

regards traditional song as if flourishes or languishes under these conditions (although Munch has not fully explained why the Tristan islanders never developed indigenous songs, nor why the old song tradition seemed to become so fragile so suddenly).

The Song Tradition of Tristan de Cunha is a solid addition to the Indiana University folklore publications series (and, incidentally, is the most visually pleasing typographically and in cover design of that series to date).

Folksongs and Their Makers, by Henry Glassie, Edward D. Ives, and John F. Szwed.

ix+ 253 pp. Introduction.

Bowling Green, Ohio: Bowling Green University Popular Press, n.d. \$3.00 paper, \$5.00 cloth.

Reviewed by Elliott Oring

The twentieth-century physicist Von Pauli has stated, "I can choose to observe one experimental set-up, A, and ruin B, or choose to observe B and ruin A. I cannot choose not to ruin one of them." Folksong scholarship has been plagued by a somewhat similar predicament: "The closer a folk poet is to us in time, the more we can find out about him and the events he wrote about, but the further back we go the better chance we have to see what ballads get accepted into tradition and what changes the tradition may work on them" (74). For good historical reasons folksong scholarship has opted for the second experimental situation, the study of song in tradition. Indeed, in this approach, the definition of folksong is dependent upon its traditionality, while other songs are labeled literary, sub-literary, doggerel, fakesong and spurious. Consequently, the creation of true folksong, obliterated by the mists of ages past, was a matter for speculation and conjecture. The assumption of a radical difference between intellectual and folk poetry gave rise to such explanatory concepts as das Volk dichtet in an effort to denote the fundamentally different origins of the poetry of life and the poetry of art.

The contributors to Folksongs and Their Makers have opted for the first experimental situation, the song and its creator. By carefully observing and analyzing the innovation, crystallization and formalization of an individual song, they hope to uncover the processes generally at work in the creation of Anglo-American folksong. They have abandoned a concern for corpses, canons, and closed accounts in an effort to understand song as an individual expression in community. Despite the fundamental similarity of approach, each of the three essays in the volume emphasizes a different aspect of the problem.

Henry Glassie's essay, "'Take that Night Train to Selma': An Excursion to the Outskirts of Scholarship" is in reality a combination of two distinct, though related, component essays. The first of these might be called, "Take that Night Train to Selma" after a song created by Dorrance Weir. Glassie traces the development of the song over a period of several years from its inception as a three-stanza taunt of an Italian co-worker, to a full-length anti-Negro, humorous, poetic, musical

invective. The creation of the song is related to Dorrance's socio-economic (blue-collar), ideological (racially prejudiced), historical (civil rights movement) and musicological (traditional central New York and country recording) milieu, and its modification is explained in terms of creator and audience reaction to the artistic produce in differing performance contexts. Only the second component essay, which considers the role of the creator in the Euro-American community, may possibly be considered as "an excursion to the outskirts of scholarship." Glassie argues that in this cultural tradition the performer is to be distinguished from the creator. The performer is a repeater, not striving for innovation and change, but for stasis and the authority of the stable text. The creator, however, is antagonistic to this repetitive tradition and he is defined as breaking the repetitive norm in the creation of the recognizably new. As such, the creator, like his creation, is likely to be a deviant, and Glassie assembles evidence to suggest that song creation takes place when the creator is in some way marginal to the established social order. As a whole, Glassie's article emerges as an exciting and scholarly examination of folklore creation, a problem area that has stimulated little empirical, and even less reasonable, research in the past.

In John Szwed's "Paul E. Hall: A Newfoundland Song-Maker and His Community of Song," we find a brief portrait of one rural song maker and an attempt to explain the relevance of one of his creations to the approving community. Based upon the "mirror of culture" folklore theory as refined by Melville Jacobs, Szwed attempts to show that "The Bachelor Song" of Paulie Hall reflects social relationships in the community unsatisfactorily resolved by social structure or custom. The song is accepted because the bachelor, who is envied for his independence yet always regarded as a potential sexual threat to the community, sings of his sexual satisfaction outside the community at the very fringes of human society. This concise and neat study serves to remind us that the relevance of art in society is not merely dependent upon the content and structure of art, but the content and structure of society as well.

Edward Ives' article is an attempt to ignore the principle of complementary and study elements of experimental situations A and B. His study, "A Man and His Song: Joe Scott and 'The Plain Golden Band,'" attempts to reconstruct the biography of Joe Scott (1867-1918) and to investigate in detail how one of his many creations has fared in the song tradition of Maine and the Maritimes. The aesthetic, economic and social role of song making in Joe Scott's life is discussed, and the text of "The Plain Golden Band" related to his own personal experience.

But the unique aspect of Ives' study is that Joe Scott's songs have been widely accepted in regional tradition and have rapidly moved toward the anonymity that folklorists have always secretly regarded as being one of the basic characteristics of true folksong. It is thus exciting to see what has happened to Scott's version (as it exists on the broadsheets which he himself sold) in the fiery (tempering or incinerating) furnace of tradition. Ives' analysis of the song's transmission approaches the "delightful" (an adjective rarely used in connection with transmission scholarship). He combines lucid writing style with humor, humility and evident enthusiasm for his subject matter. His attention to detail is always justified, and its interpretation always sound (although it is unclear to me why the second stanza of the central section of Jack Scott's

version submitted to The Family Herald is the voice of the narrator rather than that of the jilted lover). Ives keeps the questions of diction, phrasing, order, logic, folk attitude, melody and the influence of print in the air all at once with the consummate control of a master juggler manipulating his balls (read: Indian clubs) in an effort to demonstrate the basic stability of the song in tradition after seventy years.

Folksongs and Their Makers is as fine as the obviously Henry Glassie sketch on the cover. It is only unfortunate that the Popular Press did not issue a small companion disc recording of the songs. Because they are complementary in emphasis, the three essays cohere as a volume rather than as an anthology, a volume relevant to all folklorists, regardless of their specific areas of interest and demanding perusal by both students and scholars.

BOOK NOTES

Bibliography of Latin American Folklore: Tales, Myths, Festivals, Customs, Arts, Music, Magic, by Ralph Steele Boggs.

109 pp., index, annotations.

Published originally by New York: The H. W. Wilson Co. (1940) (Inter-American Bibliography and Library Assoc. Publication I, 5); reprinted by Detroit: Blaine-Ethridge-- Books, 1971. \$6.00.

Three Dollars a Year: Being the Story of San Pablo Cuatro Venados, A Typical Zapotecan Indian Village, by Russell G. Steininger and Paul Van de Velde, 121 pp., 16 photographic plates, appendices, index.

Reprinted by Blaine-Ethridge -- Books, New York, 1971. \$6.50.

With this classic bibliography Boggs began a task that no one has attempted to complete. Although more complete bibliographies exist for the folklore of certain countries or for specific genres in Latin America, this work remains the largest general bibliography of folklore for that part of the New World. The bibliography is limited in scope for, as Boggs explains in his Foreword, he selected only 643 entries from some 8,000 entries in his personal file. Given that the work is thirty years out-of-date, incomplete in dealing with pre-1940 materials, and costs \$6.00, the normal research would be far wiser to search for it in his local library. At its original cost of \$1.50 it would be a much better buy.

Three Dollars a Year ..., billed as "An unsentimental but sympathetic examination of the realities ... of life in this isolated village" in the Blaine-Ethridge propaganda, could better be described as a sentimental but unsympathetic examination of the village. Although filled with the kind of myopia and ethnocentrism common in ethnographies of the 19th century which allow the Indian to be "content with poverty" the work is not without merit. The sixteen photographs are important documents for allowing us to see the physical type of the natives and their material culture from the 1930's. Appendix 5, titled "Dismal Figures," presents what appears to be the GVP (Gross Village Product) of San Pablo Cuatro Venados giving the resources, expenses and revenue and then showing the deficit. The book as a whole is of interest only to the antiquarian or the researcher of the history of social scientific investigation. The value of the work for the average social scientist is not commensurate to the rather inflated \$6.50 price tag which the reprint carries.