26
11.	Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 1, mm. 69–74.....	29
12.	Schubert, Impromptu in B-flat major, D. 935 no. 3, mm. 1–8.....	30
13.	Schubert, Impromptu in B-flat major, D. 935 no. 3, mm. 55–56.....	32
14.	Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 4, mm. 87–98.....	35
15.	Schubert, Impromptu in B-flat major, D. 935 no. 3, mm. 19–20.....	35
16.	Schubert, Impromptu in A-flat major, D. 935 no. 2, mm. 17–25.....	36
17.	Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 4, mm. 518–25.....	37

## INTRODUCTION

### Critics on Schubert's Music

Here we find, besides the most masterly compositional technique, life in every fiber; coloring down to the finest gradation; meaning everywhere; sharp expression in detail; and in the whole a suffusing Romanticism such as other works of Franz Schubert have already made known to us.

And the heavenly length of the symphony, like that of a thick novel in four volumes by, say, Jean Paul, another who can never come to an end, and indeed for the best reason, to give the reader something to chew on afterwards.<sup>1</sup>

Despite Schumann's famous praise of Schubert's music, Schubert's piano music has been accused of being too long, lacking in formal coherence, unpianistic, and therefore ineffective in public performance.<sup>2</sup> Even a critic such as Theodor W. Adorno complained about Schubert's thematic structures and their loose construction. In 1928, Adorno criticized the nature of Schubert music, calling it a "potpourri," and claiming that the music consists of a random arrangement of beautiful themes without inner connection or development.<sup>3</sup>

The survival of the theme as theme is guaranteed by the potpourri fitting theme against theme, without the need of any of them having enduring consequences.

Even conceding that everything in Schubert's music is natural rather than artificial, this growth, entirely fragmentary, and never sufficient, is not plantlike, but crystalline. As the preserving transformation into the potpourri confirms the formerly configurative atomization characteristic of Schubert—and through this the fragmentary

---

<sup>1</sup> Robert Schumann, *On Music and Musicians*, ed. Konrad Wolff, trans. Paul Rosenfeld (New York: Pantheon, 1946), 110.

<sup>2</sup> András Schiff, "Schubert's Piano Sonatas: Thoughts about Interpretation and Performance," in *Schubert Studies*, ed. Brian Newbould (Brookfield, VT: Ashgate, 1998), 191.

<sup>3</sup> Alfred Brendel, *Alfred Brendel on Music* (Chicago: A Cappella Books, 2007), 209.

character of his music, that makes it what it is—it illuminates Schubert’s landscape all at once.<sup>4</sup>

Adorno was not the first to criticize the structure and organization of Schubert’s music. Carl Spitteler, in his *Schubert Klaviersonaten* (1887), describes Schubert’s music as music with little tension, an even sweetness, and a deficiency of tempo. The English music critic and composer Hubert Parry (1897) also did not hesitate to express that “Schubert’s movements [for the piano] are in varying degrees diffuse in form, slipshod in craftsmanship and unequal in content.”

The change in opinion on Schubert’s piano music began with Donald Tovey’s essay “Tonality” in 1928. Tovey wrote that Schubert

in one stroke opened worlds of significance in these works: he suggested that the intellectual drive behind them need not be sought solely in theme manipulation, or in the Beethoven architectural schemes; it may be found equally in Schubert’s patterns of modulation, in the juxtaposition and combination of the tonal colors implied by the key in which he was composing.<sup>5</sup>

This of course suggested a different view of Schubert’s compositional impetus.

Despite the growing interest in rediscovering Schubert’s music among scholars and the increasing numbers of pianists and piano teachers becoming more aware of the beauty in Schubert’s piano music and learning and performing it more frequently than in the past, I believe that his music is still grossly underestimated. Charles Rosen in his famous book *The Classical Style* writes that “the structures of most of his [Schubert’s] large forms are mechanical in a way that is absolutely foreign to his models ... they are used by Schubert as molds, almost without referent to the material that was to be poured

---

<sup>4</sup> Theodor Adorno, “Schubert (1928),” *19th-Century Music* 29, no. 1 (summer 2005): 9.

<sup>5</sup> Donald Tovey, “Tonality,” *Music & Letters* 9 (1928): 41; quoted in Eva Badura-Skoda, “The Piano Works of Schubert,” in *Nineteenth Century Piano Music*, ed. R. Larry Todd (London: Routledge, 2004), 97.

into them,” and “some of the excitement naturally goes out these forms when they are so extended, but this is even a condition of the unforced melodic flow of Schubert’s music.”<sup>6</sup>

I have chosen Schubert’s Impromptus, D. 935, as my primary focus, because these pieces show a great deal of the composer’s creativeness and the sublime beauty of his piano writing. By examining these pieces in detail, I will try to suggest that criticism of the loose organization of Schubert’s music and his lack of musical substance are the result of our misunderstanding of his aesthetic idiom.

---

<sup>6</sup> Robert S. Hatten, “Schubert the Progressive: The Role of Resonance and Gestures in the Piano Sonata in A, D.959,” *Integral* 7 (1993): 39–40, citing Charles Rosen, *The Classical Style: Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven*, expanded ed. (New York: W. W. Norton, 1997), 518–20.

## CHAPTER 1

### SCHUBERT AND THE IMPROMPTUS

Franz Schubert completed the two sets of Four Impromptus, D. 899 and D. 935, toward the end of 1827, a year before his death. The first group, the Four Impromptus, D. 899, dates from the summer, between Schubert's visits to Dornbach and Graz. After the happy times at Graz, Schubert had difficulty in settling down to life in Vienna.<sup>7</sup> He was in poor health, suffering from severe headaches and frequent suffusions of blood to the head.<sup>8</sup> Despite these challenges, Schubert completed writing the song cycle *Winterreise* in October and the second set of four Impromptus, D. 935, in December.

After finishing the Impromptus D. 935 in December 1827, Schubert had a difficult placing them with a publisher. Tobias Haslinger, who had already published two other Impromptus by Schubert, D. 899, nos.1 and 2, showed little interest in the new set.<sup>9</sup> Similarly, Schott, where Schubert sent the pieces in April 1828, responded in October with a reply that they found the pieces "too difficult for little pieces and therefore they are unmarketable in France."<sup>10</sup> Impromptus during the early nineteenth century were generally simple in design, technically not too demanding, and accessible to amateur pianists. Schubert probably knew this trend and could have composed pieces that satisfied both the publishers' expectation and amateurs' taste, but he did not compromise or give up his individuality.

---

<sup>7</sup> Schubert returned to Vienna on 20 September in 1827. In a letter to Frau Pachler, Schubert wrote of his happiness at Graz and of his difficulty in settling down in Vienna. Quoted in Otto Erich Deutsch, *The Schubert Reader: A Life of Franz Schubert in Letters and Documents*, trans. Eric Blom (New York: W. W. Norton, 1947), 670.

<sup>8</sup> Maurice J. E. Brown, *The New Grove Schubert* (New York: W.W. Norton, 1984), 58.

<sup>9</sup> John Daverio, "One More Beautiful Memory of Schubert: Schumann's Critique of the Impromptus, D. 935," *Musical Quarterly* 84 (winter 2000): 607

<sup>10</sup> *Ibid.*, 607.

The remaining two Impromptus of the first set were published thirty years later by Tobias Haslinger's son, Karl Haslinger, and the second set of the Four Impromptus did not appear in print until it was published by another Viennese publisher, Diabelli, in 1839.

Schubert's Impromptus followed a tradition of characteristic piano pieces from the Bohemian composers Václav Tomášek and Jan Václav Voříšek. Tomášek composed small pieces beginning around 1810, designating them eclogues, rhapsodies, and dithyrambs.<sup>11</sup> Following his teacher, Voříšek composed piano miniatures similar to Tomášek's small pieces, in form, phrase structure, mood and harmony. The recapitulations are exactly the same as the beginnings and the phrase structure is symmetrical and regular.<sup>12</sup> Voříšek's works thus stay faithfully in the Classical tradition. They were viewed as the final stage in the tradition of writing independent minuets and trios of the eighteenth century, which showed a clear trend toward increasing individualization.<sup>13</sup> Voříšek named his piano miniature pieces "Impromptus," the first appearance of this title in piano literature.

Instead of simply imitating the tradition of these Bohemian composers, however, Schubert developed this genre in his own way. He certainly knew Voříšek's pieces, which did provide some stimulus for his own.<sup>14</sup> Like Voříšek and Tomášek, Schubert tended to prefer ternary form and enjoyed the beauty of the contrast between major and minor tonalities. But in general, Schubert's Impromptus were composed in larger forms,

---

<sup>11</sup> F. E. Kirby, *Music for Piano: A Short History*, with a foreword by Maurice Hinson (Portland, OR: Amadeus Press, 1995), 138.

<sup>12</sup> Ina Ham, "Franz Schubert's Impromptus D. 899 and D. 935: An Historical and Stylistic Study" (DMA document, University of Cincinnati, 2005), 7.

<sup>13</sup> *Ibid.*, 15.

<sup>14</sup> Brian Newbould, *Schubert: The Music and the Man* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 263.

harmonically more complex and requiring far greater challenges for both players and listeners than the small pieces of his predecessors.<sup>15</sup>

The first set of Impromptus is relatively less complex than the second; however, the four pieces in the first set also represent Schubert's creativity and foreshadow Romantic pianism. The first Impromptu in C minor from D. 899 is based on the opening theme, which serves as a basis for both lyrical and chordal sections. The structure of the first Impromptu does not fit into the sonata-allegro mode or typical ABA; it is closer to a series of variations upon two alternating minor and major themes, occasionally interrupted by a short link or an episode.<sup>16</sup> The second Impromptu offers a clear ABA structure, the B section having contrasting material.<sup>17</sup> The cheerful E-flat major Impromptu ends in minor, opposite to the minor–major transformation of the first Impromptu.

The third Impromptu, the Andante in G-flat major, is typically Schubertian, with a long cantabile line over a flowing arpeggio accompaniment and coloristic changes in harmony. The exploitation of sonority in the form of color produced by harmonic change and texture was something new, something typically Romantic.<sup>18</sup> This third Impromptu is a song without words in all but name, and one of intense expression.<sup>19</sup> The last piece of the first set of Impromptus is in ABA design, the two sections showing strong contrast. As in the second Impromptu, rapid passagework based on descending scales or arpeggios dominates the outer sections, whereas the inner section or trio contains more declamatory

---

<sup>15</sup> Daverio, "One More Beautiful Memory," 607.

<sup>16</sup> Kathleen Dale, "The Piano Music," in *The Music of Schubert*, ed. Gerald Abraham (New York: W. W. Norton, 1947), 119.

<sup>17</sup> Stewart Gordon, *A History of Keyboard Literature Music for the Piano and Its Forerunners* (New York: G. Schirmer, 1996), 234.

<sup>18</sup> Kirby, *Music for Piano*, 152.

<sup>19</sup> Elizabeth Norman McKay, *Schubert: The Piano and Dark Keys* (Tutzing: Schneider, 2009), 92.

or lyrical material in the minor.<sup>20</sup> Written in a major key signature, A-flat major, this Impromptu nevertheless starts in the minor key and the major key appears unexpectedly at m. 11.

The four works in the set of Impromptus, D. 935, were probably planned as a sequel to the previous D. 899 set: in Schubert's manuscript the first set of four Impromptus is numbered as 1 through 4 and the other four Impromptus of the second set as 5 through 8.<sup>21</sup> The four Impromptus in the second set seem to interrelate more than the first set of Impromptus did. In the following chapters I will discuss the coherence and diversity in the Impromptus, D. 935. I hope that this study of structure and organization will enable readers to understand Schubert's unique temperament and his considerable efforts to achieve coherence in his music. Analysis of the topics and textures of the Impromptus D. 935 will demonstrate Schubert's ingenuous musical language and how he suggested a new path to the Romantic generation.

---

<sup>20</sup> William Kinderman, "Schubert's Piano Music: Probing the Human Condition," in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 167.

<sup>21</sup> Kirby, *Music for Piano*, 152.

## CHAPTER 2

### COHERENCE

#### A. Structure and Form

Published posthumously by the Viennese firm of Diabelli, the D. 935 Impromptus were ignored by the *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*. The Impromptus did, however, inspire Schumann. In his review, published in the 14 December 1838 issue of the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik*, the journal that he edited himself, Schumann wrote that the first, second and fourth impromptus constitute “one more beautiful memory of Schubert.”<sup>22</sup>

Hence every page of the first two impromptus seems to whisper “Franz Schubert”: we discover him anew as we recognize him in his inexhaustible moods, and as he charms he deceives, and then grips us.

Yet I can hardly believe that Schubert really called these movements “impromptus”; the first is so obviously the first movement of a sonata, so perfectly executed and self-contained that there can be no doubt.

I consider the second impromptu to be the second movement of the same sonata; in key and character it is closely related to the first.

As far as closing movements are concerned Schubert’s friends must know whether or not he completed the sonata; one might perhaps regard the fourth impromptu as the finale, but while the key confirms this supposition, the rather casual design speaks against it.

Of course, these are suppositions that only an examination of the original manuscript would clarify.

But I do not consider them of little consequence; to be sure, titles and superscriptions matter little; on the other hand, a sonata is such a fine ornament in the wreath of a composer’s works that I would gladly add another one to Schubert’s many, indeed twenty.

So far as the third impromptu is concerned, I would have hardly taken it to be one of Schubert’s efforts, except, perhaps a youthful one; it is a set of by-and-large undistinguished variations on an equally undistinguished theme.

The variations are totally lacking in invention and fantasy, qualities that Schubert has displayed so creatively in other works of this genre.

---

<sup>22</sup> Daverio, “One More Beautiful Memory,” 605.

If one plays the first two impromptus in succession and joins them to the fourth one, in order to make a lively close, the result may not be a complete sonata, but at least we will have one more beautiful memory of Schubert.

If one is already familiar with his style, only a single play through will be necessary to grasp the work perfectly.<sup>23</sup>

Schumann discovered the discrepancy between the title “Impromptus” and the actual substance of Schubert’s pieces, a discrepancy especially pronounced in the first Impromptu of the second set.<sup>24</sup> Alfred Einstein agreed with Schumann’s speculation about the Impromptus, D. 935:

It is true that the title of the first was Schubert’s own invention (on the manuscript and in the letter to Schott dated 21 February, 1828) and he even agreed to separate editions of the individual movements, probably, however, for the simple reason that he thought that they would stand an easier chance of being sold as “Impromptus” than as a sonata.<sup>25</sup>

It is no surprise that the tighter design of the four Impromptus, D. 935, led Schumann and Einstein to believe that parts of this opus originally belonged to a sonata.<sup>26</sup> But the importance of this second set of impromptus is not just in its resemblance to a sonata. Perhaps the greater importance is in Schubert’s experimentation with new formal structures, especially in the longer pieces where he appears to have strongly rejected established sonata form, with its associated concepts of development, incorporating in its place much repetition and some variation techniques.<sup>27</sup>

The first section of the first Impromptu in F minor is similar to a sonata exposition structure, but the middle section, a dialogue between treble and bass

---

<sup>23</sup> Robert Schumann, *Tagebücher*, Bd. 1, 1827–1838, ed. Georg Eismann (Leipzig: VEB Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1971): 96; *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* 9 (December 1838): 192–93; translated in Daverio, “One More Beautiful Memory,” 606.

<sup>24</sup> *Ibid.*, 607.

<sup>25</sup> Alfred Einstein, *Schubert: A Musical Portrait* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1951), 284.

<sup>26</sup> Kinderman, “Schubert’s Piano Music,” 168.

<sup>27</sup> McKay, *Piano and Dark Keys*, 87.

accompanied by arpeggios in the middle register, confuses the sonata scheme. After a full recapitulation of the first section, the music from the middle section returns, first in F minor, then in major. The closing restates part of the opening theme in the original key, with a new cadence.<sup>28</sup> The first section would certainly qualify as an exposition of sonata form, but it lacks both the double bar and development. The development, as Einstein says, has been replaced by an episode that contrasts completely in style and has no thematic connection with the exposition.<sup>29</sup>

The first Impromptu is clearly not written in sonata form; rather it is in an A<sup>1</sup>–B<sup>1</sup>–A<sup>2</sup>–B<sup>2</sup>–Coda structure. If Schubert had planned this Impromptu as the first movement of a sonata, it might have been more natural for him to recapitulate only the first section rather than restating the middle (B) section. Although he did write a sonata form without development for the final movement of his 1817 Piano Sonata in A minor, D. 537,<sup>30</sup> this procedure never happened in the first movements of his piano sonatas. Schubert was not in the habit of experimenting with first-movement structure in his sonatas.<sup>31</sup> The last three piano sonatas written in 1828, those in C minor, D. 958, A major, D. 959, and B-flat major D. 960, all have sonata-form first movements in common; and even the first movement of the G-major Sonata, D. 894 (written in 1826), subtitled “Fantaisie” by publisher, is composed in sonata form.

The second Impromptu, the Allegretto in A-flat major, is in three-part form with rounded binary form making up each part. As the middle section is called “trio,” it can also be viewed as a sort of minuet.

---

<sup>28</sup> Kinderman, “Schubert’s Piano Music,” 168.

<sup>29</sup> Kirby, *Music for Piano*, 152.

<sup>30</sup> McKay, *Piano and Dark Keys*, 96.

<sup>31</sup> Gordon, *History of Keyboard Literature*, 234.

The third Impromptu is a theme and variations, a form not particularly associated with the impromptu or even with the character piece.<sup>32</sup> As we have seen, Schumann rated the third Impromptu as “by-and-large undistinguished variations on an equally undistinguished theme.” Yet this set of theme and variations is nicely contrasted and musically appealing. It is one of the most famous Impromptu in the second set, often programmed separately in recitals.

The last Impromptu resembles the irregular rondo structure that often appears in Schubert sonatas. Despite such a resemblance, the piece is divided into three main sections, A B A', with a powerful coda. The rhythmic vitality of the outer sections derives from the unpredictable accentuation and alternation of duple and triple meter.<sup>33</sup> The central section is constructed around two contrasting and repetitive melodic ideas, which alternate throughout the 236 measures. The first idea is a scalar melody with a sustained or repeated A-flat bass; the second is a melodic pattern marked *con delicatezza*.<sup>34</sup> In this section, the climax is reached in scale passages for both hands, rapid four descending octaves in A major across the entire keyboard. The ending is highly impressive: a quiet, mysterious passage is broken off by a virtuosic coda employing octaves in both hands.<sup>35</sup>

The definition of the word “impromptu” is: 1) made or done without previous preparation: an impromptu address to the unexpected crowds; 2) suddenly or hastily prepared, made, etc.: an impromptu dinner; 3) improvised; having the character of an

---

<sup>32</sup> Kirby, *Music for Piano*, 152.

<sup>33</sup> Kinderman, “Schubert’s Piano Music,” 168.

<sup>34</sup> McKay, *The Piano and Dark Keys*, 101.

<sup>35</sup> Kinderman, “Schubert’s Piano Music,” 168.

improvisation.<sup>36</sup> The musical genre impromptu counts as one of several smaller forms composed for piano in the first half of the nineteenth century; these stand in the same relation to the sonata as the short story to the novel.<sup>37</sup> Because fewer preconceptions exist concerning such pieces, Schubert had greater freedom to experiment with structure in the impromptu than in the more formally bound sonata, a genre already consolidated by his predecessors.<sup>38</sup>

As Einstein states in his book *A Musical Portrait*, in Schubert's Impromptus there is nothing sketchy. Each is simple in form, yet every detail is filled in; the "microcosm" is all-important.<sup>39</sup> In this miniature genre, Schubert attempted a fresh approach to an extended work for solo piano—one that would enable him to expand musical content and expressive range without the restrictions of Classical sonata forms.<sup>40</sup> The short Romantic piano piece, which had already been invented, was raised to an art form of the highest order by Schubert.<sup>41</sup>

In Schubert's generation two epochs overlapped. During the first quarter of the nineteenth century Beethoven's maturity, the apex of Classicism, coincided with the first breakthrough of the Romantic spirit in the music of Weber and Schubert. Beethoven's sense of form, matured to the highest spirituality in his last works, is opposed by the Romantic overflow of feeling where form tends to be felt rather as a restriction. Schubert

---

<sup>36</sup> <http://www.dictionary.reference.com/browse/impromptu> .

<sup>37</sup> Susan McClary, "The Impromptu That Trod on a Loaf: Or How Music Tells Stories," *Narrative* 5, no. 1 (January 1997): 24.

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*, 24.

<sup>39</sup> Einstein, *A Musical Portrait*, 289.

<sup>40</sup> McKay, *The Piano and Dark Keys*, 102.

<sup>41</sup> Newbould, *The Music and the Man*, 263.

accepted formal lay-out as a reliable basis for symmetry, but modified it for his musical needs.<sup>42</sup>

The music of the second set of Schubert's Impromptus is not constrained by rigid Classical boundaries; using these boundaries as a starting point, he diffuses them with his own ingenuity. The starting points of the first, second, and fourth Impromptus are all simple ABA. But by adopting rhetorical markers of the sonata-form and displaying symmetry of construction within the ABA structure, Schubert exhibits his individual realizations of sonata form and his Classical inheritance. This music is certainly neither a random arrangement of beautiful themes nor mechanically structured. Schubert's skillful manipulation of Classical conventions successfully achieves both coherence and freshness.

---

<sup>42</sup> Hans Gal, *Franz Schubert and the Essence of Melody*, trans. author (London: Victor Gollancz, 1974), 49.

## B. Cyclic Organization

The technical meaning of the word “cycle” is a large-scale formal category concerned with the interrelationships and dependencies between a series of drawings, poems, songs, or movements. In general, the term implies something about a formal process that binds together a series of works, generally by means of recurring image or, in the case of music, the reappearance of motivic or thematic elements across the boundaries of the separate pieces.<sup>43</sup>

With Haydn and then particularly with Beethoven, large-scale coherence and cyclic organization came to play a more distinctive role in music. Considering Schubert’s preoccupation with the subtler forms of cyclic organization in his mature sonatas, chamber works, and symphonic works, we might expect he would have organized in similar ways any works for which he conceived comparable status.<sup>44</sup> The cyclic organization is certainly found in both sets of Impromptu. The first set is a successful early experiment in progressive tonality, while the second set shows clearer signs of cyclic organization through motivic and unique tonal elements.<sup>45</sup>

The cyclic organization of the Impromptu, D. 935 has already been studied by Charles Fisk in his book *Returning Cycles* and in Ina Ham’s dissertation.<sup>46</sup> Nonetheless, I am including cyclic organization in my essay to show that Schubert’s compositional process was not just spontaneous but carefully planned.

---

<sup>43</sup> Kristina Muxfeldt, “Schubert Song Studies” (PhD diss., State University of New York at Stony Brook, 1991), 132–33.

<sup>44</sup> Charles Fisk, *Returning Cycles: Contexts for the Interpretation of Schubert's Impromptu and Last Sonatas* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001), 148.

<sup>45</sup> *Ibid.*, 148.

<sup>46</sup> Ham, “Franz Schubert’s Impromptu.”

In the Impromptus, D. 935, the tonal scheme instantly offers a cyclic impression. Notably, as we see in Table 1, the first and last Impromptus, both in F minor, share not only the key signature but also their tonal plan, in a relation by third (F minor-A flat major/minor-F minor).<sup>47</sup>

Table 1. The Key Scheme and Formal Design of Schubert's Impromptus, D. 935

Number	Keys and formal design		
1	Fm	A-flat M	Fm
	A <sup>1</sup>	B <sup>1</sup> (A-flat m-A-flat M)	A <sup>2</sup> (Fm-FM)-B <sup>2</sup> (Fm-FM)-Coda(Fm)
2	A-flat M	D-flat M	A-flat M
	A(G-flat m, D-flat M)	B (D-flat m, F#m=G-flat m)	A
3	B -flat M		
	Theme and Variations: Var. 3 (B-flat m)-Var. 4 (G-flat M-D flat M-G-flat M)		
4	Fm	A-flat M	Fm
	A	B (A-flat M/A-flat m)	A' – Coda(D-flat M-Fm)

The coda of the final Impromptu in F minor, where the section starts in D-flat major, is the only place that departs from the general tonal plan (see Ex. 2). This D-flat major sonority sounds familiar to some extent as it is a memory of the earlier *Trio* section of the A-flat major Impromptu (see Ex. 1).<sup>48</sup> The key of D-flat major and the chordal

<sup>47</sup> Ibid., 39.

<sup>48</sup> Ibid., 39–40.

articulation bring back that memory. The opening alternation of the tonic harmony with a dominant seventh in first inversion<sup>49</sup> makes the memory even clearer.

Example 1. Schubert, Impromptu in A-flat major, D. 935 no. 2, mm. 47–54

Example 1 shows a musical score for Schubert's Impromptu in A-flat major, D. 935 no. 2, measures 47–54. The score is in 3/4 time and A-flat major. It features a piano (*p*) dynamic. The right hand has a melodic line with slurs and accents, while the left hand provides a harmonic accompaniment with slurs and accents. Fingerings are indicated with numbers 1-5.

Example 2. Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 4, mm. 420–39

Example 2 shows a musical score for Schubert's Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 4, measures 420–39. The score is in 3/4 time and F minor. It features dynamics of fortissimo (*fp*), decrescendo (*decresc.*), and pianissimo (*pp*). The right hand has a melodic line with slurs and accents, while the left hand provides a harmonic accompaniment with slurs and accents. Fingerings are indicated with numbers 1-5.

<sup>49</sup> Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, 177.

The opening of the second Impromptu sounds as if it comes from the final chord of the first impromptu (see Ex. 3 and 4). The chords are in the same register, and they share almost the same voicing.<sup>50</sup>

Example 3. Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 1, mm. 230–34

Example 4. Schubert, Impromptu in A-flat major, D. 935 no. 2, mm. 1–7

<sup>50</sup> Ibid., 159.

The musical links are found even in the third Impromptu in B-flat major, which Schumann preferred to exclude from the set. Not only the G-flat and D-flat sonority in the fourth variation of the third Impromptu have resonance with the *Trio* section of the second Impromptu; also the C–B–C neighbor figure in the coda of the third Impromptu plays an significant role in the opening theme of the final Impromptu.<sup>51</sup> The opening theme of the final Impromptu in F minor also recalls the opening of the first Impromptu in the same key with an emphasis on the fifth and sixth scale degrees and a syncopated second-beat accent introduced by a leap of a fourth.<sup>52</sup>

The cyclic organization in Schubert Impromptus, D. 935 is different from the cyclic relationship we often find in his song cycles. Even these song cycles do not have a literal return of earlier moments, as we see in Beethoven's *An de ferne Geliebte* and songs from Schumann's *Dichterliebe*, they do share poetic or narrative unifying means.<sup>53</sup> The Impromptus, D. 935, however, employ other types of unifying devices, such as the key relationship between two adjacent pieces and subtle musical gestures. Compared with the unifying devices in the song cycles, these devices create more integrity and balance. Furthermore, this type of cyclic organization is a more painstaking process than the direct or literal cyclic process, as it requires a far more detailed and accurate sketch. Therefore, we have to realize that Schubert's Impromptus, D. 935 are not a byproduct of Schubert's spontaneity, but an outcome of his careful planning.

---

<sup>51</sup> Harald Krebs, review of *Returning Cycles: Contexts for the Interpretation of Schubert's Impromptus and Last Sonatas* by Charles Fisk, *Music Theory Spectrum* 25, no. 2 (fall 2003): 396.

<sup>52</sup> Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, 172.

<sup>53</sup> Ham, "Franz Schubert's Impromptus," 26.

## CHAPTER 3

### DIVERSITY

In the course of composing the Impromptu, D. 935, Schubert expanded his creative range enormously, both externally and internally.<sup>54</sup> Probably it was not an easy situation for Schubert to write such a creative composition, as his immediate predecessors were great innovators. Especially through his thirty-two piano sonatas, Beethoven not only refined the Classic musical language but also opened the new chapter of the Romantic era. For instance, he explored pure piano sonority and Romantic harmonic language in the first movement of the Piano Sonata No. 14 in C-sharp minor, *Quasi una fantasia*, Op. 27, No. 2 (familarly known as the *Moonlight Sonata*), and with the last movement of the Piano Sonata No. 21 in C major, Op. 53, *Waldstein*, Beethoven showed his ability to mix and match diverse musical topics and textures within a single movement. The angelic sound in the opening of the last movement of the *Waldstein Sonata*, gradually changes to an orchestral sound with trills, scales and octaves. The ethereal opening is based on a tuneful song and the orchestral-like section (mm. 62–113) has the character of a Russian dance.<sup>55</sup>

The doctrine of the affections, the idea that music could represent affections, was a dominant principle for early eighteenth-century music and also an important factor in Classic music.<sup>56</sup> An affection was a static emotional state; people, or pieces of music, remained in a particular affection until an internal or external stimulus changed the state. The more fluid concept of emotions, which could change rapidly, developed during the

---

<sup>54</sup> McKay, *Piano and Dark Keys*, 102.

<sup>55</sup> Brendel, *Alfred Brendel on Music*, 72.

<sup>56</sup> Leonard G. Ratner, *Classic Music: Expression, Form and Style* (New York: Schirmer, 1980), 4.

century. The doctrine of the affections was first applied specifically to vocal music, where the text gave a clue for expression.<sup>57</sup> In instrumental music, musical “topics” were associated with various affections, providing diversity and drama in music.

Like Beethoven, Schubert adopted and enjoyed juxtaposing various musical topics and textures in his music. Schubert managed these topics and textures with great ease within the forms that Beethoven created. He considerably loosened what held a form together and stretched its connections.<sup>58</sup> The greatness of Schubert’s music is that the episodes formulated by various topics and textures communicate mysteriously with one another.<sup>59</sup>

### A. Topics

Baroque music tended to develop one idea, affection, or topic throughout a piece, maintaining unity through consistency. But mixtures and contrasts of topics became increasingly frequent in Classic music, and well-marked mixtures and contrasts of topics became more frequently used as expressive devices in Romantic music.<sup>60</sup> Schubert was one of the composers who favored manipulation of musical topics, but he used them with a freedom and inspiration as if he had invented this idea himself.

In the Impromptu, D. 935, we find many examples of his predilection for musical topics. The first notable example is related to his Viennese origin. Schubert’s piano music has certain distinguishing features, one of the most obvious being the “Viennese dialect.” It appears not only in dances and marches but also in a number of other pieces

---

<sup>57</sup> Ibid., 5.

<sup>58</sup> Rosen, *Classical Style*, 520.

<sup>59</sup> Brendel, *Alfred Brendel on Music*, 47.

<sup>60</sup> Ratner, *Classic Music*, 26.

that are not named as such.<sup>61</sup> The second theme of the first Impromptu in F minor presents the Viennese idiom, especially related to march, in which the second beat is regarded as the feminine ending of the first, emphasized beat in moderately in quick duple meter (see Ex. 5). As the Viennese idiom suggests, the appoggiaturas such as in mm. 48 should be clearly performed short and late, almost on the following down beat.<sup>62</sup> The Viennese idiom and *march* topic reference is more comprehensible if we compare this passage with the *Trio* section of the G-minor March for piano duet, D. 819 no. 2 (see Ex. 6).<sup>63</sup>

Example 5. Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 1, mm. 44–51

<sup>61</sup> Konrad Wolff, *Masters of the Keyboard: Individual Style Elements in the Piano Music of Bach, Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert, Chopin, and Brahms* (Bloomington: Indiana University, 1990), 184.

<sup>62</sup> *Ibid.*, 184.

<sup>63</sup> *Ibid.*, 185.

Example 6. Schubert, March in G minor, D. 819, no.2, Trio, mm. 1-5



Other dance-related topics appear distinctively in the second A-flat major Impromptu. As a dance the sarabande disappeared toward the end of the eighteenth century, yet the characteristic style was maintained. The crucial characteristic of sarabande was the emphasis on the second beat of its triple measure in a slow tempo<sup>64</sup> and this character is well-retained in the outer section of the second Impromptu. In the second Impromptu, the serious character of the sarabande is heightened by the chordal texture, and the character and texture simultaneously evoke the feeling of a hymn. The *Trio* section continues the sarabande character with the accented second beat in the left hand, sometimes in both hands. With the arpeggiated triplets, the serious sarabande is transformed into a Romantic one.

The simple nature of the theme of the third Impromptu combines neatly with the simple character of the second A-flat major Impromptu. The third Impromptu is a set of variations on a theme that Schubert had previously used in the incidental music to *Rosamunde*, D. 797 and in the slow movement of the A-minor String Quartet, D. 804. The association with the *Rosamunde* incidental music is also found in variations 2 and 5 of the third Impromptu. These variations share the quality of ballet music: the repetition of a staccato eighth note and syncopated quarter note in the left hand resembles ballet steps (see Ex. 7). In fact, the *Rosamunde* incidental music contains two examples of

<sup>64</sup> Ratner, *Classic Music*, 11.

ballet music; therefore it is probably no coincidence that the two variations in the third Impromptu evoke the same genre. By using a dance-related topic, this Impromptu modestly alters a lyrical theme to light-hearted Viennese music.

Example 7. Schubert, Impromptu in B-flat major, D. 935 no. 3, mm. 37–42

The coda of the third Impromptu, based on the theme, quietly closes and summarizes the variation. Just as the Prater is not far from St. Stephen's in Vienna, Schubert enjoyed blending elements of dance music and church music.<sup>65</sup> Whereas the second Impromptu of D. 935 presents church music and dance music simultaneously in the outer section, the coda of the third Impromptu separates the solemnity of the hymn from its dance-like variations (see Ex. 8).

<sup>65</sup> Wolff, *Masters of the Keyboard*, 185.

Example 8. Schubert, Impromptu in A-flat major, D. 935 no.3, mm. 120–28

The Impromptu in F minor, the most brilliant work in the set, suggests the influence of Hungarian and Bohemian (Central European) music in comparison to the Viennese music of the third, B-flat major Impromptu. Schubert spent his life mostly in Vienna or its vicinity, but during the summers in 1818 and 1824 he worked as music master to the Esterhazy family in their summer home at Zseliz in Hungary. While working for this noble Hungarian family, it is entirely possible that he was more exposed to Hungarian music than he would have been in Vienna, and became more familiar with its idiom. The Hungarian Melody in B minor, D. 817, a piece he composed shortly after returning to Vienna in 1824, clearly shows this influence. In the final Impromptu in F minor, the cross-rhythms and shifted accents at mm. 17–36 have the quality of a rapid and fiery Bohemian dance called *furiant*,<sup>66</sup> and the trills emphasized by syncopated accents followed by rapid scale passages also show the influence of Bohemian music (see Ex. 9).<sup>67</sup>

Example 9. Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 4, mm. 1–43

<sup>66</sup> Badura-Skoda, *Piano Works of Schubert*, 142.

<sup>67</sup> Kinderman, "Schubert's Piano Music," 168.



Example 10. Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 4, mm. 251–72

Whereas the outer sections show the strong influence of Hungarian music, the middle section anticipates the expressive developments of the Romantic fantasy.<sup>68</sup> The middle section consists of an introductory scalar passage (mm. 87–130), dance-like material (mm. 131–97), and closing material that recalls both the scalar passage and the dance (mm. 197–271).<sup>69</sup> The fantasia style in the introductory scalar passage, recognizable by elaborate figuration, shifting harmonies, sudden contrasts, and a sense of

<sup>68</sup> McKay, *Piano and Dark Keys*, 102.

<sup>69</sup> Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, 174.

improvisation, abruptly switches to a fast dance. And when finally these two different styles interlock, the music becomes more intense and brilliant (see Ex. 10). As we see in the final Impromptu, the incorporation of the brilliant style into the fantasy was one of the most typical characteristics of Romantic fantasies, and this Impromptu anticipates Chopin's *Fantasia–Impromptu*.

Mozart and Beethoven were not the only masters at mixing and coordinating topics. Schubert was also aware of them and knew how to treat them in his own way. The topics in the Impromptus, D. 935 are used as rhetorical markers, and the contrast between dance and serious topics gives a lively character to the music. Recognition of these expressive devices will help us to approach Schubert's compositional intentions and understand his ingenious and unique musical language.

## **B. Texture**

Schubert was a pianist all his life. Although he had started playing the violin before he studied the piano, and though he was an ardent string player in the family quartet as well as in his school orchestra, piano was the instrument he was most deeply involved with, whether as soloist, duettist, or accompanist.<sup>70</sup>

About Schubert's manner of performing piano music, his brother Ferdinand wrote in the Leipzig *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik*:

Although Schubert never represented himself as a pianoforte virtuoso, any connoisseur who had the chance of hearing him in private circles will nevertheless attest that he knew how to treat his instrument with mastery and in a quite peculiar [i e., original] manner, so that a great specialist in

---

<sup>70</sup> Dale, "Piano Music," 111.

music to whom he once played his last sonatas exclaimed: “Schubert, I almost admire your playing even more than your compositions!”<sup>71</sup>

Schubert was not a brilliant pianist; nevertheless, his instinct for the possibilities of the instrument was powerful.<sup>72</sup> He evokes an orchestra, a chamber music group, or a lied singer on the piano, but in a pianistic style.<sup>73</sup> He not only knew each instrument and voice individually and collectively; their language was his language and he was a native speaker of their idioms of expression.<sup>74</sup> Furthermore, he knew how reproduce these idioms on the piano. In the Impromptus, D. 935, song and chamber-music textures as well as pure pianistic texture coexist. The diversified and idiomatic use of the instrument brings color and diversity to the music.

### 1) Song Texture

During his mere thirty-one years of life, Schubert wrote more than six hundred songs. Though he did not invent the Lied, he did open a new chapter in its long history.<sup>75</sup> Song-writing was natural to him; he expressed himself most easily in song.<sup>76</sup> The melodies in his songs have a quality of pathos, of direct appeal to the listener, which is a reflection of

---

<sup>71</sup> Schubert’s brother wrote in the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* for 23 April–3 May 1839 in the course of his article “From Franz Schubert’s Life,” cited in Elizabeth Norman McKay, *The Impact of the New Pianofortes on Classical Keyboard Style: Mozart, Beethoven and Schubert* (Stourbridge, West Midlands: Lynwood Music, 1987), 83.

<sup>72</sup> Brendel, *Alfred Brendel on Music*, 142.

<sup>73</sup> *Ibid.*, 143

<sup>74</sup> T. C. L. Pritchard, “The Schubert Idiom,” in *The Music of Schubert*, ed. Gerald Abraham (New York: W. W. Norton, 1947), 235.

<sup>75</sup> Alec Robertson, “The Songs,” in *The Music of Schubert*, ed. Abraham, 152.

<sup>76</sup> Gordon, *History of Keyboard Literature*, 213.

the sweetness and sensitivity of his own temperament.<sup>77</sup> Schubert's song-writing influenced both the nature of the themes and the structure of his piano music.<sup>78</sup>

The first notable song texture in the Impromptu, D. 935 appears the first Impromptu in F minor, mm. 69–114. Two things happen simultaneously at mm. 69: the A-flat major arpeggio shifts to the minor mode and the octave A-flat in the bass sets the register and starts the dialogue.<sup>79</sup> This section suggests a duet in which the melodic fragments in different registers call to each other across the accompanimental arpeggio (see Ex. 11). The alternating melody represents voices of different inner character that depend on each other for fulfillment.<sup>80</sup> It also resembles an intimate dialogue between man and woman, in which, as the dialogue progresses; the music becomes more harmonically enriched.

Example 11. Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 1, mm. 69–74

<sup>77</sup> Brown, *New Grove Schubert*, 88.

<sup>78</sup> Wolff, *Masters of the Keyboard*, 173.

<sup>79</sup> Scott Burnham, "Schubert and the Sound of Memory," *Musical Quarterly* 84 (winter 2000): 659.

<sup>80</sup> Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, 157.



## 2) Chamber Music Texture

Although Schubert was known best for his Lieder, and vocal expression lies at the center of his music, it was chamber music in which he showed a steady and consistent development throughout his creative life.<sup>83</sup> Like song, chamber music was close to him from an early age. His first instrument was the violin and his family quartet provided an environment for him to experiment with the chamber idiom.

In the Impromptu, D. 935, the third Impromptu reveals his close relationship with chamber music. As I have mentioned earlier, the theme of the variation was previously used in the second movement of String Quartet No. 13 in A minor, D. 804. This affiliation to chamber music appears not only in the musical materials of the theme but also in the textures throughout the variations of the third Impromptu. For example, the first variation in four-part texture could be performed by a string quartet without any alteration.

The staccato eighth notes in the accompaniment of the theme are reminiscent of the pizzicato of a bass instrument (see Ex. 12). This pizzicato imitation also appears in the second, third, and last variations. The third variation offers more challenge than the second and last variations, as the pizzicato-like bass notes are followed by repetition of chords. But Schubert's accent marking on the chords after the pizzicato bass resolves the technical difficulty generated by jumping from these bass notes to the repeated chords (see Ex. 13).

---

<sup>83</sup> Samuel L. Laciari, "The Chamber-Music of Franz Schubert," *Musical Quarterly* 14, no. 4 (October 1928): 533.

Example 13. Schubert, Impromptu in B-flat major, D. 935 no. 3, mm. 55–56

In Schubert's music, we can easily find passages notated with slurs over staccato marks. When the dots and slurs are notated together as we see in the theme, variation 3, and coda of the last variation, detached notes are generally tied by the pedal.<sup>84</sup> But this effect is more naturally achieved on string instruments than on the piano.

### 3) Piano Texture

Unlike Mozart and Beethoven, Schubert was not a concert pianist and he did not even own a piano until the end of his life. Nevertheless, this unusual situation never detracted from the idiomatic perfection of his piano writing,<sup>85</sup> and the piano was used as the medium of expression for many of his major works. The finest writing for the piano is found even in the songs, the accompaniments of which show his creative powers and poetic inspiration.<sup>86</sup> The same inventive powers in writing for the piano are also displayed in his chamber music.

During Schubert's time, the piano underwent an amazing technical development. By the 1820s, the Viennese piano had extended its range from five octaves to six or six

<sup>84</sup> Brendel, *Alfred Brendel on Music*, 145.

<sup>85</sup> Wolff, *Masters of the Keyboard*, 160.

<sup>86</sup> Olga Samaroff, "The Piano Music of Schubert," *Musical Quarterly* 14, no. 4 (October 1928): 600.

and a half. The increased strength of the strings and supporting structure made it possible to create a fuller and more prolonged sound. Heavier hammers and improvements to the repetition of the action supported the better sound projection. This expansion of instrumental possibilities influenced and stimulated composers' creativity and led to developments in piano writing.<sup>87</sup>

Although vocal and chamber music textures coexist in the Impromptus, D. 935, these pieces show more a direct pianistic approach than any other of Schubert's piano compositions. From first to last, this set of Impromptus represents Schubert's masterly and idiomatic piano writing.

First, the pedal became essential in many passages. Even before Beethoven, Haydn had achieved a special sound color by indicating open pedal in the first movement of the piano sonata in C major, Hob XVI: 50. However, Beethoven dramatically extended the possibilities of piano sound with the help of the damper pedals and the fast, responsive touch of the new pianos. The blurring of harmonies through the raised dampers was used more subtly and delicately in Beethoven's piano music than in that of any of his predecessors. In the opening of the first movement of the *Moonlight Sonata*, Beethoven specifically wrote two pedal indications: "*Si deve suonare tutto questo pezzo delicatissimamente e senza sordino*" (The whole piece should be played with the utmost delicacy and without dampers) followed by "*Semper pianissimo e senza sordino*" (pianissimo throughout and without dampers). These instructions are vague, but it is clear that Beethoven wanted the piano sound to be vibrated with delicacy. The intimacy of the Romantic harmonic language is maximized by pure pianistic sound and resonance.

---

<sup>87</sup> Ibid., 598.

One other place where Beethoven experiments with the pedal is in the opening of the last movement of the *Waldstein Sonata*. The pedal blurs tonic and dominant sound from the beginning. The ethereal color is magically produced by blurred harmonies from the sustained pedal in mm. 13–23.

Like Beethoven, Schubert was aware of the resonance and overtones the pedal can create. The coloristic pedaling became more essential in Schubert's music. If the duet-like section in the first Impromptu in F minor (see Ex. 11) is played without pedal, the intimate dialogue between the two voices will become dry and repetitive. The pedal makes the change of harmony more expressive and the nuances of the music more convincing. That is probably why Schubert specifically indicates *con pedale* at mm. 69. The same idea applies to passages in the last Impromptu in F minor. In the beginning of the middle section, mm. 87–120 (see Ex. 14), the pedal is essential for effective color changes. As mentioned earlier, this passage has a fantasy character, and we need both damper pedal and soft pedal to achieve ethereal sound. Moreover, the use of the pedal maximizes the contrast between the fantasy-like section and the following dance-like section, marked *con delicatezza*.

Example 14. Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 4, mm. 87–98

The musical score for Example 14 shows two systems of music. The first system covers measures 87 to 92, and the second system covers measures 93 to 98. The right hand (treble clef) plays a continuous, flowing melodic line with various fingering numbers (1-4) indicated above the notes. The left hand (bass clef) provides a harmonic accompaniment with chords and moving lines, also featuring some fingering numbers. The piece is marked *legato* and *pp* (pianissimo). The time signature is 3/5 and the key signature is F minor.

Schubert was one of the first composers who achieved a long singing line by using the right hand for the simultaneous playing of the lyrical melody and part of the accompaniment.<sup>88</sup> For example, in the third Impromptu of D. 935, to bring out the melody the top melody should be played with the outer fingers, and the damper pedal is necessary for emphasizing the lyrical quality (see Ex. 15).

Example 15. Schubert Impromptu in B-flat major, D. 935 no. 3, mm. 19–20

The musical score for Example 15 shows two systems of music, labeled 'Var. I'. The right hand (treble clef) plays a continuous, flowing melodic line with various fingering numbers (4, 5, 4, 4, 5, 4, 5, 5, 4) indicated above the notes. The left hand (bass clef) provides a harmonic accompaniment with chords and moving lines, also featuring some fingering numbers (4, 2). The piece is marked *legato* and *pp* (pianissimo). The time signature is 3/5 and the key signature is B-flat major.

<sup>88</sup> Wolff, *Masters of the Keyboard*, 164.

The longer and the fuller sound capability of the newly developed piano made it possible to use louder and thicker chords with a variety of touch and colors, as in the A-flat major Impromptu of D. 935. Here we see *f* and *ff* chords with accents, sometimes articulated with staccatos and slurs.<sup>89</sup> Schubert uses a full six-voice *ff* chord in the climax of the outer section (see Ex. 16). Along with the singing and lyrical piano writing style, the powerful chords become an idiomatic expressive device in Schubert's piano music.

Example 16. Schubert, Impromptu in A-flat major, D. 935 no. 2, mm. 17–25

Another typical piano texture in Schubert's music is scrambled scales. He enjoyed mixing bits of various diatonic scales and of the chromatic scale together, as we find in the final Impromptu of D. 935, mm. 95–120 (see Ex. 14).<sup>90</sup> Instead of giving attention to lyrical melody, Schubert explores colors by mixing various scales. This kind of passage is absolutely not suitable for the voice. Furthermore the changes of color and clarity of the texture are not satisfying when played on string instruments.

<sup>89</sup> Ham, "Franz Schubert's Impromptus" 20.

<sup>90</sup> Wolff, *Masters of the Keyboard*, 164.

The conclusion of this final Impromptu is also highly pianistic. The dramatic and astonishing six-octave descending F-minor scale exploits the expanded range of the new piano (see Ex. 17).

Example 17. Schubert, Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 4, mm. 518–25

The image shows a musical score for Schubert's Impromptu in F minor, D. 935 no. 4, measures 518-25. The score is written for piano and consists of two staves: a treble clef staff and a bass clef staff. The key signature is F minor (three flats). The time signature is 3/4. The score begins at measure 518. The right hand (treble clef) starts with a sixteenth-note triplet (marked '3') and a sixteenth-note quartet (marked '4'). A dotted line above the first few notes indicates an octave range of 8. The right hand continues with a descending six-octave scale. The left hand (bass clef) provides harmonic support with chords and a descending scale. The piece concludes with a final chord and a fermata. The score is marked 'm.s.' at the end.

Schubert's music could be made more dramatic and expressive by making a careful contrast between these textures. For both listeners and performers, the study and analysis of the song, chamber music, and pure piano texture in Schubert's piano music will add more dimensions to the music and make their inner ear imagine the various piano sounds.

## CONCLUSION

Schubert's music contains both traditional and forward-looking styles, the formality of his Classical predecessors and the freedom of spontaneous improvisation.<sup>91</sup> If the song and dance came spontaneously and effortlessly from his nature, the formal writing was born of his deliberation and suffering. Given the increased importance of individuality in music since Beethoven, Schubert had to find his own way to make his music more appealing. Since he was not a genius in inventing forms, he instead modified the existing forms for his own musical needs and artistic goals, making them special by adding his individual lyricism.

Sometimes the compact Classical form had to undergo considerable expansion to make enough space to express Schubert's emotional range. He trusted the directness of his emotions so much that his music sometimes seems to consist of series of episodes, as Adorno pointed out.<sup>92</sup> But unlike Adorno's statement that Schubert music is a random arrangement of themes without inner connection or development, resembling a potpourri, the series of episodes communicates with one another.

The Impromptu, D. 935 are hard to fit into preexisting standard, as Schubert's nature and the title *Impromptus* suggest. The subtle interconnections between and within each Impromptu show that this set was not just born of Schubert's spontaneous nature. His use of form and modification of Classical formal models in D. 935 proves that he was aware of the Classical sense of coherence.

---

<sup>91</sup> Gordon, *History of Keyboard Literature*, 214.

<sup>92</sup> Brendel, *Alfred Brendel on Music*, 54.

To express his emotions, he employed various musical topics and textures, offering contrast and diversity. And as a rhetorical device, they sometimes create drama.

Schubert was not a virtuoso pianist or conductor like his well-known predecessors or contemporaries. Being more introverted than the others, he was not interested in bravura.<sup>93</sup> Expressing own innermost thoughts and feelings was his primary focus, which is why his music sounds so subjective and distinctive. When Schubert tries to tell his thoughts and feelings through music, he makes his story more interesting and convincing with musical coherence and diversity. Although his music does not have the structural of Beethoven's music or the clarity of Mozart's, there is a special intimacy and a sublime beauty in Schubert's music.

---

<sup>93</sup> Schiff, "Schubert's Piano Sonatas," 192.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Badura-Skoda, Eva. "The Piano Works of Schubert." In *Nineteenth-Century Piano Music*, 2nd ed., edited by Larry Todd, 97–146. London: Routledge, 2004.
- , and Peter Branscombe, ed. *Schubert Studies: Problems of Style and Chronology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982.
- Brendel, Alfred. *Alfred Brendel on Music*. Chicago: A Cappella Books, 2007.
- Brown, Maurice J. E. *Essays on Schubert*. New York: Macmillan Press, 1966. Reprint, New York: Da Capo Press, 1978.
- . *The New Grove Schubert*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1983.
- . *Schubert: A Critical Biography*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1958.
- . *Schubert's Variations*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1954.
- Burnham, Scott. "Schubert and the Sound of Memory." *Musical Quarterly* 84 (winter 2000): 655–63.
- Chusid, Martin. "Cyclicism in Schubert's Piano Sonata in A Major (D. 959)." *Piano Quarterly* 104 (winter 1978–79): 38–40.
- Cone, Edward T. "The Pianist as Critic." In *The Practice of Performance: Studies in Musical Interpretation*, edited by John Rink, 241–53. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- . "Schubert's Beethoven." *Musical Quarterly* 56 (1970): 779–93.
- . "Schubert's Promissory Note: An Exercise in Musical Hermeneutics." In *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, edited by Walter Frisch, 13–30. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1986.
- Dale, Kathleen. "The Piano Music." In *The Music of Schubert*, ed. Gerald Abraham, 111–48. New York: W. W. Norton, 1947.
- Daverio, John. "One More Beautiful Memory of Schubert: Schumann's Critique of the Impromptus, D. 935." *Musical Quarterly* 84 (winter 2000): 604–18.
- Deutsch, Otto Erich, ed. *Schubert: A Documentary Biography*. Translated by Eric Blom. London: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1946.

- . *Schubert: Memoirs by His Friends*. Translated by Rosamond Ley and John Nowell. London: Adam & Charles Black, 1958.
- . *The Schubert Reader: A Life of Franz Schubert in Letters and Documents*. Translated by Eric Blom. New York: W. W. Norton, 1947.
- Einstein, Alfred. *Schubert: A Musical Portrait*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1951.
- Fisk, Charles. *Returning Cycles: Contexts for the Interpretation of Schubert's Impromptus and Last Sonatas*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001.
- Gal, Hans. *Franz Schubert and the Essence of Melody*. Translated by Hans Gal. London: Victor Gollancz, 1974.
- Gillespie, John. *Five Centuries of Keyboard Music: An Historical Survey of Music for Harpsichord and Piano*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth, 1965. Reprint, New York: Dover, 1972.
- Gordon, Stewart. *A History of Keyboard Literature: Music for the Piano and its Forerunners*. New York: Schirmer Books, 1996.
- Gray, Walter. "The Classical Nature of Schubert's Lieder." *Musical Quarterly* 57, no.1 (January 1971): 62–72.
- Ham, Ina. "Franz Schubert's Impromptus D. 899 and D. 935: An Historical and Stylistic Study." DMA document, University of Cincinnati, 2005.
- Hatten, Robert. "Schubert the Progressive: The Role of Resonance and Gestures in the Piano Sonata in A, D. 959." *Intégral* 7 (1993): 38–81.
- Hilmar, Ernst. *Franz Schubert in his Time*. Translated by Reinhard G. Pauly. Portland, OR: Amadeus Press, 1988.
- Howat, Roy. "Architecture as Drama in Late Schubert." In *Schubert Studies*, edited by Brian Newbould, 166–90. Brookfield, VT: Ashgate, 1998.
- Kinderman, William. "Schubert's Piano Music: Probing the Human Condition." In *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, edited by Christopher H. Gibbs, 155–73. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Kirby, F. E. *Music for Piano: A Short History*. With a foreword by Maurice Hinson. Portland, OR: Amadeus Press, 1995.
- Laciar, Samuel L. "The Chamber-Music of Franz Schubert." *Musical Quarterly* 14, no.4 (October 1928): 515–38.

- McClary, Susan. "The Impromptu That Trod on a Loaf: Or, How Music Tells Stories." *Narrative* 5 (January 1997): 20–35.
- McKay, Elizabeth Norman. *Franz Schubert: A Biography*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.
- . *The Impact of the New Pianofortes on Classical Keyboard Style: Mozart, Beethoven and Schubert*. Stourbridge, West Midlands: Lynwood Music, 1987.
- . *The Piano and Dark Keys*. Tutzing: Schneider, 2009.
- Muxfeldt, Kristina. "Schubert Song Studies." PhD diss., State University of New York at Stony Brook, 1991.
- Newbould, Brian. *Schubert: The Music and the Man*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997.
- Porter, Ernest G. *Schubert's Piano Works*. Edited by Percy M. Young. London: Dennis Dobson, 1980.
- Pritchard, T. C. L. "The Schubert Idiom." In *The Music of Schubert*, edited by Gerald Abraham, 234–53. New York: W. W. Norton, 1947.
- Radcliffe, Philip. *Schubert Piano Sonatas*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1971.
- Ratner, Leonard G. *Classic Music: Expression, Form and Style*. New York: Schirmer Books, 1980.
- Reed, John. *Schubert*. The Master Musicians Series, edited by Stanley Sadie. New York: Simon & Schuster Macmillan, 1997.
- . *Schubert: The Final Years*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1972.
- Robertson, Alec. "The Songs." In *The Music of Schubert*, edited by Gerald Abraham, 149–97. New York: W. W. Norton, 1947.
- Rosen, Charles. *The Classical Style: Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven*. Expanded ed. New York: W. W. Norton, 1997.
- . "Schubert's Inflections of Classical Form." In *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, edited by Christopher H. Gibbs, 72–98. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Samaroff, Olga. "The Piano Music of Schubert." *Musical Quarterly* 14, no.4 (October 1928): 596–609.

- Schiff, András. "Schubert's Piano Sonatas: Thoughts about Interpretation and Performance." In *Schubert Studies*, edited by Brian Newbould, 191–208. Brookfield, VT: Ashgate, 1998.
- Schubert, Franz. *Franz Schubert's Letters and Other Writings*. Edited by Otto Erich Deutsch. Translated by Venetia Savile. With a foreword by Ernest Newman. London: Faber & Faber, 1928. Reprint, Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1970.
- . *Impromptus*. Munich: G. Henle, 1974. Score.
- . *6 Grand Marches, D. 819*. Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1888. Score.
- Schumann, Robert. *On Music and Musicians*. Edited by Konrad Wolff. Translated by Paul Rosenfeld. New York: Pantheon, 1946.
- Wolff, Konrad. *Masters of the Keyboard: Individual Style Elements in the Piano Music of Bach, Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert, Chopin, and Brahms*. Enlarged ed. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1990.